

The Institute  Retail Studies



UNIVERSITY OF
STIRLING

The Retail Planning Knowledge Base Annual Update (2009 Publications)

Anne Findlay and Leigh Sparks
Institute for Retail Studies,
School of Management,
University of Stirling
STIRLING FK9 4LA, SCOTLAND
Tel: (01786) 467384
E-mail: Leigh.Sparks@stir.ac.uk
a.m.findlay@stir.ac.uk
Website www.irs.stir.ac.uk

March 2010

CONTENTS

COMMENTARY

SECTIONS

1. General Texts
2. Theoretical Work
3. Retail Formats
4. Retail Locations
5. Retail Planning Practice
6. Consumer Culture
7. Urban Environment
8. A selection of literature relating to retail planning in USA and Europe
9. Practitioner literature

COMMENTARY

2009 Commentary

The headlines in retail planning for 2009 have been the recession and the new planning policy statement PPS4. The commentary brings together research relevant to these but also assesses the extent to which the headlines are meaningful in terms of what is understood about retail and town centre environments. Whilst there is an emerging culture which emphasises evidence based planning and plan-led retail planning, the concepts involved must have meaning in terms of consumers, retailers and planners in the field.

As previously, the commentary and annual update reflect a literature search with a focus on UK literature, but including both US and European material. The disciplinary provenance of literatures continues to develop. The interest of health literatures in retailing and concepts of healthy places in terms of food provision is not new but its continued interest should be noted (e.g. Beaulac et al. 6/1, Cummins and Macintyre 2/1, Ellaway et al. 6/2). The literature on managing town centres, for example Business Improvement Districts, is dispersed in terms of discipline through place marketing, geographical and planning literatures, but reflects emerging concerns with urban management.

Email contacts and web addresses have been given where possible. Web addresses are correct as of March 2009. Users of the knowledge base should however be aware that material does not always remain on web sites as these are updated frequently. Users are advised to download material of interest for future use rather than to think of returning to the web site at a later date. Readers are encouraged to contact authors by email to obtain material, as we are well aware that for many the literature is not otherwise available.

Recession

A key focus of interest in 2009 was the way in which the recession impacted on retailers and retail developments. The National Retail Planning Forum held a conference entitled **Retailing out of recession** and many other groups did likewise. During the year there have been numerous headlines about the impact of the recession on vacancy rates, with Experian GOAD and the Local Data Company producing estimates based on their monitoring of town centres. The diversity of estimates has of course again highlighted the lack of consistent and available public data. The Association of Town Centre Management initiative with Springboard, known as Milestone, has highlighted the potential of better KPIs although of course the lack of data input to the project again underlines the need for a much stronger database (2/4). Defined and agreed KPIs would be of benefit to both practitioners and researchers. In recessionary times this would offer a much better understanding of how recession is impacting in different types of areas. The early headlines surrounding the Woolworths closures produced headlines fearing the worst in terms of city and town centre vacant property. Monitoring of the take up of the Woolworths sites has been recorded online. Searching in the research literatures there is a lack of material on how vacancies arise, are dealt with and their differential significance. The paper by Teale (7/9) is one exception and begins to discuss the ways in which a better understanding of the impact of increased vacancy will require consideration in terms of different types of pitch, location and unit size. The onset of recession has again undoubtedly drawn attention to the need for a better understanding of vacancy patterns, the definition of vacancy and the recording of vacancy patterns.

