

The Institute  Retail Studies



UNIVERSITY OF  
STIRLING

## **The Retail Planning Knowledge Base Annual Update (2006 Publications)**

Anne Findlay and Leigh Sparks  
Institute for Retail Studies  
Faculty of Management  
University of Stirling  
STIRLING FK9 4LA, SCOTLAND  
Tel: (01786) 467384  
Fax: (01786) 465290  
E-mail: [Leigh.Sparks@stir.ac.uk](mailto:Leigh.Sparks@stir.ac.uk)  
[a.m.findlay@stir.ac.uk](mailto:a.m.findlay@stir.ac.uk)  
Website [www.irs.stir.ac.uk](http://www.irs.stir.ac.uk)

March 2007

## **CONTENTS**

### **Commentary**

#### **1. General Texts**

#### **2. Theoretical Work**

#### **3. Retail Formats**

#### **4. Retail Locations**

#### **5. Retail Planning Practice**

#### **6. Consumer Culture**

#### **7. Urban Environment**

#### **8. A Selection of Literature Relating to Retail Planning in USA and Europe**

#### **9. Practitioner Literature**

**COMMENTARY**

The commentary to the Retail Knowledge Bank update will as usual reflect the nature of the material published during the year. As such four areas have been identified to form the focus of the commentary.

- A shift in thinking about retail planning policy
- Sustainability and retailing
- The urban environment
- Retailing in European cities

### **A Shift in Thinking about Retail Planning Policy**

Cliff Guy's new text on retail planning '**Planning for Retail Development: a critical view of the British experience**' was published in late 2006 (1/5). Cliff Guy writes in the acknowledgements:

'This is a book I have wanted to write for several years. My reading of the endless streams of policy statements and commentaries on retail planning in Britain has suggested that policy is not as coherent or well founded on research evidence as some would like us to believe. It seems also that a tendency to 're-invent the wheel' shows that past successes and failures of policy are not as widely appreciated as they might be. This book attempts, firstly, to fill a gap in the retailing and planning literatures, by explaining the growth of policy instruments intended to direct development in what are seen as socially beneficial ways. Secondly, it attempts a critical appraisal of many of the core objectives and beliefs of policy makers, through examining evidence of the behaviour of retailers and consumers in Britain' (p.vi).

The review of retail planning in the book highlights the reactive nature of much policy making and the incremental nature of the ways in which new developments have been accommodated. Assessments of the impacts of policy have been measured in terms of the development impacts rather than in terms of social or economic impacts. The book reviews the ways in which key issues such as social exclusion have impacted on the

planning agenda but at the same time highlights the lack of attention to issues relating to shopping. The calls for more evidence based policy and also increased local flexibility have been echoed elsewhere in recent literature. The book presents a view of the 'hows' and 'whys' of retail planning policy under the PPG6 guidance. With the new PPS6 guidance in place the publication of the book would seem timely.

Events of 2006 may, however, mark a change of thinking about retail planning whether or not any actual policy changes ensue. The All Party Parliamentary Small Shops Group published a final report in February 2006 entitled '**High Street 2015**' (see **Annual Update 2005**). The report champions the role of local retailing in providing 'social glue' and calls for measures to encourage independent retailing. The background to this report was documented in last year's commentary but pressure for the All Party investigation came from organisations such as the Association of Convenience Stores and small shop lobby groups. The way that the issues have been taken up in the policy agenda during 2006 may seem to be at odds with the intentions of those eager to see small scale independent retailing on the policy agenda. The Barker Review (1/1) of planning and the progress of the Competition Commission (5/2-5/5) investigation into the grocery market both appear to be couching retail planning policy in an increasingly economic context, with limited mention of socially beneficial outcomes as recognised by Guy's book as a key aim of planning. All this comes as PPS6 has barely had a chance to get established and indeed the supporting publications from the DCLG have yet to be published. The new Scottish Policy guidance, SPP8, (Scottish Executive, 5/22) was only published during 2006. The Barker Report was commissioned by The Treasury rather than by the DCLG. John Gummer's column in Estates Gazette (**Estates Gazette**, 0650, 2006, p.35) delivers a fierce attack on the government's use of inquiries and commissions rather than the channels of government departments to review policy. These inevitably privilege certain points of view which may exclude other dimensions which would have been part of a specific government department's remit. Inquiries and commissions also tend to report to the Treasury, which gives them a certain directional bias. Equally the Competition Commission investigation represents trading conditions rather than planning conditions. Both, despite their non-planning backgrounds, however engage explicitly with retail planning issues.

Kate Barker's '**Barker review of land use planning: final report – recommendations**' was concerned with a wide range of planning issues of which retail planning was only one (1/1). Much of the report was concerned with the way planning is carried out. It challenges a number of fundamental planning principles. For example it moves towards a presumption in favour of development which many planners feel will lead to a return to planning by appeal (Wilson, 9/19). The pro-development stance is not welcomed by planners who fear it would lead to increased out of town shopping investment and the undermining of town centre investment. Planners are also unhappy about some of the comments which indicate that perhaps developers could provide financial incentives to make their projects more attractive to communities (Callaghan, 9/4). More specifically relating to retailing the report questions the requirement for the 'need test'.

In the Executive summary Barker's recommendations are summed up as follows:

'Planners should not be attempting to determine if there is sufficient 'need' for a given application – rather the applicant, who is bearing the risk, should be responsible for assessing that likely demand is sufficient to make the development viable. This has implications for the 'town centre first' policy priority. There are a number of means by whereby this goal is promoted including the sequential test and the impact tests of Planning Policy Statement 6. These should be retained. But the requirement for applicants to demonstrate need should be removed, and can be done without harm to the overall policy. In addition, where there are concerns about potential consumer detriment caused by restricted competition in local retail markets, should the Competition Commission conclude that there is evidence of anti-competitive conduct, the Government will also need to play a role in encouraging new entrants to a market where a new site becomes available.' (p.7)

It is suggested that indeed the need test may also be anti-competitive as incumbents have an advantageous position. In addition to the advice to remove the need test the report states that:

‘Under the sequential test, more accessible sites may be less economic to develop and the requirement that applicants be flexible in their business model may raise business costs. An overly prescriptive approach to the sequential test could therefore raise barriers to entry and limit scale economies. Similarly, there is the potential to reform impact tests with local authorities focusing on broad strategy rather than detailed but potentially inaccurate forecasting’ (p.28).

Again the economic emphasis is clear. Many planners will see these statements as significantly undermining the robustness they sought to achieve in the reformulation of policy guidance in the new PPS6.

Other statements in the Barker Report include the idea that where there are three or fewer supermarket incumbents local authorities should presume against an incumbent and that market share could be a better measure than a need test for the grocery sector. The intention would be to promote choice. Reference is also made to the efficiencies of the sector. These inferences do confirm a shift in thinking. From a planner’s perspective even more controversial is the idea that alternatively some form of competition assessment could be developed outside the planning system. (p.31). Given the timing in the current political term it is unlikely that the proposals will be enacted and indeed much subtler amendments to policy would be more likely. However the publication of the report is agenda setting and does challenge the existing thinking and focus minds on the purpose of planning and intervention. This could be reflected in the way that retail development is viewed in future especially in view of some of the statements emerging from the ongoing Competition Commission review.

Stuart Hampson (John Lewis Partnership chairman) commented at a recent conference that whilst planning needs regulation to bring out a creative approach the industry will always exploit chinks in policy. Would abandoning the need test make too big a chink? The Scottish policy guidance published in 2006 (Scottish Executive, 5/22) takes an intermediate position. Quantitative and qualitative need may both be considered. This followed the recommendations of the policy review document which recognised that qualitative factors might be as important as quantitative and also that

deficiency and need were different. It also took a different approach on the sequential test recognising existing out of town centres as more suitable than new out of town sites. It therefore has greater flexibility whilst maintaining a strong town centre and plan-led focus but the potentially quantitative straitjacket of the need test in Scotland is much reduced by its broader focus. Guy has noted the particular position of the need test in the Welsh guidance. Tinkering with existing policy always threatens its credibility and consistency and so PPS6 faces an important test ahead.

The Competition Commission report '**Emerging Thinking**' (5/5) which gives the current position of the investigation's findings as of January 2007 states in the 'Summary of current thinking' section:

'Our preliminary thinking in relation to the relevant product market(s) for the retail supply of groceries is that we consider larger grocery outlets to be an effective substitute for smaller grocery outlets, and as a result these larger stores constrain the prices, and other non-price competitive variables, such as product quality, product range and service (together the 'retail offer') of smaller stores. However we do not currently view smaller outlets as providing a similarly effective substitute for larger outlets. Further, it is not clear that consumers view the retail offers of different grocery retailers of the same size as equally substitutable' (p. 5).

The report also notes:

'Commercial success should not be penalized unless there is clear evidence of abuse of market power and harm to consumers.....we will wish to consider whether, taking account of likely future trends the grocery market is sufficiently competitive to prevent any one grocery retailer's pre-eminent position, however acquired, becoming entrenched and incontestable by others' (p.11).

Attention has now switched to the local level:

‘We need to see what choices shoppers have in particular areas and how competition works between retailers of different sizes’ (Competition Commission News Release 23<sup>rd</sup> January 2007).

More detailed analysis of the key topics has been presented in a series of working papers (these are also available online although some sections have been excluded for confidentiality reasons). The working papers cover the different questions being considered. Two are of particular relevance to planning issues: **‘Working paper on land holdings and use issues’** (5/3) and **‘Working paper on planning issues’** (5/4).

The paper on land holdings sets out the measures which have been used to work out the level and importance of land holdings by the major food retailers. These data are then used in order to assess whether retailers can significantly increase their market share on the basis of developing the sites they already own. Although accusations had been made against the industry that major players were able to achieve significant increases in market share in this way, the findings do not support these levels of increased market share. A second theme was whether land holdings could be used to prevent other retailers from developing further sites. For the most part sites seemed to be developed relatively fast following assembly. Whether locally land holding could be inhibiting competition requires shifting the study from the national to local level on which the commission is currently embarked.

The working paper on planning issues uses data from a survey of local authorities on key planning issues and discussion with major retailers to understand how retail planning works from the perspectives of both planner and developer. Only one year into the new PPS6 these views are probably a greater reflection of PPG6 than PPS6. It begins from the premise that it is not the purpose of the planning system to influence or promote competition. A key question raised is whether the existing policy inhibits new entry. This can be regarded as an important issue in relation to competitiveness in the sector. The need test can make it harder for new entrants to get planning permission for what might be viewed as competitive stores. Whilst PPS6 does not require a need test for development in town centre locations its use for applications for edge of centre or out of centre sites could mean that supermarkets would not be granted permission for stores which come into competition with existing out of town

or edge of centre supermarkets. The incumbent is therefore in a strong competitive position. The paper asks whether the need test is integral to PPS6 and whether impact studies would be sufficient control on development. It also asks whether the need test restricts development more than is required to maintain town centre vitality and viability. Incumbents can always apply to extend existing stores and a small increment in provision may prove a more attractive way from a planning perspective of providing for perceived need deficit. Findings on the relationship between the application of the need test and store size proved inconclusive. Other issues such as whether the planning system could be used to gain competitive advantage through for example Section 106 agreements, objections to applications or competing applications were evaluated but neither councils nor retailers considered this to be the case. Accusations by lobby groups have been made that developers use 'strong arm tactics' with local councils but this was not substantiated from the evidence.

