The Institute for Retail Studies

UNIVERSITY OF STIRLING

The Retail Planning Knowledge Base
Annual Update

(Publications for 2008)

Anne Findlay and Leigh Sparks
Institute for Retail Studies
Faculty of Management
University of Stirling
STIRLING FK9 4LA, SCOTLAND
Tel: (01786) 467384
E-mail: Leigh.Sparks@stir.ac.uk
a.m.findlay@stir.ac.uk
Website www.irs.stir.ac.uk

April 2009

CONTENTS

COMMENTARY

SECTIONS

COMMENTARY

Commentary

This 2008 knowledge base update is one of the shorter updates we have produced. There would appear to be a limited amount of academic material with relevance to retail planners. This reflects the policy stasis and probably the lack of a good evidence base from which to work. We have noted this before but the issue remains no less crucial, as reiterated by Wood et al. (1/1) by Findlay and Sparks (7/8).

This update has focused primarily on non-theoretical, i.e. more practical research, but awareness of theoretical research occurring amongst urban researchers has informed the commentary. It is, inevitably, hard to interest practitioners in engaging with abstract material and businesses are primarily interested in ensuring profitability. However, how we think about or conceptualise town centres matters all the more as the emphasis on them as the primary retail location is strengthened and as the more qualitative aspects of planning impacts of retail developments are evaluated. There are, for example, compelling conceptual arguments to move from articulating town centre issues in terms of 'ill health' to a more positive attitude about town centres as being in the process of 'becoming' through a defined positive trajectory. Practitioners however do not like the language of cities as 'dreams' or imagination. But community involvement, which is often cultural and 'fuzzy', has been shown to have enhanced the success of some major projects including Cabot Circus in Bristol (7/16).

More practically perhaps during 2008 the Competition Commission (5/7) published its final report and the Communities and Local Government department published proposed revisions to Planning Policy Statement 6 (PPS6) (5/2). However there remains no real final conclusions for either!

Competition and Planning

In May 2008 the Competition Commission published its final report on the groceries sector entitled '**Groceries Market Investigation: Final Report**' (5/7). Whilst overall (controversially to some) seeing an overall competitive market, it proposed a number of remedies for identified local monopolies. They sought to introduce policies which would overcome what it viewed as planning obstacles to competition in the sector. Restrictive covenants would be ended. The Commission stepped back from recommending that ‘land banks’ be sold off. It however proposed a competition test which would be the responsibility of the Office of Fair Trading. This test would assess whether there was a local monopoly and would not permit another store of the same fascia to be opened within a given drive time distance of a pre-existing store.

In June 2008 Tesco lodged an appeal against the outcome of the Competition Commission (5/5) on the grounds that the proposed competition test was not a proportional response and could have unintended negative effects. Evidence was heard in November 2008. The account of that evidence provided an insight into the Competition Commission thinking and in particular their decision not to force operators to sell off stores in areas where they had a local monopoly. Essentially they considered this unreasonable and saw their preferred option as more proportionate, both as a corrective and preventative mechanism. By February 2009 the Appeals Tribunal (5/6) decided in favour of Tesco. They did not challenge the concept of a competition test and thought such a test was workable. They agreed, however, that the Competition Commission had failed to demonstrate the costs and benefits of the proposed test in a way which demonstrated that it was a proportional response as they had not presented sufficient evidence on the positive and negative impacts of the test. The Government has remained relatively silent on the issue so the issue could resurface (5/8).

The UK has not been alone in investigating competition in the groceries sector. In Australia (8/1) the use of new business models (e.g. discount stores) was seen as one market adjustment which had already taken place. In the UK of course the discount sector was not considered to be in the same competitive market as the major grocery retailers and indeed the proposed competition test was not to apply to the discount sector. With a recession in the UK, there is much repositioning with major grocery retailers increasing their discount and value ranges and an expansion of the discount sector (4/4, 9/8). It seems odd that discounters are not in the same market. In Ireland a similar investigation by the competition authorities also identified barriers to entry in the planning system (8/3). They proposed that size capping should be removed as a planning consideration and that discrimination against discounters should be lifted. As in Australia some consideration of new competition is suggested as being important to the retail health of an area. The Irish suggested that appeals by competitors which both slow down the planning process and can favour incumbents should be restricted. They urged a more positive attitude towards discount retailers. In both the Australian and Irish cases the very different view of the discount sector from the view taken in the UK would seem to reflect a different approach to what constitutes the groceries market. Perhaps, however, this requires some re-evaluation in the UK to better reflect business models in the retail sector as well as the realities of consumer shopping patterns. The impact on new consumer choices in terms of fascia and the resulting patterns of store switching are important in thinking about the impact of any competition test on shopping patterns and the dominance of individual operators. Store switching however is an under-researched area (6/2, 6/3).

The effect of planning on competition in the sector has been an academic theme in 2008. Sadun looked at the relationship between planning regulation and the independent sector, defined as non-specialist retailers (5/14, 5/15). The paper argues that the restrictive planning regime has actually been worse for independent retailers as it has forced independent and multiple retailers into the same locations, whereas previously they occupied different locations. The expansion of multiple retailers into convenience stores in the high street has meant that they come into direct competition with independents who were already there. Griffith and Harmgart showed retail planning had restricted entry to the sector of large retail outlets and had favoured entry of mid-sized retail outlets (5/9). Mid-sized outlets have come more directly into competition with smaller retailers. They suggest the cost of planning and thus store choice to consumers has been overstated. Moreno highlights the Spanish system where there is regional differentiation in retail planning policy (8/7, 8/8). The research contrasts the effects of different types of planning policy in different regions, with reference to productivity in the sector and the relative positions of incumbents and new entrants. Lower levels of regulation appear to be associated with higher productivity. The potential to adapt to changing regulation was shown to favour larger retailers who were more able to adapt than smaller operators or new entrants.

In the UK lobbyists for small convenience retailers are disappointed by the findings of the Competition Commission and the success of the Tesco appeal. They had been hoping for a clampdown on the expansion of larger retailers or even a break-up of

Tesco. Research suggests on the one hand that some planning measures could have actually disadvantaged small shops and on the other that the changing structure of the market means that every business has to maximise its distinctiveness which in the case of small shops may be their customer orientation (3/4, 8/6).

PPS6

The Communities and Local Government department has been considering its revised version of PPS6. The planning White Paper (**Planning for a Sustainable Future: White Paper)** made a recommendation that the need test should be abandoned in PPS6. A revised PPS6 for consultation was published in July 2008 (5/2). Following the consultation period the CLG published a paper giving the responses to the proposed new version of PPS6 (5/3). At present it is not clear what timetable there is for publication of a final version of a revised PPS6. Some of the delays have arisen as a result of the lack of a decision in the early part of the year concerning the locus of responsibility for any proposed competition test. The Royal Town Planning Institute made it very clear that they considered that choice of retail operator was not a possible planning consideration. Planners, they asserted, could not get involved in judging between operators as this challenged the fundamental basis of planning and indeed would have required a change in the law. This was accepted by the Competition Commission who finally opted for Office of Fair Trading responsibility for the proposed competition test.

The revised version of PPS6 as published in July 2008 removes the need test. It places more consideration on qualitative impacts and greater emphasis on the potential benefits of retail development in terms of employment and regeneration. The new non-need test is likely to make some consideration of capacity assessment (9/1). The intention however is that the new policy reduces the chance of unintended negative economic effects (5/12). Planners responsible for retail-led regeneration had cogently argued that even if PPS6 did not intend to restrict regeneration, it had in effect done so (7/3, 7/1). However the revised version of PPS6 as published was criticised as there are no details of the new impact test which it proposed (9/5, 9/11). This makes it hard to evaluate whether or not it will be effective and what the effects might be for future retail development (9/2). Much remains unknown, but it is acknowledged that both at the development planning stage and in response to proposals which do not conform to development plans, the evidence base required will be considerably greater than that required to meet the demands of the need test. It is therefore entirely unclear whether local authorities actually have the type of data or the manpower to acquire and analyse the data needed (5/12).