Practitioner literature and conference reports have suggested that it is likely that the recession will change the way that public private partnerships may work in the future. They have suggested a time lag in new developments, with a number of projects in the pipeline already being delayed or postponed and some now considered no longer viable (**Planning**, 10/4/09, 5). This has implications for Section 106 agreements associated with the developments. The British Retail Consortium paper **21st Century high streets** (1/1) tries to bring together key aspects which help a town centre to prosper. The British Council of Shopping Centres **Retail development pipeline** (4/1) publication is one example. The British Council of Shopping Centres has also conducted a study of **Secondary centres** (4/2) addressing issues of falling property values and reduced income. A key feature of this report was their engagement of major investors in understanding prospects for the sector. Groups such as London First's Retail Commission have undertaken studies of how to build greater resilience in the town centres (**Reinvigorating the high street: encouraging retail diversity and supporting town centres in London** 7/5). This publication includes a set of recommendations to better manage town centres through an ordered thinking process and a more strategic approach. Equally the Centre for Local Economic Strategies has made suggestions (**Understanding and supporting the resilience of market towns** 4/3) regarding the ways in which loyalty cards and town promotion could be used to counter recessionary trends in market towns.

Recession has also prompted initiatives to address issues of vacancy. In Spring 2009 Communities and Local Government published a guide entitled **Looking after our town centres** (5/2). The guide is a summary of key potential ways town centres can change management structures and funding. It includes a section on facilitating the use of empty property (**Planning** 23/2/09). In England this resulted in a programme to use empty shops (Shiel 9/26). In Scotland it resulted in a tranche of government money to be spent on projects selected through challenge bids (**Planning**, 10/4/09, 5, **Planning**, 14/8/09 and **Planning**, 26/6/09). Attention has been drawn to the fact that there are extra business costs looming in terms of both rate revaluations and the supplementary business taxes. In addition there is the community infrastructure levy on new developments (Wilding 9/29). At a time of recession the wisdom of extra costs for business are being questioned. These initiatives have prompted researchers to ask how and to what extent, local authorities and public finance should be used to support small businesses. Guy (5/15) has suggested that there must be selectivity with a focus on areas with the most potential, which implies that some locations are not 'saveable'.

New responses to business financial problems are also producing increased vacancies (Daubney 9/13, Harris 9/16, Kivlehan 9/17, 9/18, McClary 9/22). Key amongst these are pre-pack administration whereby a company may dispose of properties without completing the lease or making payments as part of a bankruptcy process through which the company is reconstituted as only the profitable part of the business. This can adversely affect landlords and high streets (Guy 7/4). Increasingly therefore there is a perception that there are pressures on the property sector for more flexible leases which would reflect the realities of changing economic circumstances and market uncertainty (McClary 9/22).

Planning Policy

2009 saw the long awaited revision of planning policy with the publication of **Planning Policy Statement 4** (5/3). The transition from Planning Policy Statement 6 to Planning Policy Statement 4 incorporating Draft Planning Policy Statement 6 was completed. There was considerable activity during the year. First, a draft version was published. A House of Commons Inquiry was then held, a consultation phase took place and Communities and Local

Government made presentations to key interest groups about the proposed new policy statement. Finally in late December the new PPS4 was published (5/3, 5/4).

The new policy incorporates the main recommendations of the Barker Report. By combining PPS4 and PPS6 the policy seeks to emphasise the role of town centres as economic drivers. Town centres remain the desired focus of new development and the policy continues the emphasis on town centres first. As anticipated the most significant difference has been the dropping of the need test in response to the Barker Report recommendation and the institution of a new impact test which includes a range of qualitative and quantitative measures. It had been considered that the need test could lead to unintended blocking of developments on the basis that there was no requirement for them and that this would reduce consumer choice. The new policy makes a clearer distinction between the plan development stage and the assessment of proposals which do not comply with the plan. Need assessment still forms part of the plan making process so that local authorities can make some assessment of the likely space demands for future retail development and thus give some thought as to how these could be realised in terms of sequential site selection.