In terms of conclusions the report suggests that 'the presence of a formal need test may not be decisive' (p.15). With respect to the sequential approach whether this is a barrier to entry seems to be very much a function of how the product market is defined and the size categories used. The Commission is committed to further investigation of this (p.13). It was suggested that compliance with PPG6 and PPS6 stimulates innovative behaviour. Tesco would describe itself as working with the 'grain' of retail planning policy. Asda has been more determined than some of its rivals to stick with its preferred format and has proven less willing to adapt to changes in policy, a view it expressed to the Commission (p.13). Whether the need test could be abandoned in just the grocery sector is debatable but arguably this would be less of a threat to the town centres first policy even accounting for supermarket diversification of product range into the non-food sector.

Those who imagined that the Competition Commission might find ways of restricting supermarket growth as a result of these various investigations and reviews may be worrying that so far the Competition Commission has not mentioned competition between small shops and supermarkets in relation to planning.. The thinking of the Competition Commission is not so much about competition between smaller and larger players but more between the larger players themselves and whether over-dominance of one larger player or barriers to entry to comparable competitors are

impeding competition. The lobbyists for small shops will be finding it hard to understand how some of the existing controls might yet be dropped. Even the suggestion that the need test might be abandoned may reduce the role it plays in future. From the perspective of proponents of the independent sector the need test was particularly important (as impact studies are often at a more macro-scale) but from a Competition Commission perspective it is not the responsibility of the Commission to ensure that less economic forms of business are protected.

There are a number of articles in the listing for 2006 which contribute to the debate. Burt and Sparks in their study of Wal-Mart in the UK discuss how Asda has responded to the planning environment (3/1). This differs from the responses to the other major food retailers as it has mainly continued to struggle against the system rather than conform to it through new innovative responses. For Wal-Mart to expand its market share in the UK it would like to see planning policy change (**Planning**, 15/12/07, p.4). The article by Poole et al. (3/9) examines differences in the distribution of large food retailers in different European countries assessing which areas are saturated and where in the market there remain spaces for expansion. The paper is therefore predicated on the idea that saturation (which could be equated to need, although it is not explicitly expressed in this way) can exist but at the same time the study takes little account of the demand for consumer choice (be it product range, format or operator based) nor the distances that people have to travel in different parts of the country. The in town out of town debate is picked up in one of the British Council for Shopping Centres research reports published in a major review of the sector in 2006 by the organisation (4/3). Key points are that any sense that town centre policy might be relaxed would immediately reduce confidence in town centre investment. Edge of centre sites are likely to be particularly attractive meantime to those seeking larger spaces (Bach and Thurstain-Goodwin, 4/3). Quin (5/21) takes up this point confirming that that in the opinion of the Association of Town Centre Management the removal of the need test would stop the pipeline of town centre investment. Jackson (7/9) has looked at town centre investment from an institutional sector investment point of view and underlines the need for these centres to be attractive propositions if they are to continue attracting this type of investment. Guy (5/12) has also argued that there are other initiatives open to planners to encourage small shops and that there are ways in which these could be further strengthened and

Jones et al. also consider that viable business options not a continuation of the past are the only route open to small independent retailers. The Competition Commission is unlikely to be the forum through which this is achieved (Guy, 5/12).

Kervenoael et al. (5/16) carried out a study of food retail choice which calls for a more regionally based policy as a one size fits all point of view will not deliver appropriate services, a conclusion which chimes with the current focus of the Competition Commission. The concept of greater freedom for local authorities was also one of the improvements suggested by Cliff Guy in the conclusion to his book (p.251). Lock (5/18) highlights anomalies in retail planning guidance. He notes the anomaly of the first come first served basis on which decisions are made. Again this is a topic which concerns the Competition Commission in its search to establish barriers to new entry. He suggests competition could be a material consideration. He also goes on to highlight the problem of the obsession with the existing configuration of town centres. This topic has been touched on in previous years as regional shopping centres have tried to gain recognition as town centres. Quin (5/20), representing the Association of Town Centre Management argues that *de facto* town centres should indeed become *de jure* town centres. In 2006 two new town centres agreed but only after very considerable wrangling and in one case a House of Lords appeal. Both Ravenscraig and Merry Hill have gained town centres status (9/16, 9/11). The options for Brent Cross are currently being discussed ((9/14). Out of town retailing has also been the subject of some study with suggestions that changes in the use of retail parks is going on and that this in itself is not covered by policy but can impact on high streets (Thomas et al., 4/11)). Equally it has been argued that out of town sites offer opportunities to upgrade the retail environment in areas where other investment would not be forthcoming (Guy, 4/5).

Business in the Community has been looking specifically at the opportunities offered by under-served markets. This was the subject of a National Retail Planning Forum event at which planners, researchers and retailers came together to look at how under-served communities should be regarded and the challenge they present (Dunford, 5/7, Guy, 5/10). The event did underline the difficulties of achieving certain types of change within current planning policy. A good practice guide is being prepared to highlight the ways that retail-led investment might be used to maximise local benefits.

One of the most interesting statements in the working paper is that finding that a new supermarket's greatest benefit was not to the local customers but rather to the local business environment and the confidence it inspired for local business giving regeneration an impetus (Competition Commission 5/5, re employment see also Greater London Authority 5/9). The increasingly economic focus of retail led development as a challenge to planning policy can be seen.

Several researchers have engaged with issues of how policy is changed and influenced. Wood et al. (5/24) in reviewing the ministerial statements and retailer responses show how retailers will use loopholes in policy but reflect on how in many ways the existence of policy itself stimulates innovativeness. Guy (5/11) continues the themes from the section of his book which explores how policy is formulated (p.239-240) to study how agreement over PPS6 was achieved. It shows how opposing views were reconciled. It is concluded that lobbyists by both industry and pressure groups did not substantially impact on policy (see also Jones et al., 5/15). This would resonate with lobbyists who may interpret the current policy debate as having been reoriented towards an increasingly development oriented perspective when they had been looking for greater regulation. Guy also shows how responses to the draft version of PPS6 seemed to make little difference to the final version of the policy. This contrasts with the Scottish experience where a number of significant changes were introduced following the draft consultation period (Findlay and Sparks, 5/8, Hargest, 5/13).

It would seem that the prevailing polity has become increasingly business oriented but not as a result of the pressures from the business community itself. In retail planning this will challenge PPS6 not because it will be changed but because the context in which it will be operating is changing. Initial responses suggest that planners are not happy with the change of direction. It will undoubtedly mean some more creative and innovative thinking on their part to maintain their town centre priorities whilst presenting a more economically driven plan-led approach to retail development.

## **Sustainability and Retailing**

Sustainability, carbon footprints, congestion and greener living are buzz words which are very much on the political agenda. All retailers are keen to show their green credentials. A study of corporate social responsibility and green issues by Jones et al. (6/3) for the supermarket sector concludes that their response matches the behaviour rather than the rhetoric of consumers.

Shopping is a topic which retail planning policy has paid scant attention to (Guy). Many assumptions about consumer preferences have been found to be wrong (e.g. Accent Scotland and Mauthner, 4/1). It is ironic therefore that the green agenda demands an understanding of shoppers through the need to know about shopping and travel. Two key reports are cited for 2006: Commission for Integrated Transport **‘Sustainable transport choices and the retail sector’** (7/2) and RAC Foundation and British Retail Consortium **‘Shopping and transport policy’** (7/15). The commission for Integrated Transport Report begins from the premise that out of town retailing increases car usage. It goes on to confirm this assumption by showing that more trips to such centres are made by car than to town centres but it takes no account of the distance travelled from home to the shopping centre. It finds associations between car usage and types of goods purchased with the car being used for large bulky household items. Food retailing is not the focus of this report. The samples taken were all from urban environments and no account was taken of rural or market town situations. As such it would be easy for the conclusions to be taken as of wider applicability than the research base would justify. It reached various conclusions about the nature of travel for shopping with general support for the feasibility of increased use of public transport and some suggestions were made along these lines (e.g. locating bus stops near shops). The RAC/BRC report takes a very different view. Drawing on the experience of a wide range of experts from a range of backgrounds the report suggests a greater realism is needed in evaluating shopping and retailing. It emphasises the need for some consideration of links between residential and shopping areas to be considered. Shopping is viewed as a legitimate and necessary activity and the needs of shoppers must be better understood before inappropriate policies are introduced.

Linked to the sustainability debate has been the issue of food miles and hence the importance of local foods (Jones et al., 7/10). Several articles study the way that local foods enter the food chain and the different ways in which they are retailed (Ilbery et al., 3/5, 3/6, Hein et al., 3/4, Maye et al., 3/7) Research identifies a much more complex system than is often assumed. The direct producer retailer link often assumed to characterise local food production is not the only way in which local food reaches the consumer. A range of types of retail outlets are involved, both independent and multiple. The results challenge those who think that small retailers are a prerequisite for the success of local food (Caroline Cranbrook, 3/2).

It would seem clear that to some extent the published work in this area has not yet really caught up with the broader issues in the subject area. Sustainability issues and climate change have risen considerably up the political agenda in 2006 and in 2007 to date and retailing and retail planning seem not yet to have caught up.

## **The Urban Environment**

Literature on BIDs has moved into the academic literature in new ways. The emphasis is not on how the system works but on how it relates to concepts of the public realm, town governance and the making of places. These debates are important as they impact on the permeability of urban spaces and also on the extent to which highly differentiated urban spaces can emerge. Whilst the paper by Minton (7/13) sees BIDs as a threat to the social functioning of city centres and the creation of greater sameness others such as Ward (7/16) consider it is a logical extension of neo-liberal planning policy and indeed it is in line with thinking in for example the thinking behind the Barker Report. The parallel ways in which the debates are occurring reflect very much the emergence of economic rather than social aspects of planning and may be part of the shift in thinking about urban spaces and planning. Urban design in terms of street spaces and the relationships between buildings and quarters of the town has not been strong in the UK. Fragmentation of urban space will therefore further militate against integrated town centres and cityscapes. Guy (7/8) considers that indeed BIDs on a US model could significantly threaten town centre vitality because such a model takes no account of the users of the street.

Oppewal et al. (6/6) looked at how shopping centres were engaged in corporate social responsibility but the results suggested that local initiatives and community involvement by shopping centres had only a limited impact on shoppers. Local issues championed by shopping centres did not command the level of support anticipated in most cases suggesting that these privatised spaces are perceived as 'other' rather than part of the local community. Verdict's study (part of the British Council of Shopping Centres research, 6/7) of changing segmentation and attitudes to shopping uses a range of terms such as wellness, post-materialism, limelight syndrome and categories such as mend and make do to stimulate thought about future attitudes to retailing. They conclude that all places can no longer be all things to all people and emphasise the challenge that matching shopper expectations and the nature of places will pose.

Several papers consider the role of markets in the retail and urban environment. These represent par excellence the non-privatised public participation in the public realm.