A new impact test will demand data as will the development plan process where retail impacts have to be considered in deciding where retail development can take place. Both Findlay and Sparks and the Accessible Retail report underscore the importance of benchmarking and explanation for understanding what is actually happening by comparing different outcomes in similar circumstances (7/8, 5/1). This is hard to achieve by individual places alone and thus there is a need for a more coordinated approach to data, with standardised definition and data which are potentially comparable (7/1, 7/12). We need a much better baseline understanding. This would enable the next 'layer' of research questions so critical to understanding how to make successful town centres to be asked.

The title of the CLG press release on the new revised PPS6 was: 'Tougher test to safeguard small shops and curb clone towns' (5/2). There is an implicit belief here that by focusing new development in town and edge of centres that this will have the effect of improving trading for small independent retailers. Research, however, does not support this. The RTPI consultation response reflects this, with their statements that making town centres work will require more than the revised PPS6 (5/13). In the academic literature some of these issues have been taken up (see below).

It would seem that the town centre first emphasis will be maintained and that the final PPS6 will seek to ensure, through the new impact test and through the sequential test, that this is so. There remains work to be done on matching PPS6 and the regional spatial strategies (RSS) which are concerned with networks of centres (see NRPF newsletter, May 2008). Key to the new PPS6 will of course be the way that the development plan has been researched in terms of where new retail development can be best accommodated and whether this matches well with the needs of the local market or competitively with the network of centres (4/6, 4/7, 7/11).

Town Centres

The emphasis of PPS6 continues to focus new development in town centres. There is an implicit assumption that this will be enough to ensure that town centres are successful places. It is far from clear, however, that this is the case. PPS6 will equally not ensure the well being of the small shop sector or prevent the expansion of multiples into town centres across the country. Researchers are still debating what the impacts of different types of development have actually been, rather than what they are thought to have been. Proponents of regional shopping centres and out of town warehouse developments argue that these have not necessarily impacted negatively on town centres (5/1, 9/4). They contend that accommodating some types of retail space in town centres would not be appropriate or enhance town centre success. There is an increasing awareness in the literature of the limitations of planning policy statements to achieve some of the changes which might be required to facilitate town centre success. Other measures such as CPOs are critical to site assembly and it is acknowledged that there are still difficulties in this (9/10). There are many aspects of town centres which remain unregulated and difficult to change through planning policies as they are currently envisioned. Clearly the governance of town centres and the potential of BIDs have been seen as one answer to these issues. CLG (7/4) has drawn up a new guide for managing town centre partnerships, but its focus is management oriented rather than thinking about whether the necessary changes can be achieved within the regulatory, administrative and fiscal frameworks.

Research on shopper's attitudes to choice of shopping location cite the importance of retail mix (3/8, 6/6, 6/7, 6/8). A recent report from the British Council for Shopping Centres underlined the importance of retail mix in the success of medium sized and smaller towns (4/2). Within shopping centres this can be much more easily controlled both in terms of choice of operators and in their location within the centre. This is not possible within town centres. In London the mayor suggested using Section 106 agreements to make provision for small independent retailers but this is thought to be outwith the scope of Section 106 agreements (9/12). Equally some BIDs groups are considering becoming involved in influencing retail mix (7/15).

The planning presumption in favour of town centre retail locations has always been based on the fact that these provide accessible and inclusive spaces. That ‘inclusiveness’ is almost antithetical to planned development within town centres and organisation of town centres by groups other than users. Of course the diversity of users in a town centre creates a much greater diversity of user needs. Different arrangements of the town centre can radically impact on how successful a town centre is in meeting these needs. Research on town centre layout and how people interact with the town centre have illustrated this (2/2, 7/14, 6/5). Studies of the use of public space have demonstrated how places become what their users make them (7/17). Equally, although in a genre of literature not easily translated into practice, there are theories of how the town centre is portrayed in the media both locally and nationally and in the language of planning which create images of the town centre, who it is for, and what it is like. These images which often perpetuate the ‘ill-health’ of the town centre image can easily be damaging and self-sustaining.

In many ways the question of what constitutes a successful town centre remains unanswered (7/8). Indeed as eco towns emerge the question is being asked anew. From a policy perspective achieving great town centres is even more challenging. It is clear that PPS6 cannot achieve change on its own. Imaginative ways of using BIDs (8/5) and consideration of policies used in other countries (eg the example in the update of formula business ordinances in the US to control against cloning (8/9)) could be explored further. Emerging ideas include the Conservative Party concept of community hubs with a community rather than business emphasis but whether they are workable remains uncertain (7/5). Fiscal changes are also in process with the permitting of business rate supplements (7/15). Some commentators have been calling for changes in rates assessment for businesses in view if the recessionary environment (9/6). Changes to rating systems might have potential as influence on the types of retailers able to operate in town centres. But the core questions remain: what is a great town centre and how do we achieve and sustain it?

Looking Forward

As recession has deepened, new questions are arising. There are immediate concerns over whether the considerable new floorspace opened in 2008 can be filled and whether future projects are likely to be put on hold (7/9, 9/9). There are planning implications from this. For example Section 106 agreements are not fulfilled if projects are shelved leaving planners without facilities on which they were relying (7/9). There are also considerations as to the extent to which even policy itself has been predicated on expansion rather than on contraction of the market or market adjustment to value retailing for example.

Over the next year, the key final outcomes of both the proposed PPS6 and the Competition Commission and government responses to the issue of the competition test proposal are due. For town centres, we need to know more in terms of how people use the spaces and how the spaces can be matched better to the diversity of consumer identities and needs. In research terms this requires more research and a better translation of theoretical research into practice. It also requires a better awareness of the way different retail propositions are located within the market and, as recession has shown, within the business environment. This is important if vulnerabilities are to be recognised. It is clear that town centre success requires robust retail planning, but that this alone cannot deliver successful town centres.

RETAIL PLANNING KNOWLEDGE BASE UPDATE 2009
(Material published during 2008)

1. GENERAL TEXTS

1/1
Wood, S., Adams, R., Lowe, M. and Neely, A.
A scoping study of contemporary and future challenges in the UK retail sector,
ESRC Business Engagement Project, 2008, 96p.
Available online from:
http://www.aimresearch.org/uploads/File/pdf/Projects/Retail%20Sector%20Report%20and%20Addendum.pdf
Email: sm.wood@surrey.ac.uk

This paper is a product of the ESRC engagement with business initiative. The intention is to highlight business demand for ESRC research identifying what research exists and what needs to be commissioned. Section 3.2 of the paper is concerned with planning. Key research questions include before and after studies, linkages between retailing and community, concepts of catchments and what type of provision consumer want to see. A brief literature review (mainly studies by geographers) is included. The report affirmed the NRPF position that a robust evidence base is still lacking.

2. THEORETICAL MODELS

2/1
Dearden, J. and Wilson, A.
An analysis system for exploring urban retail phase transitions,
London: University College London, 2008, 32p. Working Paper Series Paper 140.
Available online from: www.casa.ucl.ac.uk

This paper is predicated on the fact that retail structures change radically at critical points. The evolution of urban structure can be modelled by identifying phase transitions. Recognition of these phase changes and their positive or negative impacts would aid the planning process. Although work in this field has been carried out before, the paper offers a much more advanced visualisation method which gives a more immediate way to recognise the spatial patterning of these changes. The paper uses a worked example for the London area.