The policy underwent scrutiny by various groups, producing a variety of responses, many of which were not in favour of the final policies. The consultation responses have been published by the Communities and Local Government Department (5/6): that publication provides an interesting view of different standpoints with local groups, lobby groups, trade association and retailer responses. The requirement to show a need for a new development was the most controversial although there was also doubt over the adequacy of the new impact test. Key organisations such as the Royal Town Planning Institute (9/4) have not supported the removal of the need test, fearing it will weaken the town centre first policy (see practitioner literature). The Conservative Party has also suggested that if it were to gain power it might reinstate the need test. A House of Commons Committee (5/1) did not support the dropping of the need test, nor consider the new impact test to be sufficiently robust. The government's response (5/16) regarding the need test was that they did not think that a pass/fail on the basis of need was appropriate and that a more considered approach was required. In view of the ongoing Competition Commission investigation there would of course otherwise be an immediate conflict of policy if 'need' had been retained in its previous role as a pass/fail consideration. Significantly the Communities and Local Government department responded to their concerns about the impact test by stating that the new impact test was not to be regarded as a cost benefit analysis but rather that any single negative impact would be sufficient grounds to turn down a proposal. Guy (5/13) has termed this the 'apples and pears' approach as the considerations are not equivalent. He comments that there is a lack of a matrix within which to evaluate benefits and dis-benefits, citing how the same problems arose with PPS6 in respect of making decisions about retail developments in a regeneration context. The matrix issue is also taken up by Shelbourn (5/18) who contrasts the way the impact assessment system works in the US and UK. The US system has a greater variety of potential outcomes and there is the suggestion that the UK system could have benefitted from thinking about the impact test differently in this respect, not least because of the local benefits it affords. Other bodies fear that a period of planning by appeal may follow as the possible interpretations of policy are tried and tested. Despite consultation concerns the final policy statement closely reflected the draft statement. The case for regeneration as a qualitative variable was weakened in the final statement. Considerable emphasis has also been placed on evidence required and responses being proportionate. There is of course an assumption that all areas will be able to maintain an up to date plan. Local authorities have some limited discretion with the possibility of setting size limits for the application of the

impact test but the scope for locally based initiatives is limited (Guy 5/13). In terms of the sequential approach it is evident that the new policy gives greater approval to edge of centre sites than formerly.

Alongside the publication of Planning Policy Statement 4, the Communities and Local Government Department commissioned a piece of work from Grimley Eve (5/12) on practice guidance. The publication was initially published as a living draft but was published in a finalised version alongside PPS4. The publication seeks to offer clarity on topics such as the sequential and impact test and was certainly something that planners had been asking for. Whether it meets their expectations remains to be tested.

Increasingly research is showing that it is not only the town centre emphasis which is necessary in making town centres succeed. Much also depends on how town centres and particularly edge of centre sites relate to each other and function together. There is little scope for planners to use this knowledge and apply it in their approval of developments, but of course they can ensure that a new development is made to fit in the best way possible. For example Wrigley et al. (7/12) have published a paper on linked trips and edge of centre development which has highlighted the potential of edge of centre developments. Castillo-Manzano and Lopez-Valpuesta's study of Seville (8/2) and Porta et al.'s study of Bologna (8/6) illustrate the importance of the articulation of town centre retail space and the location of retailing within that space.

Planning Policy Statement 4 was published without a final resolution of the Competition Commission Groceries Market Investigation. Following the successful Tesco appeal against the Competition Commission's initial proposals, the competition set to work on adjusting its recommendations and taking account of the grounds of the Tesco appeal, leading to the publication of a new version of the competition test in October 2009. Alongside this, work was ongoing on other aspects of the requirements for instituting the test. A **Controlled land draft order** (5/8) was published, as well as recommendations on the use of drive time software (5/10). Commentators on the **Controlled land draft order** have expressed concern that it may not benefit town centres and may thus work contrary to PPS4 (Easton 9/14). These have led to greater clarity about the scope and likely shape of the test. For example the way that the large grocery retail sector will be defined has become clearer. The test will apply to full range grocery stores defined as Cooperative Group, Marks and Spencer, J Sainsbury, Morrisons, Asda, Tesco and Waitrose. Limited assortment discounters will be excluded. In planning terms this is an interesting definition and seems to be out of step with the way that planning operates both as it is nationally determined and because it is company operated. Additionally despite the increased economic orientation of retail planning policy issues of service provision remain key aspects of planning. Regional chains with a local dominance will not be affected. Only retailers with a national presence will be involved although the definition of national remains sketchy, with the definition focusing more on specific companies than geographical dimensions despite the fact that it is geographical dominance which is the driver for the test. Use of a ten minute isochrones and the way this would be applied was the subject of a detailed report. Definitions of size also raise new issues. Not least of these is the lack of clarity about non-food retailing (Hallsworth et al.).