Staehele and Mitchell show how community and public are different in terms of retail space. Because many markets were built a long time ago they occupy peripheral locations or have poor fabric. In both cases they are in need of rethinking (Jones et al., 4/7, Association of Town Centre Management 4/2). However councils have often had plans which do not necessarily fit with the ideas of either market stall holders or the people who use and frequent markets (Rubin et al., 4/9). The spaces these occupy are seen very differently from those of shopping centres and indeed the privatised sanitised spaces of shopping centres have in part stimulated the desire for these very different types of spaces.

## **Retailing in European Cities**

The Greater London Authority has published a series of papers included in the list (1/2-1/4, 3/3, 5/9). Several of these papers draw on UK trends and consider how these apply in a London context rather than being a study of the London retail sector itself but there are also new insights into the retail structure of the city and the ways in which this is understood. In this year's listing there is a substantial European element. This is of particular interest because of it demonstrates the very different way in which the Europeans think about retail space and spaces within the urban area. There is not the same dichotomisation between town centres and other retailing which is the legacy of UK retail planning policy. In an increasingly internationally competitive market the European perspective becomes of greater importance because of the opportunities it offers UK retailers for investment but also because of what European retailers might expect in a UK investment context.

Two journal issues are cited in the listing, one is an issue of *Built Environment* and the other an issue of *BelGeo* (8/2) (articles are available direct from authors). The *Built Environment* articles address the role of neighbourhoods and several focus on the type of retailing which is appropriate or contributes to better more integrated neighbourhoods (e.g. Nystrom and Lundstrom, 8/5). The implicit assumption is that shopping can be an integrative process but it is understood that the way that this may have worked in the past is no longer appropriate and that new models of neighbourhood retailing are required (cf. Wells and Watson, 3/10). Examples from East and West Germany show that the legacy of the two planning policies has been two very different sets of neighbourhood centres (Eckhardt, 8/5).

The special issue of *BelGeo* is concerned with retailing in the urban structure of European towns. Towns are envisaged as being a grouping of different types of retail space. The concept of complementarity and the levels at which specialisation might take place and how this fits into the urban structure are important issues. The concept offers the chance to redress the emphasis on clone towns and its oversimplification of the cloning debate through a lack of focus on secondary retail spaces. The wealth of detailed data which is presented would be the envy of many a UK retail planner. It is often true that data availability determines what research is carried out and which

topics receive the greatest study. The lack of data on secondary shopping undoubtedly prejudices research and policy in this area in the UK but the focus of retail planning policy also reinforces this emphasis. In this respect the Greater London Authority (1/2-1/4) study offers a beginning to thinking about wider issues. However the definition of town centres has required too narrow a view of retailing in the UK. The understandings from the European papers illustrate well the importance of a wider research focus. The paper by Carreras on Barcelona (8/2) explores the concept of developing a post modern retail perspective in the city whilst Hatz (8/2) develops the concept of complementarity through specialised retailer distribution and specialist retail zones in the city of Vienna.

## **The Agenda for 2007**

In many ways the research and business agendas have been set by the inquiries which have either been undertaken or remain underway.

The Competition Commission report on the grocery market will be awaited with much anticipation and potentially has significant things to say about the planning system and retailing generally. There again it may be a damp squib and the views of the next occupant of Number 10 may be more important in structuring the way forward.

The government's responses to the Barker Review are now emerging. Ruth Kelly, in a presentation to the Royal Town Planning Institute in February 2007, emphasised a commitment to delivering places where people want to live. The more general policy context will be very important in determining attitudes to development, flexibility and consistency for developers, stakeholders and planners. The reality of tensions between planners, retailers and consumer agendas are all too easily ignored in such general statements of intent. Kelly provided no immediate endorsement of the Barker Review recommendation to abandon the needs test. Rather she said: 'We want to work with the industry and our stakeholders to develop the best and most robust methodology for assessing the impact of new development proposals on our town centres'. Whilst she will be looking closely at the Barker Review proposals, she does not want to see a return to the free for all of the 1980s. Whether this is what Barker really means, or whether this is a broader shot across some bows, remains to be worked out.

This year's bibliography and commentary highlight many interesting research topics, some of which challenge existing ways of thinking about retail planning. They in many ways demand new evidence based research. There is thus an urgent requirement to consider the robustness of methodologies to assess impacts of new developments. This is an area in which the National Retail Planning Forum is already engaged.

**RETAIL PLANNING KNOWLEDGE BASE UPDATE 2007**  
**(Material published during 2006)**

## 1. GENERAL TEXTS

1/1

Barker, K.

**Barker review of land use planning: final report - recommendations,**

Norwich: HMSO, 2006, 226p. (Available online from

[www.barkerreviewofplanning.org.uk](http://www.barkerreviewofplanning.org.uk) )

The Barker report represents the way that government policy considers the role of planning policy. There is a much stronger emphasis on the economic aspects of planning than formerly. The document considers a wide range of administrative aspects of planning but also the thrust of planning policy with chapters on the responsiveness of the system, delivering major projects, streamlining the system and improving the performance of local authorities. The policy makes a number of specific references to retail policy. Specifically the report states that the need test is not required (p36) and it discusses this within a context of competitiveness of the sector and the vitality and viability of town centres.

Barker Review, Need, PPS6

1/2

Greater London Authority

**Retail in London: London's retail trends 1971-2000,**

London: Greater London Authority, 2006, 64p. (Working Paper H) 185261854X

(Available online at [www.london.gov.uk](http://www.london.gov.uk))

This paper uses the statistics collected in the Office of the Deputy Prime Minister Town Centre Statistic initiative. It considers retailing by sector and also by location within London.

London

1/3

Greater London Authority

**Retail in London,**

London: Greater London Authority, 2006, 54p. 101852619155 (Available online at

[www.london.gov.uk](http://www.london.gov.uk))

Four sections provide a study of retailing in London: the importance of retail to London, London's retail offer, changing trends in retail, the future of retail in London. It provides a summary of the project to understand retailing in London highlighting the key findings from the individual working papers. Particular topics such as the role of retail-led regeneration are an important part of the document. The section on the future of retailing contextualises the issues in London within the planning framework.

London

1/4

Greater London Authority

**Retail in London: Retail and leisure,**

London: Greater London Authority, 2006, 32p. (Working Paper D) 1852618256

(Available online at [www.london.gov.uk](http://www.london.gov.uk))

This paper explores the links between retailing and leisure in the context of London. Spending on leisure in London has increased significantly. Ambient, magnet and heritage destination leisure/retail activities are discussed. Of these only ambient leisure is oriented towards retailing although the others may have spill over effects. Increased ambient leisure facilities in retail areas are thus important to retailers.

London

1/5

Guy, C.

**Planning for retail development: A critical view of the British experience,**

London: Routledge, 2007, 292p. 0415354536 (Email [Guy@cardiff.ac.uk](mailto:Guy@cardiff.ac.uk) )

This volume updates Cliff Guy's 1994 volume on the same subject. As such it covers the last decade of retail planning policy in the UK which has been a substantial departure from the previous decade. Three chapters focus on the changes in policy since 1960. The rest of the book is on key aspects of planning policy with chapters on: 1. Demand, need and impact; 2. Innovation, productivity, competition and retail planning; 3. Sustainability, shopping travel and retail policy, 4. Social exclusion, access to shopping and retail policy; 5. Urban regeneration and retail policy. The final chapter evaluates retail planning policy discussing how its effectiveness, unresolved issues and points relating to the operation of policy.

## 2. THEORETICAL WORK

2/1

Moran, M.

The Central London retail property market: a fresh perspective,  
**Journal of Retail and Leisure Property**, 5(1), 2006, 78-89. (Email:  
[Michael.moran@cbre.com](mailto:Michael.moran@cbre.com) )

The significance of this paper lies in the careful methodology worked out to assess the submarkets within London. Quantitative and qualitative measures of diversity and positioning are used to determine the robustness and performance of different submarkets in central London.

Property

2/2

Shaw, H.

Food deserts: towards the development of a classification,  
**Geografiska Annaler**, 88B(2), 231-247. (Email: [h.j.shaw@soton.ac.uk](mailto:h.j.shaw@soton.ac.uk))

This study used a shopper survey to begin to reconfigure what might be meant by a food desert. A causative approach is adopted. The concept of access is classified in terms of ability, assets and attitude. Food deserts, unsupportive food environments and food denial zones are identified.

Food deserts

### 3. RETAIL FORMATS

3/1

Burt, S. and Sparks, L.

Asda Wal-Mart in the UK,

In **Wal-Mart world: the world's biggest corporation in the world economy**, S D. Brunn, London: Routledge, pp. 245-262. 0415951372 (Email: [s.l.burt@stir.ac.uk](mailto:s.l.burt@stir.ac.uk) )

This chapter is included in a major study of Wal-Mart operations. It reviews the position of Asda prior to the takeover and evaluates the impact of the takeover on the company. It positions the problems faced by Asda Wal-Mart in expanding its store network in the UK within the planning policy context. The ways that Wal-Mart has responded to the planning dilemmas it faces are outlined in the chapter. It is suggested that for Wal-Mart to expand as it would like to do planning policy would need to change.

Asda, Food retailing, Wal-Mart

3/2

Caroline Cranbrook and Campaign for the Protection of Rural England

**The real choice: how local foods can survive the supermarket onslaught,**

London: Campaign for the Protection of Rural England, Westbrook: Plunkett Foundation, 2006, 24p. (Available online from [www.cpre.org.uk](http://www.cpre.org.uk) ) See also Planning 30/06/06, p.3.

Caroline Cranbrook continues to make the case for more integrated local food economies examining the challenge of the supermarkets to local food economies and the development of food webs to reconnect consumers and producers in the context of sustainability. The retail structure of East Suffolk is cited as a good practice case study. Small retailing units are seen as a prerequisite for the success of small food producers.

Local food

3/3

Greater London Authority

**Retail in London: Small retailers,**

London: Greater London Authority, 2006, 28p. (Working Paper G) 1852618469 (Available online at [www.london.gov.uk](http://www.london.gov.uk))

This paper is part of a study of London's retail sector. It seeks to understand the problems facing small retailers in London and to situate these within the issues facing small retailers in the UK as a whole. Small retailers were defined on the basis of the number of employees with 10 employees as the upper threshold. Problems facing small retailers are considered and actions they might take in response suggested. Smaller retailers felt that the movement of large retailers into the high street had adversely affected their trading position. This was viewed as an indirect effect of the planning policy which encouraged retailers into town centres. Other factors such as costs of operating in London, crime, regulations and accessibility were also

considered. Higher costs were incurred in London than other areas generally but some costs such as crime impacted on London's smaller retailers more than in other areas. The impact of congestion charging had been varied but there was some concern over the increased costs of deliveries. One of the most important areas discussed is succession with aspects such as access to capital, risk, and property market disadvantaging smaller retailers.

London

3/4

Hein, J., Ilbery, B. and Kneafsey, M.

Distribution of local food activity in England and Wales: an index of food relocalisation,

**Regional Studies**, 40(3), 2006, 289-301. (Email: [b.ilbery@coventry.ac.uk](mailto:b.ilbery@coventry.ac.uk) )

The first part of this article attempts to provide detailed definition of local food systems and the second part identifies the strength of these in different parts of England and Wales. Farm shops and farmers markets are the retail aspects of the index.