London, Modelling, Retail structure

2/2
Zhu, W. and Timmermans, H.
Cut-off models for the go-home' decision of pedestrians in shopping streets,
Environment and Planning B 35, 2008, 248-260. Email:
h.j.p.timmermans@bwk.tue.nl

Modelling pedestrian behaviour traditionally involved attempting to replicate the patterning found in reality but often with little understanding of why the patterns occurred. This paper seeks to move away from complex modelling to something faster, more frugal but insightful and useful. It suggests that bounded rationality modelling using much simpler rules based on identifiable cues might be a better approach. Although the worked example is in China the methodology and theory have relevance to thinking about successful town centres more widely and in particular in developing practical modelling approaches to pedestrian behaviour such as the decision to go home as used here.

Models, Pedestrians

3. RETAIL FORMATS

3/1
Alexander, A., Cryer, D. and Wood, S. Location planning in charity retailing, **International Journal of Retail and Distribution Management**, 36(7), 2008, 536-550. Email: a.alexander@surrey.ac.uk

This article identifies key aspects of location strategy for charity retailing. It highlights the ways in which locational decisions in this sector are similar or differ from those used in other aspects of retail location modelling. For example the involvement of donors, customers and volunteers all differentiate the sector. Worked examples are included.

Charity retailing

3/2
Communities and Local Government
New inquiry and call for evidence: traditional retail markets,
London: Communities and Local Government, Available online from:
www.parliament.uk/parliamentary_committees/clg/clg_200708_pn711.cfm

The inquiry into traditional markets will focus on change in the sector, social and economic importance of markets, planning and licensing issues and support for market. The National Retail Planning Forum submission can be viewed at www.nrpf.org/ht_markets.htm

Markets

3/3
Jones, P., Comfort, D. and Hillier, D.
Shopping for a new experience,
Town and Country Planning, 78(1), 2009, 42-44. Email: pjones@glos.ac.uk

An introduction into experience retailing with a discussion of whether experience retailing will be resilient in the present economic climate and whether it leads to sustained competitive advantage.

Experience retailing

3/4
Megicks, P. and Warnaby, G.
Market orientation and performance in small independent retailers in the UK,
International Review of Retail, Distribution and Consumer Research, 18(1), 2008, 105-119. Email: phil.megicks@plymouth.ac.uk

The paper considers the position of small independent retailers in the UK. The article poses the question as to whether small independent retailers can capitalise on their potential to achieve superior market understanding. Exhibiting market orientation has the potential to give them a competitive edge in a crowded market. The results of a survey of 2000 independent businesses across the UK are reported. Customer satisfaction and orientation were found to be more important than a focus on competition in determining the success of small independent retailers. A firm's internal capabilities to be customer oriented was more important than the negative effects of the competitive environment in determining success.

Small shops

3/5
Stephenson, G., Lev, L. and Brewer, L.
When things don't work: some insights into why farmers' markets close,
Oregon State University, 2008, 17p. (Special Report 1073-E) Available online from:
http://extension.oregonstate.edu/catalog/pdf/sr/sr1073-e.pdf

A study of farmers' markets in the US state of Oregon seeks to discover reasons for market failure. Markets which survived for five years were unlikely to close with most markets closing in the first year. Long established markets still struggled to maintain performance. There was a high turnover in managers of farmers' markets which is not can be either positive or negative but high turnover is stress for the market and uncertainty for the traders. Larger markets were found to generate more revenue as there were more stall holders and fees were generally higher.

Farmers' markets

3/6
Stephenson, G., Lev, L. and Brewer, L.
Understanding the link between farmers' market size and management organization,
Oregon State University, 2007, 21p. (Special Report 1082-E) Available online from:
http://extension.oregonstate.edu/catalog/pdf/sr/sr1082.pdf

A review of how farmers' markets are managed and organised. The required tasks for managers to perform are outlined. As markets increase in size more sophisticated management structures are needed. Different market sizes need different management tools. There is a critical point where there is a transition from small to larger markets in terms of management structures.

Farmers' markets

3/7
Trevor Wood Associates
The definitive guide to retail and leisure parks 2008,
High Wycombe: Trevor Wood Associates, 2008, 287p. Web site:
www.trevorwoodassociates.co.uk

The 2008 edition gives a market overview of the sector with league tables of top centres, top rental locations and leading retailers. The main section of the volume is a listing of retail parks in the different regions of the UK with pipeline projects also listed.

Retail warehouse parks

3/8
Whyatt, G.
Which factory outlet centre? The UK consumer's selection criteria,
Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services, 15, 2008, 315-323. Email:
gewhyatt@brookes.ac.uk

The results of a questionnaire survey of visitors to factory outlets are presented. It is shown that consumers are willing to travel further to visit stores selling their preferred brands and that brand availability is the key factor in the selection of outlets to visit. Many combined the shopping trip with other leisure or tourist type activity. Implications for prospective tenants and managers of factory outlet centres are that the brand representation will be critical in determining visitor numbers.

Factory outlets

4. RETAIL LOCATIONS

4/1
Allan, M.
Branding new kinds of places: the example of experience retail centres,
The Journal of the Medinge Group, August 2008. Available online from:
http://medinge.org/journal/2008/08

Although entertainment and leisure add-ons have become part of many shopping centres it is suggested that the future lies in a more integrated shopping/leisure combination. These experience retail centres engage the consumer and provide an environment which attracts consumers with cognate interests. An example is the development of the Olympia in London as a creative place which will combine creative retail facilities and activities building on local specialisms in the performance arts.

London, Olympia, Shopping centres

4/2
British Council for Shopping Centres
Medium-sized and smaller towns – raising the game,
London: BCSC, 2009.
See summary of report: Blueprint unveiled for successful smaller towns, **Planning** 3/03/09.

Smaller towns have been declining in favour of larger centres. Targeting food retail investment in smaller towns is recognised in the report as key to clawing back trade and providing an impetus to retailing in smaller towns. There is demand in smaller towns for an improved retail offer but achieving the correct tenant mix is essential. Case studies are used to show how retailing can be turned around in small towns.

Market towns

4/3
Findlay, A. and Sparks, L.
Weaving new retail and consumer landscapes in the Scottish Borders,
Journal of Rural Studies, 24(1), 2008, 86-97. Email: a.m.findlay@stir.ac.uk

This paper uses data from surveys over a 20 year period in the Scottish Borders. This permits an examination of consumer switching behaviour. Although clawback was used to justify new developments in the Scottish Borders the outcome has been that the network of centres within the Scottish Borders has become increasingly focused on the town of Galashiels.

Scottish Borders, Food retailing, Network, Switching

4/4
Guy, C.
Out of town slump,
Town and Country Planning, 77(10), 2008, 394-395. Email: Guy@cardiff.ac.uk

A resume of how the credit crunch is likely to impact on out of town retailing. Food stores are continuing to be built in out of town locations and the pipeline is likely to remain relatively unaffected. Discount stores have seen market share rise and are planning a rapid expansion to new sites. Retail parks were already struggling and where they have only bulk goods consent are likely to see increased vacancies. In terms of PPS6 if a competition test came into place this would favour the discount sector over other retailers. There might be pressure to relax the bulk only consents on retail parks.

Out of town retailing

4/5
Pitt, M. and Musa, Z.
Towards defining shopping centres and their management systems,
Journal of Retail and Leisure Property, 8(1), 2008, 39-55. Email:
Z.N.Musa@2007.ljmu.ac.uk

A review of how shopping centre management has evolved in relationship to ownership and functions of shopping centres. A distinction is made between shopping centre as property and as investment. There is discussion of the impact of REITs. Fragmentation of management in shopping centres is seen as inhibiting innovation.