Local food

3/5

Ilbery, B., Watts, D., Simpson, S., Gilg, A. and Little, J.

Mapping local foods: evidence from two English regions,

**British Food Journal**, 108(3), 2006, 213-225. (Email: [b.ilbery@coventry.ac.uk](mailto:b.ilbery@coventry.ac.uk) )

This paper looks at local food networks in South West England and the West Midlands. Producers, processors and retailers were mapped and the localisation of groupings studied to see what factors determined the success of such networks. Farm based retailing was found to be associated with proximity to market towns and more affluent residential areas. Other factors stimulating local food networks included the type of agriculture and the prevalence of alternative lifestyles in the area

Local food

3/6

Ilbery, B. and Maye, D.

Retailing local food in the Scottish-English borders: a supply chain perspective,

**Geoforum**, 37(3), 2006, 352-367. (Email: [b.ilbery@coventry.ac.uk](mailto:b.ilbery@coventry.ac.uk) )

Supply chain diagrams are used in order to understand the ways in which different types of farm shops are integrated into the supply chain. It attempts to address issues relating to the actual retailing of local foods. Retailers source local foods in different ways and the study uncovers tensions between producer retailers and established independent retailers, links with mainstream retailing and difficulties in determining what might be seen as local.

Local food

3/7

Maye, D. and Ilbery, B.

Regional economies of local food production: tracing food chain links between 'specialist' producers and intermediaries in the Scottish–English Borders

**European Urban and Regional Studies**, 13(4), 2006, 337-354. (Email: [b.ilbery@coventry.ac.uk](mailto:b.ilbery@coventry.ac.uk) )

Local food chains are essentially hybrids. Rarely do they form independent chains from producer to sales. Rather they intersect with different parts of existing food chains whether for suppliers or retailers or other distributors. Three sectors were studied in the Scottish Borders – livestock products, bakery products and fish products. They varied in their use of existing channels and in the ways in which spaces had been found for these products in existing channels.

Local food, Scotland

3/8

Plunkett Foundation

**Sustainable models of community retailing,**

London: DEFRA, 2006, 86p. (Available from [www.defra.gov.uk](http://www.defra.gov.uk) )

The size, scope and key characteristics of community owned shops and the factors contributing to their success are examined in this report.

Different types of shops are identified: volunteer shops, managed shops, privately-managed shops, multi service outlets and delicatessen style shops. The extent to which these represent the only viable form of retailing in some rural communities is investigated. Key success factors are market potential, people to drive the initiative and operational issues. Relationships between post offices and shops are explored and the longer term potential assessed with reference to the types of community where the initiative is most likely to succeed.

Rural retailing

3/9

Poole, R., Clarke, G., Clarke, D.

Competition and saturation in West European retailing,

**Environment and Planning A**, 38, 2006, 2129-2156. (Email: [rpoole@caci.co.uk](mailto:rpoole@caci.co.uk) )

Poole et al. use floorspace statistics to calculate the extent to which French, German and UK grocery markets are saturated at the regional level. The statistics are used to produce a floorspace potential index which is a measure of future capacity. Maps of the outcomes are included in the article. These are then used to assess the possibilities for organic retailer growth.

Europe, Food retailing

3/10

Wells, K. and Watson, S.

A politics of resentment: shopkeepers in a London neighbourhood,

**Ethnic and Racial Studies**, 28(2), 2005, 261-277. (Email: [k.wells@gold.ac.uk](mailto:k.wells@gold.ac.uk) )

Although this article is intended to contribute to a political literature on ethnic groups in the UK as it concerns small shopkeepers there are some findings of relevance to the planning literature. Firstly there is a feeling of considerable disenfranchisement by these groups in their relations with local councils who have through various urban policies had a negative impact on their businesses. Secondly they cite the assertion of new forms of identity as replacing previous community identities as impacting negatively on how the small shopkeepers relate to each other and to their clientele.

Small shops

3/11

Wrigley, N.

**Relocalising food shopping,**

Southampton: University of Southampton, 2006, 15p. (email:

[N.Wrigley@soton.ac.uk](mailto:N.Wrigley@soton.ac.uk))

The paper concerns the role of major multiple Tesco Express in neighbourhood shopping. The study draws on questionnaire data on changing shopping patterns to assess impacts on primary and secondary shopping behaviours. Impacts on travel were studied. It was shown that the new multiples did result in increased localisation of shopping especially for secondary trips but also to some extent for primary shopping. The multiples have been able to bring a range of products to the local level which it is hard for other convenience store formats to achieve. There appeared to be no negative impact on existing stores in an area.

Food retailing, Neighbourhood retailing

## 4. RETAIL LOCATIONS

4/1

Accent Scotland and Mauthner, N.

**Service priority, accessibility and quality in rural Scotland,**  
Edinburgh; Scottish Executive, 2006, 120p.

This report is part of the Scottish Executive's agenda 'Closing the Opportunity Gap'. The study uses focus group research to understand what is meant by terms like accessibility, quality and choice in a rural context for key service provision. Rural shopping is one of the categories considered by the report. It shows a desire for a wider choice and provision of shops in rural areas.

Rural retailing, Scotland

4/2

Association of Town Centre Management

**Retail markets – present status and future prospects,**  
London: ATCM. (Available online at [www.atcm.org](http://www.atcm.org) )

UK markets are often thought to lack the vibrancy and impact that European markets have. A nationwide survey of markets was undertaken to improve knowledge of markets. The results are reported in this publication. The potential for markets is considered within a UK retail context and suggestions put forward for future market development in a town centre context.

Markets

4/3

Bach, M. and Thurstain-Goodwin, M.

**Future of retail property: In town or out of town,**  
London: British Council of Shopping Centres, 2006, 58p. 1 897958358

This paper is concerned with the location of future retail development. It evaluates trends in location including pipeline development. Scenarios for the next five and ten years are then considered. The factors considered include retailer space requirements, planning, types of shopping and types of shopping centre. Potential changes in policy are also considered with reference to pressures for policy change and likely sources for support for change. It is based on expert opinion from investors, developers, agents, retailers, planners and politicians. Over the next five years it is likely that there will be considerable edge of centre development as there is still demand for large retail space with a 40/60 balance between in and out of centre development. Looking further ahead belief in government policy will determine whether town centres will continue to receive investment. Any relaxation of current town centre emphasis could see an increase again in out of town development and any perception that such a change might be likely to happen would affect industry confidence in policy.

Property

4/4

Banham, R.

The UK shopping centre development market,

**Journal of Retail and Leisure Property**, 5(3), 2006, 239-246. (Email:

[banham@donaldsons.co.uk](mailto:banham@donaldsons.co.uk) )

A closer investigation of the major shopping centre pipeline investments which shows that although more space will open in 2008 than for many years it does not represent oversupply. This is because it is concentrated in a few big developments and because preferred store sizes have increased substantially so that fewer occupiers are required to fill a major development.

Property, Shopping centres

4/5

Guy, C.

Out of order,

**Town and Country Planning**, 75(10), 2006, 265-266. (Email [Guy@cardiff.ac.uk](mailto:Guy@cardiff.ac.uk) )

Guy dares to ask in this paper what is happening in out of town retailing. The nature of current out of town retail development is discussed. The positive aspects of out of town retail development are then proposed. These include the possibility that an out of town development can deliver to an area a quality of retailing which could not otherwise be attracted to an area, the localisation of shopping and instances where regeneration will certainly not impact negatively on existing retailing. The flexibility mentioned in PPS6 should be used by retail planners to find new options.

Out of town retailing

4/6

Heaps, P. and Mather, J.

At last! Retail warehouse market round up,

**Journal of Retail and Leisure Property**, 5(4), 338-340. (Email:

[Patrick.heaps@donaldsons.co.uk](mailto:Patrick.heaps@donaldsons.co.uk) )

A resume of changes affecting the retail warehouse sector including the move of retailers such as Accessorize into retail warehouse parks, the ending of mezzanine expansion without planning consent and the moves by Marks & Spencer's Simply Food into retail warehouse parks. These all represent a changing role for retail warehouse parks in retailing.

Mezzanines, Retail warehouse parks

4/7

Jones, P., Comfort, D. and Hillier, D.

Market halls: back to the future,

**Geography Review**, 19(4), 2006, 10-13. (Email: [pjones@glos.ac.uk](mailto:pjones@glos.ac.uk) )

Market halls have been allowed to deteriorate and there has been a lack of investment in their upkeep and modernisation. This has meant that many of them have become peripheral to the modern retail environment. Some city councils do recognise that these can play a role in a city centre retail structure. Two contrasting examples are described. Grainger Market in Newcastle is undergoing refurbishment and modernisation with some reorientation to make the market more important to visitors to the city. Chester's Market Hall by contrast has been recognised as being poorly located and is to be moved to a more accessible location where it can contribute more to the town's vitality.

#### Markets

4/8

McEachern, M. and Warnaby, G.

Food shopping behaviour in Scotland: the influence of relative rurality

**International Journal of Consumer Studies**, 30(2), 2006, 189–201. (Email: [m.g.mceachern@salford.ac.uk](mailto:m.g.mceachern@salford.ac.uk) )

This paper uses data from surveys of rural and urban residents of shopping behaviour in Scotland. The results confirm the use of most accessible shopping destinations by rural and urban consumers although these may mean different things. A continuum of rural urban is preferred to a dichotomy. Relative rurality is an obvious extension of the idea of a continuum in a typology of shopping behaviour.

#### Rural retailing

4/9

Rubin, G., Jatana, N. and Potts, R.

**The world on a plate: Queen's market**

New Economics Foundation, 2006, 40p. (Available online from:

[www.neweconomics.org/gen/marketsvssupermarkets220506.aspx](http://www.neweconomics.org/gen/marketsvssupermarkets220506.aspx) )

This report was commissioned by the Friends of Queens Market in Newham, London. As such it takes their side of the argument in a bid to counter development proposals for the area put forward by Newham Council. From a research perspective the data collected underlines the importance of the market for the ethnic communities in the area who find ethnic group specific products there and who also are involved as traders. It also highlights the differences between the way that the traders and the council see the problems of redevelopment in the area. The proposed partnership with a private company would undoubtedly change the market and the level of local participation and control.

Food retailing, London, Markets, Queens Market

4/10

Scottish Borders Council, COSLA and South of Scotland Alliance

**Scottish small towns report 2007-2013,**

Melrose: Scottish Borders Council, 2006, 115p. (Available online from [www.scotborders.gov.uk/pdf/18015.pdf](http://www.scotborders.gov.uk/pdf/18015.pdf) )

This paper covers a wide range of issues relating to small towns in Scotland. The towns surveyed were across Scotland but with a bias towards the Scottish Borders. SPP8's principles are discussed in relation to the small towns and the potential for health checks and town centre strategies to deliver more vibrant town centres are considered.

Market towns, Scotland, SPP8

4/11

Thomas, C., Bromley, R. and Tallon, A.