Shopping centres

4/6
Powe, N. and Hart,T.
Market towns: understanding and maintaining their functionality,
Town Planning Review, 79(4), 2008, 347-370. Email n.a.powe@ncl.ac.uk

A cluster analysis provides a schema of market town functionality which is used as a framework for discussing their role as service centres.

Market towns

4/7
Powe, N. and Gunn, S.
Housing development in market towns: making a success of local service centres,
Town Planning Review, 79(1), 2008, 125-148. Email n.a.powe@ncl.ac.uk

Service provision is no longer a function of settlement size and increased housing will not necessarily result in increased use or prevent the loss of local retail facilities. Food retailing and non-food retailing show different patterns and much depends on the distances and provision in neighbouring competing centres.

Market towns

5. RETAIL PLANNING PRACTICE

5/1
Accessible Retail
Retail impact and factors affecting vitality and viability of town centres. (Part one report),
Saffron Walden: Accessible Retail, 2007, 56p. Available online from:
www.accessibleretail.co.uk

Accessible Retail commissioned GVA Grimley to undertake a piece of research to investigate the causes of town centre decline and prosperity. The first part of this research involved a literature review and some case study material. The second part (not yet published) sets out to identify a set of principles to inform future policy in PPS6. Accessible Retail began this work from the premise that the relationship between in and out of town retail development is not as simplistic as commonly assumed. The first part of the research highlights the scale of retail development which has taken place and challenges the view that this would have been best accommodated in town centres as it would have required a complete rebuilding of town centres. It also shows that all town centres are not affected in the same way and to the same extent by out of town retail development. Bulky goods schemes will not impact in the same way as a fashion centre. Equally the size of town relative to the size of the scheme will also be important. Successful town centres are also seen as more than just retail with their relative success reflecting the extent to which other investment has been forthcoming.

PPS6, Town centre

5/2
Communities and Local Government
Proposed changes to Planning Policy Statement 6: Planning for town centres.
London: CLG, 2008, 82p. Available online from:
http://www.communities.gov.uk/documents/planningandbuilding/pdf/3197981.pdf
See also press release: Tougher test to safeguard small shops and curb clone towns,
http://www.communities.gov.uk/news/corporate/889421

The primary proposed change which is incorporated in this document is the removal of the need test. All parts of the policy affected by the removal of the need test have been altered to accommodate this change. Additionally the document includes statements regarding a new impact test and what this might include in terms of key factors and wider issues. The document was published before the government's response to the Competition Commission recommendation for a competition test. This document includes the questions put out for the consultation phase.

PPS6

5/3
Communities and Local Government
Consultation responses to 'Proposed changes to Planning Policy Statement 6: Planning for Town Centres (PPS6)
London: CLG, 2009, 25p. Available online from:
http://www.communities.gov.uk/publications/planningandbuilding/pps6responses
Town and Country Planning Association
Proposed changes to Planning Policy Statement 6 – Planning for town centres,
London: Town and Country Planning Association, 2008, 7p. Available online from:
http://www.tcpa.org.uk/consultation_files/Responses2008/20081003_TCPAresponsePPS6.pdf
TCPA gives broad welcome to PPS6 proposals,
Town and Country Planning 77(10), 2008, p391.
Association of Convenience Stores
Planning; town centres first,
London: ACS, 2008 Available online from:
www.acs.org.uk/en/lobbying/issues/planning
Royal Town planning Institute
Proposed changes to Planning Policy Statement 6: Planning for town centres,
London: RTPI, 2008 Available online from: www.rtpi.org.uk
Accessible Retail
Consultation on proposed changes to PPS6: Planning for town centres,
Saffron Walden: Accessible Retail, 2008. Available online from:
www.accessibleretail.co.uk

Communities and Local Government have published an analysis of the responses to the draft published in July 2008. These are discussed chapter by chapter. They are disaggregated by user (developer, retailer, planning authority etc). They show broad support for the continued town centre first approach. They express some concern about the lack of retail planning guidance for areas not in town centres and for the lack of details about the supporting guidance on impact tests which will determine workability and effectiveness. Concern is also expressed about costs, availability of data and the possible delays which might occur with a more complex process. There is also some concern about how the town centres first policy fits with other planning guidance. A number of full texts of responses have been included above.

PPS6

5/4
Communities and Local Government
Extent of retail development taking place in England 2006,
London: CLG, 2008 Planning Statistical Release, 3p. Available online from:
http://www.communities.gov.uk/publications/corporate/statistics/retaildevelopment2006

This statistical release gives information on retail floorspace for 2006 by location based on VOA bulk class retail category and using the ACTA town centre boundary definitions. Of the 1.2 million square metres of floorspace 26% was in town centres and 42% in town or edge of centre locations. The overall trend shows the shift over time to town and edge of centre locations.

Property

5/5
Competition Appeal Tribunal
Between Tesco Plc and The Competition Commission and Waitrose Limited, Marks and Spencer Plc, Asda Stores Limited, Association of Convenience Stores
London: Competition Appeal Tribunal, 2008. Available online from:
http://www.catribunal.org.uk/237-2053/1104-6-8-08-Tesco-Plc.html

The documents in relation to Tesco's appeal concerning the competition test aspect of the Competition Commission findings are available. Tesco make the case that the proposed competition test would be unlawful, that it is not adequately supported by the facts presented in the report, it is a disproportionate measure and that it would be irrational. The documents include the summary of Tesco's case and the transcripts of the three days of the appeal held in November 2008. Presentations from each of the parties are included. The discussion offers a useful insight into the thinking behind the Competition Commission report.

Competition, Food retailing, PPS6, Tesco

5/6
Competition Appeal Tribunal
Tesco Plc v Competition Commission
London; Appeals Tribunal, 2009, 57p. Available online from:
Summary: www.catribunal.org.uk/238-3643/Judgment-.html
Full report: www.catribunal.org.uk/files/Judg_1104_Tesco_04032009.pdf See also: **Planning** 4/03/09.

The Tribunal unanimously decided that the Competition Commission had failed to take adequate consideration of certain matters relevant to its recommendation regarding the competition test proposal. Specifically it had not taken adequate consideration of the proportionality issue as it had not provided a proper cost-benefit analysis of the test.

Competition, Food retailing, PPS6, Tesco

5/7
Competition Commission
Groceries market investigation: Final report,
London: Competition Commission, 2008, 266p. 978-0-11-703854 Available online from: http://www.competition-commission.org.uk/rep_pub/reports/2008/fulltext/538.pdf
Fyson, A.
The red herring of store competition,
Planning 25 April 2008.
Edwards, M. and Martin, J.
There's something new in store,
Estates Gazette, 7 June 2008, 166.
McClary, S.
Getting carried away,
Estates Gazette Retail, April, 2008, 43-44.
Sector fears retail burden,
Planning, 6/05, 2008, 1.

This is the final report of the Competition Commission into the groceries sector. It upholds the concept of a competition test with the idea of encouraging new entrants in concentrated markets and preventing future concentration of markets and the development of local monopolies. It also upholds the ending of covenants and exclusivity agreements on land. The report proposes that the OFT should become a statutory consultee for all large new grocery applications or extensions taking floorspace to more than 1000 sq metres.

Competition, Food retailing

5/8
Department for Business Enterprise and Regulatory Reform
The supply of groceries in the UK: The government response to the Competition Commission market investigation,
London: BERR, 2008, 8p. Available online from:
http://www.berr.gov.uk/files/file47089.pdf

The response outlines the issues which the government can take action on. It notes that planning is a devolved matter and that responses will reflect the positions of the different administrations. With regard to the competition test the response by the government states that they will reflect further on the issue noting that changes to PPS6 are already underway. The response does not commit to the introduction of a competition test and says that it intends to respond more fully on this at a later date.

Competition, Food retailing

5/9
Griffith, R. and Harmgart, H.
Supermarkets and Planning Regulation,
London: Centre for Economic Policy Research, 2008, 28p. Discussion Paper Series, 6713. Email: r.griffith@ifs.org.uk

This paper presents an econometric model which attempts to estimate the cost to consumers of restrictive planning policies on large supermarket and superstore development. It adopts a dualistic approach to shopping formats distinguishing one stop shopping and top-up shopping equating these with large and small stores. Institute of Grocery Distribution data is used as the main source of store based data. This is combined with local authority data on planning approvals and a range of demographic data. Whilst regulation is shown to have restricted entry of large store formats encouraging mid-sized formats it is suggested that these have a greater competitive impact on the smaller stores. Equally it is suggested that the economic impact for consumers has been overstated.

Food retailing

5/10
Guy, C.
Another boring article about the European Union,
Town and Country Planning, 78(1), 2009, 16-18. Email: Guy@cardiff.ac.uk

A discussion of what the EU Services Directive might mean for retail planning in the UK. Comparisons with EU policies such as the difference between and national and regional based policies in northern and southern Europe is discussed. Articles 14 and 15 are most significant and might preclude economic tests such as the need test. There is no evidence that current UK thinking has considered how this directive might impact on retail planning. Trading impact might no longer be a major criterion. It seems that current test based policies might not be acceptable.

EU, PPS6

5/11
Jones, P., Comfort, D. and Hillier, D.
UK retailing through the looking glass,
International Journal of Retail and Distribution Management, 36(7), 2008, 564-570. Email: pjones@glo.ac.uk

A commentary on the volume Retail Futures (see previous update for abstract) (www.forumforthefuture.org.uk/files/11937%20FFF%20Retail%20Futures%20WEB.pdf) focussing on sustainability and retailing. The role of retail planning and the wider planning environment are seen as critical if sustainability is to be a key factor in shaping retail futures.

Sustainability

5/12
National Retail Planning Forum and Local Government Association
Retail planning: a review,
London: National Retail Planning Forum, 2008. Available online from: www.nrpf.org/May2008_Manchester_event.htm

This conference was held in Manchester in May 2008. The presentations by Andrew Smith, Cliff Guy, Mario Wolf and Miles Davis are available. The presentation by Guy looks at the tools available to planners, what they need, who is going to provide them and what future policy changes might demand. The paper by Wolf gives a Communities and Local Government view of what is needed to improve the effectiveness of PPS6 discussing how the need test will be dropped and a wider range of considerations become part of a future impact test.

PPS6

5/13
Royal Town Planning Institute
A briefing on the proposed changes to Planning Policy Statement 6: Planning for town centres,
London: RTPI., 2008. Available online from: www.rtpi.org.uk

Presentations from this event are available. Participants included government, property and industry representatives. The presentations highlight perceived changes and their consequences.

PPS6

5/14
Sadun, R.
Does planning regulation protect independent retailers,
Centrepiece, Autumn 2008, 5p. Email: r.sadun@lse.ac.uk

This brief article takes presents key findings from Sadun's work on the impact of changes in planning legislation on the strategy adopted by big chains and the subsequent employment impacts in the independent sector. The article argues that more big retail outlets may benefit independent retailers whilst multiple retailer involvement in smaller units has a negative effect.

Employment, Food retailing

5/15

Sadun, R.
Does planning regulation protect independent retailers?
London: London School of Economics and Political Science, Centre for Economic Performance, 2008, 39p. Centre for Economic Performance Discussion Paper 888
Available online from: http://ideas.repec.org/p/cep/cepdps/dp0888.html Email: r.sadun@lse.ac.uk

This paper uses employment data to explore the connection between planning regulation of food retailing and employment growth in independent retailers. It is argued that between 1998 and 2004 15% of the loss of jobs in independent retailers was due to the restrictive planning environment. This was explained by the fact that increasingly medium sized retailers belonging to national chains were competing with independent retailers to a greater extent than they would have been in large format stores. Data used was based on SIC 512 'non-specialised retailers' and so it should be noted that the study does not take account of specialised food retailers.

Employment, Food retailing

6. CONSUMER CULTURE

6/1
Allard, T., Babin, B. and Chebat, J.-C.
When income matters: customers evaluation of shopping malls' hedonic and utilitarian orientations,
Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services, 16, 2009, 40-49. Email: bbabin@latech.edu

In an increasingly competitive market shopping centres seek to position and differentiate themselves. This article uses survey data to identify differences in patronage between shopping centres. It develops a model which is predicated on the difference between hedonic and utilitarian shopping. From this a segmentation tool is developed in order to assist in shopping centre positioning and marketing.

Shopping centres

6/2
Cummins, S., Findlay, A., Petticrew, M. and Sparks, L.
Retail-led regeneration and store-switching behaviour,
Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services 15, 2008, 288-295. Email: a.m.findlay@stir.ac.uk

This research article emerges from the study of the St Rollox regeneration Tesco store in Glasgow. Findings in this article confirm that a new hypermarket in a regeneration area will provide a socially inclusive retail facility in a deprived area. Switching levels to the store are analysed and switching patterns examined with reference to socio-demographic variables. The new store has the biggest impact in the area with the most immediate access to the store.

Food retailing, Glasgow, Store switching, Urban regeneration

6/3
Findlay, A. and Sparks, L.
"Switched": store-switching behaviours,
International Journal of Retail and Distribution Management 36(5), 2008, 375-386. Email: a.m.findlay@stir.ac.uk

Store switching is an important theme in the context of understanding competition amongst major food retailers. This article uses household survey data to assess patterns of store switching between major food retail operators in the Stirling area following the takeover of Safeway by Morrisons. Switching occurs in line with retailer segmentation profiles.

Food retailing, Stirling, Store switching

6/4
Guy, C.
No more food deserts?
Town and Country Planning, 77(4), 2008, 162-163. Email: Guy@cardiff.ac.uk

A resume of recent research on food accessibility and diet issues referring to work in Seacroft, Glasgow, Sandwell and studies for the Food Standards Agency. The study concludes that access is only one part of the diet and nutrition debate with social, cultural and family patterns also important. There remains a need to ensure access to appropriate food stores with rural areas least well served.

Food retailing

6/5
Howard, E.
Silver shopping on the UK high street,
Retail Digest, Summer 2008, p10-14.

This article is written in a popular style but it is concerned to emphasise the lack of consideration of the shopping needs of older age groups in town centres. Specifically it makes the point that the so-called silver consumers are not a homogeneous group with the same shopping needs as each other.

Consumer groups, Town centres

6/6
Teller, C.
Shopping streets versus shopping malls – determinants of agglomeration format attractiveness from the consumers' point of view,
International Review of Retail Distribution and Consumer Research, 18(4), 2008, 381-403. Email: christoph.teller@stir.ac.uk

Planned shopping centres and high streets differ in respect of the degree of potential for management. The ways in which this influences attractiveness is important in thinking about what actions can make a difference to the retail attractiveness of places. Data from a study in Vienna of planned shopping centres and high street retailing identify tenant mix as the most important variable in retail attractiveness with atmospherics as the next most important variable. Clearly in a managed shopping centre these are more easily controlled but the findings do affirm that investment in service functions will not be a sufficient condition to turn around a failing high street environment. Equally management of high streets through town centre management does not have the power to improve tenant mix although it can be a vehicle for encouraging new tenants to a centre.