New 'high streets' in the suburbs? The growing competitive impact of evolving retail parks,

**International Review of Retail, Distribution and Consumer Research**, 16(1), 2006, 43-68. (Email: [c.j.thomas@swansea.ac.uk](mailto:c.j.thomas@swansea.ac.uk) )

The Fforestfach retail park in Swansea is the focus of this study. It examines both the retail structure and shopping patterns to show how the retail park has changed in character and retail function. The addition of high street features to retail parks will have an impact on town centre retailing and may threaten the primacy of town centres in traditional retail sectors such a clothing. Even small changes towards a high street retail structure in a retail park were shown to have a very significant impact on the use of the retail park. The importance of this in a planning context and the lack of any policy within PPS6 to alter this are noted.

Retail warehouse park, Swansea

4/12

Trevor Wood

**Going Shopping 2006 - The Definitive Guide to Shopping Centres**

London: Savills, 2006. (Email: [trevor@trevorwoodassociates.co.uk](mailto:trevor@trevorwoodassociates.co.uk) )

An annual study of shopping centre development. Features include league tables of the Top 500 Shopping Centres, Top 20 Shopping Parks, Top 30 Factory Outlet Centres, Top 20 Investment Managers, Top 20 Managing Agents, Top 50 Letting Agents and Top 40 Retailers.

Shopping centres

4/13

Verdict

**UK town centre retailing,**

London: Verdict, 2006, 181p.

A new report by Verdict which documents the sizes of town centre markets and lists the top 100 UK towns by quantity and quality of retailing. Store numbers are listed by sector and profits and margins tabulated. Key strategic issues discussed are online shopping and changes and factors impacting on the level of town centre sales including high street casualties.

Town centre

4/14

Verdict

**UK out of town retailing,**

London: Verdict, 2006, 169p.

Key trends in out of town retail development are presented including company performance, market analysis and sectoral developments. Key messages are corporate failures flooding the market with secondary space, slowing of expansion by largest out of town operators, demand from the fashion sector, grocery retailer expansion of non-foods, the ending of the mezzanine loophole and slowing of rent inflation.

Out of town retailing

## 5. RETAIL PLANNING PRACTICE

5/1

Accessible Retail

### **Barker Review of land use planning,**

Saffron Walden: Accessible Retail, 2006. (Available online from [www.accessibleretail.co.uk](http://www.accessibleretail.co.uk) )

A submission by Accessible Retail to the Barker Review, Accessible Retail represents the interests of retail warehouse parks. The submission presents the economic case for allowing the sector to grow noting key aspects of the sector such as employment, the efficiency of certain formats and arguing against the longstanding belief that these centres threaten town centre viability. It gives responses to key questions being considered by the Barker Review.

Barker Review, Retail warehouse park

5/2

Competition Commission

### **Groceries market investigation**

London, Competition Commission, 2006 (Available online from [www.competition-commission.org.uk](http://www.competition-commission.org.uk))

The documents relating to the current investigation are available including for example a list of members of the investigation, a timetable of events and submissions to the investigation from a range of individuals, MPs, trade unions, political parties, pressure groups and NGOs, industry spokespeople and local authorities. Results are to be published in October 2007.

Competition Commission, Food retailing, Regulation

5/3

Competition Commission

### **Working paper on land holdings and use issues,**

London: Competition Commission, 2007, 15p. (Available online from [www.competition-commission.org.uk](http://www.competition-commission.org.uk))

The paper analyses the use of land banks held by retailers. The data on land held is used to evaluate claims made by Friends of the Earth that for example Tesco could substantially increase market share from existing land which it holds. The paper refutes this. It also discusses ways in which land might be held to impede competitive development.

Competition Commission, Food retailing, Property

5/4

Competition Commission

**Working paper on planning issues**

London: Competition Commission, 2007, 53p. (Available online from

[www.competition-commission.org.uk/inquiries/ref2006/grocery/emerging\\_thinking\\_working\\_papers.htm](http://www.competition-commission.org.uk/inquiries/ref2006/grocery/emerging_thinking_working_papers.htm) )

From a retail planning perspective this is the key paper produced by the Competition Commission to date. The paper focuses on ways in which the planning system could either favour incumbents and inhibit new entry or be used to gain competitive advantage. It details the way that the need test is used and discusses how this could impact on new entries to the market.

Food retailing, PPS6

5/5

Competition Commission

**Emerging thinking**

London: Competition Commission, 2007 (Available online from [www.competition-commission.org.uk/inquiries/ref2006/grocery/emerging\\_thinking.htm](http://www.competition-commission.org.uk/inquiries/ref2006/grocery/emerging_thinking.htm) )

This is the interim report of the Competition Commission Inquiry into the major supermarket operators. There are a series of accompanying working papers and also the evidence presented to the inquiry from a range of interested parties. Interim results suggested that the next phase of the investigation would look at a more local level.

Competition Commission, Food retailing, Regulation

5/6

Couch, C. and Fowles, S.

Britain: Runcorn – a tale of two cities,

**Built Environment**, 32(1), 2006, 88-102.

A comparison in a planning context between Runcorn's 'Shopping City' development and Runcorn old town. Shopping City quickly became dated and did not have the capacity to react in a flexible way to new retail developments. It is argued that an organic town centre has greater flexibility and potential in terms of maintaining community links and adaptation to retail change.

Runcorn, Shopping centres

5/7

Dunford, J.

Underserved markets: Business in the Community,  
**Local Economy**, 21(1), 2006, 73-77.

This paper discusses the positioning of the Business in the Community initiative in the context of planning, regeneration and retailing. Use of the term 'under-served' signifies the difference between viewing an area as an area of deprivation and an area as a one of opportunity. Traditionally competition for public resources has tended to see an emphasis on deprivation but attracting private funding requires an emphasis on opportunity. The potential of private funding through retail investment to deliver a much better outcome in terms of redressing negative images of areas is underlined. The planning policy environment has not made achieving this easy and a greater understanding by planners of the regenerative potential of retailing is required.

Urban regeneration

5/8

Findlay, A.M. and Sparks, L.

Retail land-use planning: the Scottish perspective,  
**European Retail Digest**, 49, 2006, 30-35. (Email: [a.m.findlay@stir.ac.uk](mailto:a.m.findlay@stir.ac.uk) )

This article focuses on the differences between PPS6 and the draft version of SPP8. In particular it highlights the responses received from the circulation of the draft document. These included clarification and consistency of some terms used, how uses contributing to vitality and viability had been decided upon, the involvement of stakeholders and concern about the welfare of centres apart from town centres.

Scotland, SPP8

5/9

Greater London Authority

**Retail in London: Retail and the labour market,**

London: Greater London Authority, 2006, 45p. (Working Paper E) 1852618302  
(Available online at [www.london.gov.uk](http://www.london.gov.uk))

In view of the importance of employment in consideration of qualitative aspects of planning this paper provides insight into the contribution of retail employment within an urban labour market. The role of retailing in providing jobs which require few qualifications and offer flexibility is discussed.

Employment, London

5/10

Guy, C.

Are you being under-served?

**Town and Country Planning**, 75(3), 2006, 9-10. (Email [Guy@cardiff.ac.uk](mailto:Guy@cardiff.ac.uk) )

A review of the work of Business in the Community initiative on under-served markets. It sets the BiTC agenda in a planning context. The difference between provision and adequacy of quality is emphasised. PPS6 does not provide the best environment for tackling problems of under-served markets.

Food deserts, PPS6

5/11

Guy, C.

Retail productivity and land use planning: negotiating joined-up retail planning policy,

**Environment and Planning C**, 24(5), 2006, 755-770. (Email [Guy@cardiff.ac.uk](mailto:Guy@cardiff.ac.uk) )

A study of how policy is made. The current PPS6 is studied with reference to the way that opposing government department points of view were reconciled and how this shaped the final policy statement. The role of other parties in contributing to the policy making process is discussed but it is concluded that lobbying either by the industry or pressure groups did not have a major role in policy determination.

PPS6

5/12

Guy, C.

Will the watchdog bite?

**Town and Country Planning**, 75(4), 2006, 100-101. (Email [Guy@cardiff.ac.uk](mailto:Guy@cardiff.ac.uk) )

A candid look at the very different positions as reported in a range of recent reports. The reports have in common their belief that planning is in some way responsible for the dominance of the major grocery retailers. Planners can respond by saying that they cannot discriminate between different operators either by company or size and format. They can also blame the town centre first policy. However it is also true that planners could negotiate more with existing retailers including smaller retailers to search for ways to foster the existing retail sector. It suggests that it would be possible for the impact on existing small retailers to be become a reason for planning permission to be refused. Local councils could be given greater discretionary powers. It is however unlikely that the outcome of the Competition Commission inquiry will deliver that.

Competition Commission, Small shops

5/13

Hargest, K.

SPP8 Town centres and retailing,

**Scottish Planning and Environmental Law**, 118, 2006, 134-135.

A brief review of the new Scottish policy guidance document SPP8. It highlights the emphasis on economic growth and the involvement of out of town retail sites in the sequential process both of which differentiate the policy from its English counterpart. Comparisons with NPPG8 note that it is simpler and more flexible with greater emphasis on qualitative deficiencies in retail provision.

Scotland, SPP8

5/14

Instone, P. and Roberts, G.

Progress in retail-led regeneration: implications for decision makers,

**Journal of Retail and Leisure Property**, 5(2), 2006, 148-161. (Email:

[paul.instone@scottwilson.com](mailto:paul.instone@scottwilson.com) )

This is a review article which tries to differentiate between in town regeneration and regeneration in under served markets. It is argued that the emphasis on town centres is increasing their catchments and disadvantaging other inner city areas. Although there is provision in PPS6 to ensure a more balanced distribution of retailing policy has tended to favour the bigger town centres in regeneration projects. There is a plea for a variety of retailing to be actively encouraged in under served markets.

Urban regeneration

5/15

Jones, P., Comfort, D. and Hillier, D.

Net call for the major players,

**Town and Country Planning**, 75(6), 2006, 186-188. (Email: [pjones@glos.ac.uk](mailto:pjones@glos.ac.uk) )

A review of the pressure group activities of groups opposed to supermarket dominance on range of issues. These include a range of issues such as the Friends of the Earth planning concerns and Corporate Watch's 'Tesco-isation' concern over the killing off of high streets. It is posited that these concerns represent a more fundamental tension between sustainability and consumerism.

Food retailing

5/16

Kervenoael, R. de, Hallsworth, A. and Clarke, I.

Macro-level change and micro level effects: a twenty year perspective on changing grocery behaviour in Britain,

**Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services**, 13, 2006, 381-392. (Email:

[A.Hallsworth@surrey.ac.uk](mailto:A.Hallsworth@surrey.ac.uk) )

This paper explores the way that changes in retail structure have been matched with changes in consumption and shopping patterns. The interface between retail planning

policy and its outcomes and the practicalities of consumer choices articulated through shopping practices are then examined. The paper calls for a more regionally based policy which can take account of regional differentials suggesting that a one size fits all approach is not the best policy outcome.

PPS6, Food retailing

5/17

King Sturge

**The contribution of the retail sector to the economy, employment and regeneration,**

London: King Sturge, 2006, 28p. (Available online from [www.kingsturge.co.uk](http://www.kingsturge.co.uk) ).

A study which seeks to emphasise the contribution retail employment makes in regeneration areas. It uses data from a survey of employees as well as published data to chart the impact of retail employment. Four case studies are included: Seacroft, Leeds; The Source, Meadowhall, Sheffield; Castle Vale, Birmingham; B&Q, Bolton.

Employment, Urban regeneration

5/18

Lock, D.

Planning for shopping,

**Town and Country Planning**, 75(11), 2006, 296-297.

The anomalous nature of much policy is highlighted in this paper. Whilst concepts such as zoning and required quantity of shopping space initially seem straightforward in practice shops are built outside zoned areas, new space is taken on a first come first served basis and controls on types of goods out of town seem to be disintegrating. Lock suggests that it would be better if competition could be considered as a material consideration, that there should be a process for the establishment of new town centres rather than an obsession with the existing configuration and that covenant sales are inhibiting competition.

PPS6

5/19

Office of Fair Trading

**The grocery market: the OFT's reasons for making a reference to the Competition Commission,**

London: Office of Fair Trading, 2006, 95p. (Available online from [www.offt.gov.uk/NR/rdonlyres/1A2D7FA2-FEA3-4459-9B25-4A737A20023D/0/oft845.pdf](http://www.offt.gov.uk/NR/rdonlyres/1A2D7FA2-FEA3-4459-9B25-4A737A20023D/0/oft845.pdf)) (see also **Planning**, 12/05/06, p.2)

A review of the sector and an outline of the main concerns of the Office for Fair Trading. The aspects relating specifically to retail planning are on pages 56-67.

Competition, Food retailing, PPS6

5/20

Quin, S.

**Defining town centres,**

London: ATCM, 2006, 3p. (Available online at [www.atcm.org](http://www.atcm.org))

This position paper tackles the issue of what is defined as a town centre. The concept of a de facto town centre is presented based on what roles a given centre is playing. *De facto* town centres it is argued should become *de jure* town centres. Whilst supporting the emphasis on existing centre viability and vitality it is argued that there must be provision for the creation of new town centres.

PPS6, Town centre

5/21

Quin, S.

**Position paper- need test,**

London: ATCM, 2007, 3p. (Available online at [www.atcm.org](http://www.atcm.org))

This paper provides the Association of Town Centre Management response to the Barker Review proposal to remove the need test from PPS6. Such a decision would accelerate the decline of town centres, stop the pipeline of investments in town centres and undermine current retail planning policy.

Need, PPS6

5/22

Scottish Executive

**Scottish planning policy SPP8: Town centres and retailing**

Edinburgh: Scottish Executive, 2006, 16p. (Available from [www.scotland.gov.uk/Publications/2006/07/26112710/0](http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Publications/2006/07/26112710/0) )

This is the final policy statement. It outlines the key principles and the way they will be applied. The town centre focus remains. The importance of the plan-led approach is emphasised in the recognition of a network of centres, flexibility, the involvement of stakeholders and negotiation between developers and planners on issues such as design.

Scotland, SPP8

5/23

Scottish Executive

**Retail development survey 2003 and Retail development survey 2004**

Edinburgh: Scottish Executive, 2006, 28p, 28p. (Available online from [www.scotland.gov.uk/Publications/2006/11/14144136/0](http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Publications/2006/11/14144136/0) )

Two volumes of the Retail Development Survey were published in 2006. The volumes include data on number of retail developments, floorspace, type of development, construction type, location of development, sequential approach and pipeline developments. The data show trends in retail development. Superstores were the largest category of applications whilst most development was in edge of centre or

town centre sites. Comparison development was most frequently in edge of centre and out of centre sites with mixed development in town centres. Brownfield development was much more significant than Greenfield development.

Scotland

5/24

Wood, S., Lowe, M. and Wrigley, N.

Life after PPG6 – recent UK food retailer responses to planning regulation tightening, **International Review of Retail, Distribution and Consumer Research**, 16(1), 2006, 23-41. (Email: [smwood@surrey.ac.uk](mailto:smwood@surrey.ac.uk) )

The paper explores retailer responses to the tightening of retail planning policy and their search for alternative innovative solutions. These include working within the constraints of the policy, exploiting flaws and loopholes in the policy and finding alternative ways of expanding their operations. Each of these responses is dealt with in some detail. Urban regeneration partnership stores are one means by which retailers operated within the policy in new ways. Superstore sites have also been used more intensively. Mezzanine development represents an example of exploiting loopholes in the legislation. The entry of multiple retailers into the convenience sector is the most obvious example of the retailers finding new ways of operating in the tightened planning environment. Equally retailers have developed stand alone non-food outlets. In the concluding section the paper addresses the significance of these responses from an industry point of view in terms of adaptation and innovation strategies. Regulation itself is also reformulated in response to retailer actions and reactions to policy.

PPS 6

## 6. CONSUMER CULTURE

6/1

CB Richard Ellis

### **Fashioning a shopping experience,**

London: CBRE, 2006, 19p. (Available online at [www.cbre.com](http://www.cbre.com))

Consumer preferences for shopping environments by consumer group are documented using data from a consumer survey. Factors which militated against a positive experience differed by consumer group with differing responses to frustration. Crowding issues were found to be particularly important. There was also an increased migration of shoppers from in town to out of town locations.

Consumer groups, Non-food retailing

6/2

Jones, P., Comfort, D. and Hillier, D.

Back to the future for small shops,

**Town and Country Planning**, 75(4), 2006, 122-124. (Email: [pjones@glos.ac.uk](mailto:pjones@glos.ac.uk) )

The paper asks whether the measures proposed in the All Party Parliamentary Group Report investigating the small shop sector would actually make a difference to the position of small shops (see **Annual Update 2005**). Key supply and demand side drivers have changed the context within which shops are operating and these cannot be changed through further regulation. Whilst the media presents the problems of small shops as arising from the actions of larger retailers the reality is that small retailers must present viable business propositions in the current business environment.

Small shops

6/3

Jones, P., Comfort, D., Shears, P. and Hillier, D.

Food retailing and the environment

**Town and Country Planning**, 75(12), 2006, 360-363. (Email: [pjones@glos.ac.uk](mailto:pjones@glos.ac.uk) )

This article reviews the publication 'Greening supermarkets: how supermarkets can help make shopping easier' published by the National Consumer Council. It sets the publication within the context of retailer attention to corporate social responsibility in respect of the sustainability and environmental agenda. The corporate social responsibility agendas of major retailers could be doing more but in practice their response is matched to the behaviours of consumers rather than any rhetoric or attitudes they express.

Sustainability

6/4

Jones, P., Comfort, D. and Hillier, D.

Healthy eating and the UK's major food retailers: a case study in corporate social responsibility,

**British Food Journal**, 108(10), 2006, 838-848. (Email: [pjones@glos.ac.uk](mailto:pjones@glos.ac.uk) )

From a planning perspective this paper is contextualised within the debate over whether improved consumer access to healthy foods in large supermarkets will impact on diet. The study examines corporate responsibility statements about health and diet and uses information from walk through surveys on the promotion of healthy foods in the top ten food retailers. Variations in the focus given to healthy foods were found between retailers as there were in their ranges of healthy products. The conclusions state that stores could do much more to promote healthy eating habits.

Consumer groups, Diet

6/5

Myers, H. and Lumbers, M.

**Future of retail property: Consumers over 55: silver shoppers provide a golden opportunity,**

London: British Council of Shopping Centres, 2006, 80p. 189758315 (see also

**Planning**, 29/09/06, p.3, **Centre retailing 2007**, London: Estates Gazette, 2006)

The paper seeks to inform the shopping centre industry on the potential of the silver market while emphasising the needs of this consumer group in terms of their expectations about shopping places. Tenant mix, ambience and design, access, safety, dwell time, leisure and marketing centres to the grey consumer are considered. Consumer focus group findings were combined with industry interviews to reach the conclusions presented in the report. The study identifies different older groups. Whilst there is a chronological dimension there are other factors in terms of lifestyle, household structure, attitudes and income levels which are also important in segmenting this group. Issues identified as a challenge to the industry are post-materialism and retail as leisure. The report sees this age group as a gap in the market.

Consumer groups, Shopping centres

6/6

Oppewal, H., Alexander, A. and Sullivan, P.

Consumer perceptions of corporate social responsibility in town shopping centres and their influence on shopping evaluations,

**Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services**, 13, 2006, 261-274. (Email:

[Harmen.Oppewal@buesco.monash.edu.au](mailto:Harmen.Oppewal@buesco.monash.edu.au) )

The paper asks whether the types of effects found for retailers in terms of the impact of corporate social responsibility could apply to shopping centres. The paper uses approaches established for retailer use of corporate social responsibility to enhance store attractiveness and patronage to a shopping centre context. The relationship between retailers and community is an integral aspect of the process by which this might be achieved. A survey of residents in Guildford provides the evidence used in

the paper. The respondents were asked about aspects of corporate social responsibility focussing on community support and environmental issues. The results suggested that different types of corporate social responsibility actions had different effects on perceptions of centre support and attractiveness but that corporate social responsibility only impacted in a limited way and only in certain circumstances. Local issues did not command the support anticipated.

Shopping centres

6/7

Verdict

**Future of retail property: Changing demographics and consumer patterns,**

London: British Council of Shopping Centres, 2006, 140p. 1897958307

Shifting demographics and consumer shopping patterns will impact on the future of shopping centres and high streets. Consumer meta-trends, such as wellness, post materialism and limelight syndrome, identify the fundamental societal changes which will affect shopping. The impacts of these on the retail sector are considered. Lifestage models such as innocence to corruption, mass acquisition, identity formation and mend and make do, are then applied to these changes and each segment considered. Responses and requirements for the retail sector are then mapped out and the relative significance of these groups now and in the future outlined. Consumer weariness is seen as a challenge to retailing. The focus must shift to older age groups. All retail places cannot any longer be all things to all people. Access (parking) is a key factor. Centres will have to work hard to retain custom, being more targeted as specific groups and matching needs and expectations more closely for identifiable groups.

Consumer groups, Shopping centres

## 7. URBAN ENVIRONMENT

7/1

Ardill, R.

### **Future of retail property, Future of brands,**

London: British Council of Shopping Centres, 2006, 60p. 1897958331

The focus of this paper is the practical implications of the branding of shopping places. It combines best practice thinking with expert opinion. Ten brand forces are identified: keeping it real, telling us stories, getting organised, making things simpler, changing our lives, getting closer to us, feeling the difference, caring for our communities, getting more experienced, daring to dream. Branding has the potential in the context of shopping centres to deliver a clearly differentiated and highly compelling shopping experience. To achieve this there must be vision and mission and a commitment to achieving these. Distinctiveness, superiority, consistency, adaptability will all be important attributes of shopping centre branding. Shopping places must become more than shopping locations. For the industry to benefit from branding of shopping centres new commercial models and partnerships will be required. How shopping centres meet the aspirations of consumers and the way the brand is positioned may be more important than the location of centres.