Austria, Shopping centres, Town centre

6/7
Teller, C. and Reutterer, T.
The evolving concept of retail attractiveness and what makes retail agglomerations attractive when customers shop at them?
Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services, 15(3), 2008, 127-143. Email: christoph.teller@stir.ac.uk

The article reports on survey work which contrasts a high street retail location and a mall to investigate which aspects of the centre are most important in terms of centre attractiveness. Attractiveness is considered in terms of overall attractiveness, situational attractiveness and sustainable attractiveness. The approach suggests that a differentiated view of the term attractiveness is essential and that a centre must be attractive across the various dimensions of attractiveness and stages of a shopping trip.

Shopping centres

6/8
Teller, C., Reutterer, T. and Schmedlitz, P.
Hedonic and utilitarian types in evolved and created agglomerations,
International Review of Retail, Distribution and Consumer Research, 18(3), 2008, 283-309. Email: christoph.teller@stir.ac.uk

Shopping for pleasure (hedonic) and shopping for a purpose (utilitarian) represent two very different behavioural approaches to shopping. Although studied in the context of particular retailers research has not considered whether in the context of malls and shopping streets these two remain differentiated. The data presented in the paper confirms that the differential remains important and was not merely a function of socio-demographic characteristics. As retail offers of malls and streets move towards increasing the hedonic offer it is necessary to know what shoppers this offer can expect to attract. Although hedonic shoppers spent less they stayed longer.

Consumer groups

7. URBAN ENVIRONMENT

7/1
Business in the Community
Under-served markets: retail and regeneration,
London: National Retail Planning forum, 2008. Available online from:
www.nrpf.org/USM_publication.htm#PPS6_revision

A series of workshops took place around the country on the theme of retail-led urban regeneration and the policy context. The main themes of the workshops were; How retail investment in deprived areas can be encouraged; how the planning system can be used to facilitate such investment; how positive benefits can be maximised for local stakeholders. At each workshop a representative from Communities and Local Government presented their view on using PPS6 for retail-led regeneration projects. Other papers were presented on local projects with a retail regeneration theme. Together these represent a range of insightful case studies. Many of the presentations are available to download.

PPS6, Urban regeneration

7/2
Civic Trust
High street UK,
London: Civic Trust, 2008. (Briefing Paper) Available on line from:
www.civictrust.org.uk

High Street UK is a project jointly being undertaken by New Economics Foundation and the Civic Trust. It is aimed at providing a nationally coordinated approach to improve town centres. It places considerable emphasis on the presence of and participation of the small independent sector.

Small shops, Town centre

7/3
Claxton, R. and Siora, G.
Retail-led regeneration: Why it matters to our communities,
London: British Council of Shopping Centres, DTZ and Business in the Community, 2008, 56p. Available online from:
http://www.bcsc.org.uk/publication.asp?pub_id=282

This volume reviews a series of 5 case studies to ascertain what makes a successful retail-led regeneration project, how it can be best achieved, what challenges there are and how benefits can be maximised. Impacts are categorised under the following headings: accessibility to jobs and skills, living in neighbourhoods, quality of life, pride of place, accessibility, connectivity, integration and cohesion, cleaner and safer environment and business opportunities. Partnership, plan-led, trust and communication, fit for community and maximising benefits by going the extra mile are key building blocks.

Bullring, Castle Vale, Dalton Park, Feltham, Glasgow Fort, Urban regeneration

7/4
Communities and Local Government
Managing town centre partnerships; a guide for practitioners,
London: Communities and Local Government, 2008, 222p. 0978 1 4098 0567 0
Available online from:
http://www.communities.gov.uk/publications/communities/towncentrepartnerships

A substantive guide based on the experience of 21 town centres. This guide is essentially management oriented and is concerned with setting up and running town centre partnerships. It sets out the questions to be asked to determine an appropriate town centre partnership, strategy and performance. Its focus is on what different types of partnerships can achieve. Chapters include: working in partnership, stakeholder engagement, strategy and performance management and governing a town centre partnership.

Town centre

7/5
Conservative Party Commission into Small Shops in the High Street
A strategy for community hubs,
London: Conservative Parliamentary Enterprise Group, 2008, 30p.Available online from:
www.conservatives.com/~/media/Files/Downloadable%20Files/ShopsCommission_FinalReport.ashx?dl=true

This is a response to the findings of an investigation into why smaller retailers were being driven out of the high street. The report urges councils to readdress parking issues making town centres more accessible. It also urges a review of rates and rents arrangements so that smaller businesses could claim relief. The concept of a community hub enterprise area is proposed. These could take a number of different forms in terms of participation and partnership but would aim to incentivise local communities and businesses.

Town centre

7/6
Cummins S., Findlay A., Higgins C., Petticrew M., Sparks L. and Thomson H.
Reducing inequalities in health and diet: findings from a study on the impact of a food retail development,
Environment and Planning A, 40(2), 2008, 402 – 422.Email: a.m.findlay@stir.ac.uk

This article reports on the findings of a study of a food retail intervention in Springburn in Glasgow. Retail change, diet, self-reported health, perceptions of the environment and psychological health were investigated. The study observed some positive impact on the existing retail structure and weak improvements in diet and psychological health. A control area was used in order to take account of background changes.

Springburn, Diet, Regeneration, Food retailing, Glasgow, Scotland

7/7
ESRC Seminar series 2007-2008 Urban Design and British urban renaissance, Manchester: University of Manchester, 2008. Available online from: www.sed.manchester.ac.uk/research/events/seminars/urbandesign/

Presentations from this series are available online. Although the theme of the seminar was broader than retail many of the presentations do include retail projects and concern town centre spaces. For example there were presentations on Sheffield, Leeds, Manchester and Newcastle. Some of the case studies are also featured in the journal **Urban Design**.

Town centre, Urban environment

7/8
Findlay, A. and Sparks, L.
Literature review: policies adopted to support a healthy retail sector and retail led regeneration and the impact of retail on the regeneration of town centres and local high streets,
Edinburgh: Scottish Government, 2009, 47p. Available online from: www.scotland.gov.uk/socialresearch

This report had three aims: identify what a healthy/vibrant town centre/local high street looks like; identify, in the UK, what policies/approaches have been implemented to: (a) Support a healthy retail sector in local high streets and town centres, and (b) Undertake retail led regeneration; explore what impact retail has had on the regeneration (in its widest sense – social, economic and physical) of town centres and local high streets, and how this has impacted on the wider community.

Scotland, Town centre, Urban regeneration

7/9
Guy, C.
Crisis? What a crisis,
Town and Country Planning 77(7-8), 2008, 314-316. Email: Guy@cardiff.ac.uk

A large amount of new retail space came onstream in 2008. Most of it was pre-let. However it is likely that schemes not yet begun may be shelved leaving planning gain projects and regeneration projects not begun to the frustration of planners. Only the strongest retail propositions in the larger cities will be likely to go ahead meantime. Within cities new developments are leading to some parts of cities losing trade to the new developments. The economic circumstances could favour smaller scale more innovative projects.

Property

7/10
Guy, C.
Retail-led property regeneration: assessing the property outcomes,
Journal of Urban Regeneration and Renewal, 1(4), 2008, 378-88. Email: Guy@cardiff.ac.uk

This article discusses the extent to which retail-led regeneration projects act as a catalyst to other development in the area. It takes three examples from the Cardiff Bay. Retail-led regeneration did have a role in kick-starting regeneration in an area through the speed at which the development becomes a reality, the confidence it inspires and improved access to an area. Other regeneration may not follow or may not fulfil wider regeneration objectives.

Cardiff, Urban regeneration

7/11
Horton, C.
In towns in the Gateway,
Town and Country Planning, 77(10), 2008, 406-410. Web address: www.thames-gateway.org.uk

A description of how the Thames Gateway London Partnership thinks about the network of towns in the area and how the network should be developed to meet the needs of the particular groups of people who will be living there. The role of Bluewater and Lakeside is discussed and ways in which distinctiveness can be enhanced are explored.