Shopping centres

7/2

Commission for Integrated Transport

### **Sustainable transport choices and the retail sector,**

London: CfIT, 2006, 36p. (Available online from

[www.cfit.gov.uk/docs/2006/stc/stc/index.htm](http://www.cfit.gov.uk/docs/2006/stc/stc/index.htm) ) (See also review in **Planning** 21/07/06, 1)

A paper to inform the government on issues relating to travel for shopping. The paper investigates whether people who travel by car spend more, how in town and out of town travel and spend are related, public transport facilities and the main transport priorities identified by shoppers. The paper begins from the premise that car transport is not sustainable. Survey work in Cambridge, Birmingham, Leeds, Nottingham, Brighton and Bath forms the evidence used. Recommendations are reached e.g. bus stops should be placed near shops.

Travel

7/3

Court, Y.

### **Future of retail property: Online retailing: the impact of the click on the brick,**

London: British Council of Shopping Centres, 2006, 120p. 1897958323

(see also **Planning**, 10/11/06, 1, **Centre retailing 2007**, London: Estates Gazette, 2006.)

Although on-line retailing has developed more slowly than initially predicted it is beginning to have a significant impact on bricks and mortar retailing. A significant

proportion of the study is devoted to the way that multi-channel retailing is developing is considered alongside an analysis of the consumer groups and product groups most involved in online retailing. The ways in which the built environment must adapt to these changes are discussed. Specific consumer groups are identified: net sceptic store shoppers, multi-channel shoppers, net browser store shoppers, e-shoppers and internet café contenders. Keeping shoppers going to the shops is discussed with reference to the shopping experience including physical access, customer service, targeted experiences and the nature of retail places. A transition model is proposed where access will be more important than location, specialists favoured over generalists, might buy more important than must buy, showroom/theatre more important than warehouse, store as information point rather than transaction point, trust the key rather than convenience and value for time and money more important than value for money alone.

E-commerce, Shopping centres

7/4

Derek Halden Consultancy and Institute for Retail Studies, University of Stirling  
**Future of retail property: Future of retail transport: access, information and flexibility,**

London: British Council of Shopping Centres, 2006, 84p. 189795834X  
(see also Planning, 1/12/06,p.8)

In this report the focus is on the areas of retail transport which are most likely to change. The report is structured under 5 headings: 1. Transport Infrastructure and Transport Cost, 2. Managing Passenger and Freight Transport, 3. Future Modes, 4. The Informed Traveller and 5. People, Lifestyles and Retail Markets. Successful transport strategies are seen as a prerequisite for competitive retail property. Key trends are the likely increased costs of travel, the pay as you go society, transport will become part of managing shopping centres and it will be key to the competitiveness of some types of centres especially secondary shopping areas and smaller centres.

Shopping centres, Travel

7/5

Greater London Authority

**Retail in London: Service and delivery issues,**

London: Greater London Authority, 2006, 68p (Working paper I), 18452618884  
(Available online at [www.london.gov.uk](http://www.london.gov.uk))

Parking, delivery curfews and congestion charging are considered in this paper in respect of deliveries to London retailers. Key issues of concern to the delivery sector are highlights and some discussion is focused on overcoming these including for example new technologies in terms of quieter vehicles and moovit communications systems. Trends in the sector in London, types of deliveries and other servicing of retail outlets are all documented. Comparisons with other towns and cities in terms of congestion, speed and costs of congestion are included. Arguments relating to charges for service deliveries are explained.

Congestion, London, Travel

7/6

Emery, J.

Bullring: a case study of retail-led urban renewal and its contribution to city centre regeneration,

**Journal of Retail and Leisure Property**, 5(2), 2006, 121-133. (Email: [jemery@hammerson.co.uk](mailto:jemery@hammerson.co.uk) )

The Bullring in Birmingham offered through the partnership project a unified direction which has facilitated the implementation of the project. Engagement with the local community has been important in the project with ideas about design and also tenant mix emerging from this process. Permeability of the centre has been a key aspect of the design as has the inclusion of mini pitches.

Birmingham, Bullring, Town centre

7/7

Guy, C.

To him that hath...

**Town and Country Planning**, 76(1), 2006, 8-9. (Email [Guy@cardiff.ac.uk](mailto:Guy@cardiff.ac.uk) )

There is concern that the property industry may be running ahead of the retail industry in the provision of new space. It is suggested that the bigger centres will prove more attractive. It is therefore right that there is concern over the viability and vitality of smaller centres including those in smaller towns.

Property

7/8

Guy, C.

Whose city centre?

**Town and Country Planning**, 75(7/8), 2006, 200-201. (Email [Guy@cardiff.ac.uk](mailto:Guy@cardiff.ac.uk) )

Experience of BIDs in the US suggests that they lead to an increasingly privatised public realm. Key stakeholders in BIDs will not include users of the street such as shoppers and increasingly vitality could be threatened.

BIDs

7/9

Jackson, C.

Retail planning and institutional property investment,

**Regional Studies**, 40(5), 2006, 555-561.

The paper argues that planning issues are fundamental to attracting regional investment highlighting areas of implementation of retail planning policy in England which underpin the success or failure of a town centre. The analysis is based on interviews with planners. The restricted planning environment makes different demands on the planners eager to attract institutional investment with ancillary aspects of the town centre environment much more important than previously.

Planners should have a greater awareness of the needs of the institutional investor or this can negatively impact on the vitality and viability of their centres.

#### Property

7/10

Jones, P., Comfort, D. and Hillier, D.

From farm gate to consumer's plate,

**Town and Country Planning**, 75(5), 2006, 153-156. (Email: [pjones@glos.ac.uk](mailto:pjones@glos.ac.uk) )

A critique of DEFRA's Food Industry Sustainability Strategy Report. The article goes on to show that the lack of commitment from the major players including the food retailers is problematic. Indeed none of the major retailers were participants and their continued interest in economic growth is at odds with concerns over environmental damage. The discussion exemplifies the gap between attitudes and policies and the difficulties which will arise in reconciling these opposite positions.

#### Sustainability

7/11

Jones, P., Hillier, D. and Comfort, D.

New environments to fight retail fatigue,

**Town and Country Planning**, 75(3), 2006, 81-83. (Email: [pjones@glos.ac.uk](mailto:pjones@glos.ac.uk) )

The context of this paper is the clone town debate and the sameness of town centres. It suggests that US lifestyle centres might be appropriate. These offer the opportunity to create a sense of place and encourage identification with a given centre. The new retail quarter in Sheffield is the nearest UK example of what might be envisaged. A sense of place may be the necessary counterweight to retail fatigue.

#### Sheffield, Town centre

7/12

Marsden, G.

The evidence base for parking policies,

**Transport Policy**, 13(6), 2006, 447-457. (Email: [G.R.Marsden@its.leeds.ac.uk](mailto:G.R.Marsden@its.leeds.ac.uk) )

The paper introduces the literature on parking policies highlighting the key aspects of parking policy. A section specifically considers the vitality of centres and parking policies drawing extensively on results from the Lockwood survey. Quality of offer is traded off against convenience and cost and this should be of taken into account but evidence that parking is a determinant of vitality remains unproven.

#### Parking, Town centre, Travel

7/13

Minton, A.

**The privatisation of public space,**

London: RICS, 2006, 38p. (Available online from [www.rics.org.uk](http://www.rics.org.uk) )

BIDs represent a new interpretation of the public/private realms. Increased privatisation of urban space in the UK will be the result of BIDs. It is argued that this will produce controlled sterile places which lack connection to the reality and diversity of the local environment and which as a result will further erode social cohesion. The creation of 'hot spots' and 'cold spots' will break up social cohesion and increase a feeling of a lack of trust. It is suggested that places must be more than a balance sheet and that other approaches can deliver what will be more socially cohesive and hence actually more economically productive urban places.

BIDs

7/14

Parker, C. and Garnell, C.

Regeneration and retail in Liverpool: a new approach,

**Journal of Retail and Leisure Property**, 5(4), 292-304. (Email:

[Charlie.parker@enterprise.plc.uk](mailto:Charlie.parker@enterprise.plc.uk) )

Retail development is regarded as a catalyst to regeneration in Liverpool. Liverpool 1 is intended to operate not as a shopping centre but as a reinstatement of the high street concept. Critical to its success has been the way the development integrates with existing retailing in the town centre. The partnership approach has been important in determining the choice of development strategy and the implementation of that strategy.

Liverpool, Town centre

7/15

RAC Foundation and British Retail Consortium

**Shopping and transport policy,**

London: RAC Foundation for Motoring, 2006, 62p. (Available online at

[www.racfoundation.org](http://www.racfoundation.org) )

This paper draws on a wide range of expertise in the field. It reaches a number of conclusions to inform decision making on sustainable transport policy for shopping. The use of cars for shopping was found to be very important both in town centres and out of town retail areas. Planning must be realistic in what can be achieved. Transport planning needs to reflect the reality of how people live so that future policy must relate places where people live to where they shop and type of shopping. Results from an NOP poll are used in the study. There are chapters on getting to the shops, the development of retailing, impact of retail trends on transport and vice versa.

Travel

7/16

Ward, K.

Policies in motion, urban management and state restructuring. The trans-local expansion of BIDs,

**International Journal of Urban and Regional Studies**, 30, 2006, 54-75.

The article reviews the way the concept has developed in the UK and the challenges it poses to the way that people think about urban spaces and the interests that they serve. BIDs represent a neoliberalist policy whose main role is to promote the best conditions for capital accumulation. As such they challenge existing meanings of public space but they are in line with other changes in the way that business expects to operate in the UK.

BIDs

7/17

Watson, S. and Studdert, D.

**Markets as sites for social interaction,**

Bristol: Policy Press, 2006, 53p. 1861349254 (Available online from [www.jfr.org.uk](http://www.jfr.org.uk) )

This study of markets is written from a different perspective from other recent market studies. It takes a much more nuanced approach recognising that the development of markets is situated in a changing consumer and retail environment where drivers of change in both will impact on the success or failure of certain types of markets and market locations. Markets are more than a generic term and the success of a given market will depend on the way that it fits with other surrounding retailing, with the socio-demographic and consumer segments in the area. A key feature of the paper is the way in which markets fit into the prevailing consensus on the use of public and private spaces in an ever more commodified understanding of space.

Markets, Public space, Town centre

## 8. A SELECTION OF LITERATURE RELATING TO RETAIL PLANNING IN USA AND EUROPE

8/1

Farag, E., Weltverden, J., Van Rietbergen, T. and Dijst, M.

E-shopping in the Netherlands: does geography matter?

**Environment and Planning B** 33(1), 2006, 59-74. (Email: [s.farag@geo.uu.nl](mailto:s.farag@geo.uu.nl) )

There are geographical dimensions to the take up of online retailing in The Netherlands. Data on population distribution, number of shops for different types of needs and retail floorspace were used to provide the necessary evidence base. It was found that urbanised areas are more involved in online shopping and within these areas those with least good access to shops are likely to make greater use of online retailing. The links between accessibility and online retailing were subsidiary to the urban location.

E-retailing, Netherlands

8/2

Grimmeau, J.-P.

Competition and complementarity in retailing,

**BelGeo**, 1-2, 2006, 1-177.

A special issue of the journal on the topic of urban structure with contributions from different European countries:

Borgers, A., Van Swaaij, S. and Janssen, I.