London, Town centre

7/12
Katyoka, M. and Wyatt, P.
An investigation of the nature of vacant commercial and industrial property,
Planning Practice and Research, 23(1), 2008, 125-145. Email; peter.wyatt@uwe.ac.uk

A review of different sources of data on vacant property including retail property. A case study of Leeds is used to demonstrate the different measures of vacancy which are required to gain a proper understanding of vacancy rates by type of property. There are graphs which show trends in retail alongside other sectors such as office and warehouse property. The article makes the case for better standardisation of terms to permit benchmarking. The National Land Use Database offers new opportunities to look at make comparisons of trends across different areas and scales of analysis.
Property

7/13
Local Government Association
Urgent action needed to stop high streets becoming 'ghost towns',
London: Local Government Association, 2009. Available online from;
www.lga.gov.uk/lga/core/page.do?pageId=1653794 .

The Local Government Association carried out a survey of local authorities regarding awareness of increased vacant property in high streets. Local councils confirmed that vacant property was adversely affecting their high streets. Responses are to look at the possibilities of council management of empty shops on a temporary basis, a cut in VAT on empty shop refurbishment and other measures to reduce costs to small shops.

Town centre

7/14
Marshall, S., Jones, P. and Boujenko, N.
Planning streets as 'link and place',
Town and Country Planning, 77(2), 2008, 74-79. Email: **s.**marshall@ucl.ac.uk

A new way of looking at the function of streets attempts to distinguish between streets whose role is a transport one from those whose role is as places in a town centre. Some streets for example have a place function as retail places. Transport planners and urban planners need to work together to achieve the appropriate use of streets and to avoid loss of place.

Urban environment

7/15
Reilly, J. and Aswat, M.
Increasing investment in towns and cities,
Journal of Urban Regeneration and Renewal, 2 (3), 2008, 232-237. Email: Jacquie.reilly@atcm.org

Largely a descriptive article about ways to fund and manage town centres. It does consider whether the business rate supplement will facilitate better town centre funding or business engagement. The final section shows some of the more innovative ways that BIDs is being used not just to maintain business in town centres but to begin to change town centres.

BIDs

7/16
Tallon, A.
Mega retail-led regeneration,
Town and Country Planning, 77(3), 2008, 131-137.

A description of the Cabot Circus development in Bristol with reference to why it came about, the nature of the project and the partnership. Exclusion, gentrification, privatisation of public space and local involvement are discussed in relation to the project.

Bristol, Cabot Circus, Shopping centres

7/17
Townshend, T. and Madanipour, A.
Public space and local diversity: the case of north-east England,
Journal of Urban Design, 13(3), 2008, 317-328. Email: T.G.Townshend@ncl.ac.uk
See also Pugalis, L. Achieving place quality, **Urban Design**, Winter, 2009, 14-15.

5 case studies of public spaces created in North-east England are examined. Retail homogeneity has been cited as a problem in towns. The studies found no evidence that this was viewed as a problem. The ambience that different retailers created was cited as important with a dislike of cheap or bargain retailing. Distinctiveness of places was valued and recognised as important for competitiveness but it involved more than retailer representation. Public spaces can take on their own distinctiveness or build on traditional aspects of places to give them distinctiveness.

Town centres

7/18
Warnaby, G.
Maps and the representation of urban shopping destinations,
International Journal of Retail and Distribution Management, 36(3), 2008, 224-234. Email: gary.warnaby@liv.ac.uk

This paper introduces the ways in which town centres are represented on maps with reference to retailing. Maps are an important part of place marketing and in marketing towns as shopping destinations. Ways in which town centres are represented are discussed.

Place marketing

8. A SELECTION OF LITERATURE RELATING TO THE US AND EUROPE

8/1
Australian Competition and Consumer Commission
Report of the ACCC inquiry into the competitiveness of retail prices for standard groceries,
Canberra: Australian Competition and Consumer Commission, 2008, 457p. Available online from: www.accc.gov.au/content/index.phtml/itemId/142

The Australian competition authorities undertook a similar investigation into competitiveness in the groceries market to that undertaken in the UK. As in the UK concentration was a key issue and issues of local competition are addressed (Chapter 4). Barriers to entry and expansion are considered in chapter 9. The report recognises that there are problems in finding sites and barriers to entry although the use of new business models is recognised as a means of overcoming these difficulties. The case of Aldi is cited as an example of how this can be achieved. Incumbents may use covenant style practices to maintain monopoly positions in shopping developments. Planning and zoning laws have also been thought to restrict entry of new players and the report recommended that consideration should be given in planning as to whether a proposal brings a new player to an area.

Australia, Competition

8/2
Coca-Stefaniak, J., Radominski, S. and Ryczek, K.
Urban revitalisation and town centre management in Poland: opportunities and challenges for the 21st century,
Journal of Urban Regeneration and Renewal, 2(3), 2008, 207-215.

In Poland public funding of town centre infrastructure has been declining and increasingly there has been a need to involve private sector investors. This article assesses to what extent UK concepts of town centre management are transferable to Poland. It asks whether they will deliver the kind of revitalisation which is desired. It looks at whether the forms of partnership are as effective in bringing about change in a Polish context as in the UK context. The legacy of distrust of private investment in a municipal context has been at some levels problematic.

Poland, Town centre management

8/3
Competition Authority
The retail planning system as applied to the grocery sector, 2001-2007.
Dublin: The Competition Authority, 2008, 150p.
Grocery monitor report 3,
Dublin: Competition Authority, 2008, 7p.
Available online from:
www.tca.ie/NewsPublications/NewsReleases/NewsReleases.aspx?selected_item=225

Main report by the Irish Competition Authority on barriers to entry to the grocery sector. The report examines the framework of planning in Ireland, Irish retail planning guidelines, entry and expansion in grocery retailing in Ireland and the planning system as a barrier to entry and expansion. Retail planning is found to be restricting the grocery sector entry and expansion. A number of measures are proposed to change this: size capping should be removed, discrimination against discount retailers should be ended, competition issues should become part of the healthy check process, consumer benefits from new competition should be recognised and appeals by competitors should be limited.

Competition, Ireland

8/4
Evans Cowley, J.
Thinking outside the big box: municipal and retailer innovations in large scale retail,
Journal of Urban Design, 13(3), 2008, 329-344. Email: cowley11@osu.edu

A survey of US municipal authorities to investigate what regulatory practices were invoked to control and influence big box developments including location and design. Many of the regulatory practices used were not specific to big box retailing. Design issues were the most commonly addressed. It is suggested that community issues need also to be addressed.

US

8/5
Kreutz, S.
The model of neighbourhood improvement districts in Hamburg, New strategies for private sector involvement in area development,
Paper presented at EURA Conference on The Vital City, Glasgow 2007. Available online from: www.urban-improvement-districts.de

An introduction in English to the German concept of BIDs and its implementation in the city of Hamburg. The ways in which the German concept reflects changes in approach to urban government and the involvement of the private sector are discussed. The relationships between public and private sectors are changing but the question is why and with what consequences for them both. Neighbourhood Improvement Districts are an extension of the BIDs model being piloted in Hamburg.

BIDs, Germany, Hamburg

8/6
Lee, S.-E., Johnson, K. and Gahring, S.
Small-town consumers' disconfirmation of expectations and satisfaction with local independent retailers,
International Journal of Retail and Distribution Management 36(2), 2008, 143-157. Email: lee6s@cmich.edu

Although this article reports on research in the US its findings resonate with work in the UK on small shops. Consumer dissatisfaction with the retail offer of small independent retailers in towns with a larger operator focused on the retail offer of these shops. Small retailers who were customer oriented and whose product range was not in competition with larger operators but met different needs achieved greater customer commendation.