Assessing the impact of peripheral mega retail centres on traditional urban shopping centres, 53-66. (Email: [a.w.j.borgers@bwk.tue.nl](mailto:a.w.j.borgers@bwk.tue.nl) )

Carreras, C.

Tradition and modernity. Competition among retail locations in contemporary Barcelona, 41-51. (Email: [ccarreras@ub.edu](mailto:ccarreras@ub.edu))

Hatz, G.

Competition and complementarity of retailing in the historic city centre of Vienna, 135-154. ( Email: [gerhard.hatz@univie.ac.at](mailto:gerhard.hatz@univie.ac.at) )

Kulke, E.

Competition between formats and locations in retailing, p. 27- 39. (Email: [elmar.kulke@geo.hu-berlin.de](mailto:elmar.kulke@geo.hu-berlin.de) )

Loda, M.

Retail business in the historical centre of Florence. Mass tourism and new immigrant entrepreneurs, 99-111. (Email: [mireloda@tin.it](mailto:mireloda@tin.it) )

Pommois, C.

Evolution of shopping habits in Prague from Communism to fun shopping, 9-26. (Email: [carole.pommois@peugeot.com](mailto:carole.pommois@peugeot.com))

Van Crielingen, M. and Fleury, A.

The trendy city: gentrification and retail dynamics in Brussels and Paris, 113-133. (Email: [mvancric@ulb.ac.be](mailto:mvancric@ulb.ac.be))

Wayens, B. and Grimmeau, J.-P.

Types of shops concentrated and dispersed in Brussels: complementarity or competition? 67-80. (Email: [bwayens@ulb.ac.be](mailto:bwayens@ulb.ac.be) )

The papers show the ways in which different retail forms in urban areas can be complementary to each other and the ways that the contribution of these can be understood. A key theme is the way that different planning traditions have been involved in shaping these cities. Detailed survey work is included in the papers.

Austria, Belgium, Czech Republic, France, Italy, Netherlands, Spain, Town centre

8/3

Hernandez, T. and Simmons, J.

Evolving retail landscapes: power retail in Canada,

**Canadian Geographer**, 50(4), 2006, 465-486. (Email:

[thernand@research.ryerson.ca](mailto:thernand@research.ryerson.ca))

This paper seeks to understand the consumer and retail thinking between power centres in the context of Canadian retailing. It also considers the policy concerns which this type of retailing has raised. Concerns about the type of consumerism it represents and the visual impacts of these centres have been expressed. Attempts to restrict developments to existing retail zones have largely failed where they have been based on unfair competition. Traffic generation arguments have been easier to use.

Canada, Out of town retailing

8/4

Moore, O.

Understanding postorganic fresh fruit and vegetable consumers at participatory farmers' markets in Ireland: reflexivity, trust and social movements

**International Journal of Consumer Studies**, 30(5), 2006, 416-426.

Interview results are analysed to understand how customers relate to the range of produce and stalls at markets. The build up of trust between consumer and retailer in markets is critical. Local fresh produce is preferred to organic. Postorganic is piloted as a term with a wider environmental remit than organic.

Markets

8/5

Neighbourhood centres: a special issue

**Built Environment**, 32(1), 2006

This special issue includes different approaches to neighbourhood centres in Europe. It includes:

Nystrom, L. and Lundstrom, M.

Sweden: the life and death of great neighbourhood centres, 32-52.

Eckhardt, F.

Germany: neighbourhood centres – a complex issue, 53-72.

These articles consider the ways in which the role of neighbourhood centres have changed. Different approaches to planning neighbourhood centres which integrate with contemporary urban forms are exemplified in the articles.

Germany, Neighbourhood retailing, Sweden

8/6

Smoyer-Tomic, K., Spence, J. and Amrhein, C.

Food deserts in the Prairies? Supermarket accessibility and neighbourhood need in Edmonton, Canada,

**Professional Geographer**, 58(3), 2006, 307-326. (Email: [Karen.tomic@ualberta.ca](mailto:Karen.tomic@ualberta.ca))

Two hypotheses were tested for Edmonton, Alberta. The first was whether supermarket accessibility is lower in inner city areas than in suburban areas and the second is that accessibility is poorer in low-income areas than in affluent areas. Minimum distance approaches and coverage were used in calculating accessibility. The relationships proved to be more complex and although the general hypotheses were not supported there were some food deserts or unsupportive food environments which were identified. Inner city gentrification is a partial explanation of the unevenness of provision.

Canada, Food deserts

8/7

Staehele, L. and Mitchell, D.

USA's destiny. Regulating space and creating community in American shopping malls,

**Urban Studies**, 43, 2006, 977-992.

Shopping malls and town squares represent very different types of space to the public. Whilst the desertion of many town squares had changed these the malls do not offer the same as the traditional public square. It is regulated and although it may claim to offer community this should be differentiated from public as community is more exclusive.

Urban environment, US

## 9. PRACTITIONER LITERATURE

9/1

Acres, J.

Maintaining urban fabric is not as simple as saying no to retail giants,  
**Planning** 6/10/06, 4.

Acres exposes some points about PPS6 such as the likely incompatibility of sustainability and the realities of the outcomes of PPS6 and the difficulties local authorities have in implementing PPS6 due to lack of resources and expertise.

PPS6

9/2

Allport, D.

The UK high street: current issues and their implications,

**Journal of Retail and Leisure Property**, 5(1), 2006, 2-16. (Email:  
[dallport@geraldev.com](mailto:dallport@geraldev.com) )

A review of the main consumer, economic and sector trends affecting high street performance. The momentum of existing trends and of existing planning policy will curtail change in the high street. Planning is described as future proofing.

Town centre

9/3

Blackman, D.

Internet leads retail futures,  
**Planning**, 28/04/06, 18

A number of expert opinions on the current supply of retail space are presented. Internet sales are having an impact on the market and the challenge is for retail property developers to cater for uses which will complement internet retailing such as specialised retailing and increased leisure uses to attract shoppers.

E-retail, Property

9/4

Callaghan, D.

Campaign groups slam proposals for incentives,  
**Planning**, 15/12/906, 15.

The Barker Review is a Treasury-inspired review and the findings reflect this bias. As a result terms such as 'incentivising' communities into development are particularly unwelcome in the planning community, although some do not interpret the policy in this way.

Barker Review

9/5

Doidge, R.

Developing a profit,

In **Centre Retailing 2007**, London: Estates Gazette, 2006, 57-59.

The scale and choice of host towns is likely to be critical in how a new shopping development will perform. Figures for pipeline development, measures of rental growth and a graph of size against rental growth provide the data for this assessment of the development market.

Property

9/6

Duncan, B.

Annual review of UK shopping centre performance,

**Journal of Retail and Leisure Property**, 5 (1), 2006, 49-69. (Email:

[bryan.duncan@donaldsons.co.uk](mailto:bryan.duncan@donaldsons.co.uk) )

This paper reviews the differentials in yields between shopping centres in different types of financial ownership.

Property, Shopping centres

9/7

Early, C.

Shoppers show caution on road pricing scheme,

**Planning**, 8/12/06, 8.

Immediate reactions by shoppers to road pricing suggest that many would respond by choosing shopping destinations which avoided areas where road charging operated.

Travel

9/8

Gillman, S.

Policy emphasises flexible retail vision,

**Planning**, 28/04/06, 14-15.

A resume of retail planning policy is given. A key shift of emphasis between PPG6 and PPS6 is seen as the onus being placed on local authorities to be much more proactive in retail planning. PPG6 was concerned with development control and many retailers have now adapted to the town centre focus by developing alternative formats. PPS6 however must be much more engaged with promoting the town centre and ensuring that development is possible in town centres.

PPG6, PPS6

9/9

Guy, C.

New retail policies for Wales,

**Planning Wales**, June 2006, 1.

The article explains the new aspects of retail planning policy for Wales explaining why the updating of policy was required. The Welsh policy does not have the guidance that England has on forward planning at the regional level. Consequently quantitative need is a major concern. The Welsh guidance is less prescriptive than the English guidance.

PPS6, Wales

9/10

Kivlehan, N.

Sole traders survive attack of the clones,

**Estates Gazette**, 25/03/06, 83.

The article makes the distinction between prime and secondary shopping areas showing how independent retailing can survive in secondary areas. Alternative ways of bringing independents into the high street are also posited within a property development context.

Property, Clone towns

9/11

Merry Hill upgrade set for endorsement,

**Planning** 28/07/6, 2

After resistance to the idea planners now favour designation of Merry Hill as a town centre.

Town centre, Merry Hill

9/12

Morris, H.

Study points out shop jobs renewal potential,

**Planning** 3/11/06, 9.

A discussion of the ways in which retailing makes a difference to local job opportunities. The importance of retail jobs for young people is underlined enhancing the role of retail in regeneration projects. There is a suggestion that PPS6 should take greater account of qualitative factors such as this.

Urban regeneration

9/13

Morrison, A.

Multiples' choice,

**Estates Gazette**, 0644, 20076, 139.

A short piece which pinpoints the issues in the debate over regional monopolies with reference to the town of Inverness which is dominated by Tesco superstores.

Inverness, Competition

9/14

Papas, C.

Brent Cross plans go public,

**Planning**, 20/10/06, 8.

A case in the debate over what can constitute a town centre. Further development at Brent Cross has been being considered. Crucial to these are a plan to make the site more integrated with its own new high street. It is suggested that this would give or should give it town centre status.

Town centre, Brent Cross

9/15

Papas, C.

Review seeks to break competition constraints,

**Planning** 24/03/06, 9.

A resume of the OFT referral of the grocery sector to the Competition Commission. The resume focuses on the land banks held by the major grocery retailers and why these exist.

Competition Commission, Food retailing

9/16

Ravenscraig wins Lords' approval,

**Scottish Planning and Environmental Law**, 118, 2006, 137-140. (see also **Scottish Planner**, 12/06, 10 and **Estates Gazette**, 0643, 2006, 41)

A review of the case for Ravenscraig to be recognised as an independent town centre. The proposal had been rejected on the basis of the sequential approach and an embittered contest between stakeholders had ensued. This was finally approved in 2006 in a landmark vote by the Lords.

NPPG8, Ravenscraig, Scotland., Town centre

9/17

Saunders, H.

The high street of the future,

In British Retail Consortium, **Yearbook 2007**, London: BRC, pp.150-152.

A scenario for the aspects of shopping which will fashion the future of the high street with an emphasis on the individuality of shops, their service experience, their participative experience and their ability to meet the emotional needs of shoppers.

Town centre

9/18

Wilson, V.

Barker lays down details for reform,

**Planning**, 8/12/06, 1.

A presumption in favour of development is the way that the Barker Report has been understood by planners. The pro-development stance would challenge existing planning policy guidance. An increase in out of town retailing is reckoned to be likely if the Barker Review is translated into policy.

Barker Review, PPS6

9/19

Wilson, V.

Sector wrestles with Barker,

**Planning**, 15/12/06, 8.

The presumption in favour of projects suggested in the Barker Report is considered by planners fearing that it will bring back planning by appeal.

Barker Review