Small shops

8/7
Moreno, J. de J.
Efficiency and regulation in Spanish hypermarket retail trade,
International Journal of Retail and Distribution Management, 36(1), 2008, 71-88. Email: justo.dejorge@uah.es

A continuum is envisaged from regulation to maximise efficiency through limitation of new entrants to a regulation to maximise freedom of choice with a minimum of regulation. In Spain there are differences across the regions in the extent of regulation and the article looks at differences in productivity in relation to the level of regulation. The introductory section provides a cluster analysis of regulatory practice across a range of countries showing the nature and level of regulation. For the Spanish data it is shown that lower regulation is associated with greater efficiency.

Food retailing, Spain

8/8
Moreno, J de J.
Evaluation of technical efficiency among entrant and incumbent firms in the Spanish retailing sector: the effects of deregulation from a regional perspective,
Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services, 15, 2008, 500-508. Email: justo.dejorge@uah.es

There have been changes in the retail regulatory environment in Spain. The relative performance of incumbent and new entrants to the market is studied in the light of the changes in regulations. In Spain, unlike in the UK, regional government can determine much of their own regulatory practice. This paper looks in particular at the impact of changes in shop opening hours on the productivity of the sector. Larger firms had higher productivity than smaller ones and had more potential to adapt to changes in regulation. There was thus no advantage for new entrants. For the specialised retail sector greater regulation impaired productivity.

Competition, Spain

8/9
Shelbourn, C.
Chaining the chains; the use of ‘Formula Business Ordinances’ to protect the character of traditional commercial areas in the US,
Journal of Planning and Environmental Law, 9, 2008, 1240-1252.

This article discusses some of the issues surrounding the UK independent sector before going on to describe a piece of US legislation called the Formula Business Ordinance. The Formula Business Ordinance refers to the replication of businesses operating a standard format across the chain of outlets. Examples of how this has been used to create zones where such businesses cannot locate unless they change their format to fit are outlined. It has been used to great effect in tourist and historic towns to preserve their character and maintain independent traditional businesses which are regarded as part of the attraction of these places.

Historic towns, Small shops, US

9. PRACTITIONER LITERATURE

9/1
Baldock, J.
Retail rules shift shape,
Planning, 8/08, 2008.

Whilst the new proposed PPS6 confirms the end of the need test Baldock suggests that it is actually present in another guise. The new impact test which has not yet been outlined but which is designed to ensure that new out of town developments do not compromise town centre vitality and viability will inevitably have to consider whether there is adequate extra expenditure to ensure that new developments do not impact negatively on existing town centre trade. The new test is likely to be more rigorous and require more work but it could potentially ensure that new developments bring greater benefits.

PPS6

9/2
Dodds, M.
Out-of-town shops back on the agenda,
Regeneration and Renewal, August, 2008.

A regeneration perspective on the proposed new version of PPS6. It notes that edge of centre sites may be developed with greater ease and that there will be cases where poor existing retailing can therefore be more easily supplemented or replaced with new retail development which would have a regenerative impact on town centres. The article admits that without the detail of the new impact test it is difficult to be sure how the new PPS6 would work.

PPS6

9/3
Elghramy, N.
Back to basics,
In **Centre Retailing 2009**, London: Estates Gazette, 2008, 15-17.

A discussion of the impact of food retailers as anchor stores in shopping centres. The focus is on how this changes the perception of the centre and what advantages or disadvantages it might have for shopping centres. There is doubt over whether they work as anchors in town centres where there is limited parking available but there is a belief that they provide good footfall and that where sites are limited for supermarket development the supermarkets may wish to become anchor stores in shopping centres

Food retailing, Shopping centres

9/4
Fennell, J. and Robertson, J.
Centres of attention,
Planning, 6/06, 2008, 16-17.

This article makes the case for regional shopping centres as catalysts for economic growth. They argue that the picture of such centres as portrayed in PPS6 bears little resemblance to the actual outcomes as reported in research commissioned by Capital Shopping Centres.

Shopping centres

9/5
Goddard, C.
Need for clarity on needs test,
In **Centre Retailing 2009**, London: Estates Gazette, 2008, 53-55.

A sceptical view of the ability of the redrafted PPS6 to provide improved choice, productivity and competition or to actually make a significant change to existing policy. It is argued that both the reasons for the introduction and for the dropping of the needs test are rather contrived and based on hypothetical scenarios which are unlikely to be the norm. There is a good argument for moving to a better test as the current one is out of step with the objectives of promoting choice, competition and productivity. However in effect the new test is likely to include a need element. Where the balance will be struck between negative and positive impacts is unclear as yet.

PPS6

9/6
Gummer, J.
Don’t make rules that penalise only one group of players,
Estates Gazette, 15 November, 2008, 43.

As discussion of business rates in the context of the current economic downturn. The lack of any relationship between rates based on size of unit and profitability in relation to size of unit. This creates an uneven playing field and in a downturn this will have a greater impact on businesses with larger space requirements in relationship to turnover and profitability. This could adversely affect the high street as businesses may not be able to afford the rates when spending is reduced.

Property

9/7
Harris, D.
Big thinking gets smaller,
Estates Gazette Retail, March, 2008, 20-23.

Out of town shopping is changing in character. There is less demand for the big units that used to characterise such centres and a move towards a more high street type of retail warehouse park where A1 consents exist.

Out of town retailing, Retail warehouse parks

9/8
Kivlehan, N.P.
A chill up the aisles,
Estates Gazette Retail, September 2008, 14-19.

This article coins the term the ‘Aldi effect’ to describe changes in the food retailing and value markets in the current economic recession. It discusses the types of locations favoured by Aldi and why they have preference for the more affluent areas marketing their proposition in terms of offering a smarter pricing offer. This provides them with the opportunity to change their image with both customers and communities.

Discount retailing

9/9
McClary, S.
Anchors away?
Estates Gazette Retail, March, 2008, 25-27.

As the number of department store retailers decline shopping centres are being forced to think differently about anchor stores. The lack of variety threatens the distinctiveness of different shopping centres. Preferences for different types of anchor stores by management, other tenants and consumers are changing the view of what is an appropriate anchor store. As yet the major grocery retailers have not become preferred anchor stores but it is an emerging possibility. Other footfall generators such as Primark are also being considered.

Shopping centres

9/10
Ricketts, S.
Viability comes to fore in site acquisition decisions,
Planning 19/09, 2008.

Cases of contested use of CPOs for town centre developments show that where viability is questioned local councils face difficulties. The uncertainty surrounding getting CPOs remains a blockage to town centre development.

CPO, Town centre

9/11
Shiel, V.
Shop test low on impact,
Planning, 18/07, 2008, 10.

A resume of the changes in the new proposed version of PPS6 and some of the responses to these from the industry, planning experts, the property sector and political parties. There was widespread concern that at the new proposals gave little indication of what the new impact test might entail and without this information it was hard to decide either whether it would work or what its impact would be.

PPS6

9/12
Shiel, V.
London small shops proposal criticised,
Planning, 8/08, 2008.

It was proposed in the London Plan that Section 106 agreements could be used to ensure that small shop units were made available. It remains unclear however that the proposal is legally workable.

Small shops

9/13
Thame, D.
Trading places,
Estates Gazette Retail, November, 2008, 34- 36.

There is improved understanding of what street market refurbishment can offer town centres. Fun rather than footfall increases dwell time and spend. Improved management of markets has also reduced some of the problems of rogue traders and there has been a move to more upmarket produce (organic, fair trade etc) in redeveloped markets. The food offer is seen as critical in attracting the higher spenders to a market and creating a certain kind of clientele.

Markets