Research by Wrigley et al. (5/19) has extended the work they already carried out for the Competition Commission which attempted to assess the extent to which large stores impacted on the entry and exit of smaller stores. This 2009 paper examines regional variations in the impacts and postulates that relative prosperity may also be a key factor in determining the

impact of large stores on smaller ones. This is of interest as clearly the competition test would operate regardless of prosperity or regional differences. Equally Hallsworth and Orchard (3/2) note the fact that dis-benefits from major shopping developments are often overlooked.

The Meaning of Words

New words and vocabularies, and new uses of both, are emerging in the policy literature, some more defined than others. Recent research has however shown that in some cases the use of these terms may be misplaced. This section looks firstly at issues relating to PPS4 and secondly at issues relating to the Competition Commission work.

PPS4

On 29th December 2009 the new Planning Policy Statement 4: Planning for Sustainable Economic Growth was published. The policy was announced by John Healey and Rosie Winterton on a visit to a market in Doncaster. Amongst the key policies noted in the ministerial statement was the promotion of consumer choice and retail diversity. The title of the ministerial statement was **Protecting small shops and boosting town centres** (www.communities.gov.uk/news/planningandbuilding/1422911). Many would doubt that the planning policy statement is designed to protect small shops. Indeed research and other responses to recession suggest that other measures are certainly important in terms of fiscal and management approaches. The key aspects they chose to highlight were that the policy:

- *reinforces the 'town centres first' policy and ensures the planning system promotes the vitality, viability and the unique character of town centres*
- *promotes consumer choice and retail diversity*
- *keeps the important 'sequential test' that requires developers to seek the most central sites first*
- *removes the dysfunctional 'needs test' which can unintentionally stifle diversity and consumer choice in town. In some cases new shops in town centres were ruled out because out of town developments, such as big supermarkets, already provided that function*
- *creates a new tougher 'impact test' that assesses economic, social and environmental criteria so councils can better assess the impacts on the town centre. It tests whether impact is positive or negative on climate change, town centre consumer choice and retail diversity; investment and town centre trade and gives councils powers to cap the size of big retail developments where this is justified*
- *Requires local authorities to plan positively for sustainable economic growth*
- *Requires local authorities to make markets an integral part of the vision for their town centres, enhancing existing markets and, where appropriate, re-introducing or creating new ones.*
- *allows rural authorities to plan for economic development in rural areas subject to the need to protect the countryside, recognising that a site may be acceptable even if it's not readily accessible by public transport.*

However does a reading of PPS4 actually convey these key messages? There are three issues here:

1. Misreading language

It is wrong to infer that town centres first is the same as protecting small shops. That confuses policies designed to plan for specific locations and policies directed towards certain business types. PPS4 is concerned with directing development and investment towards town centres and is not concerned with business types. The involvement of the Competition Commission has further confused this issue. The competition test continues to view more choice as desirable but as defined in terms of choice between superstore operators.

2. The Use of Words

To show how PPS6 and PPS4 differ in terms of the vocabulary used, WORDLES were created (Figure 1). These are based on word counts with the higher the count reflecting the number of times the word is used. The two WORDLES show some differences but perhaps are more unexpectedly rather similar. The word 'Economic' is now large and bold reflecting the anticipated change to a more economic view of the potential role of town centres. The transition to a more economic perspective has not been entirely successful with other terms from the language of urban therapeutics still lingering in the text. Town centres are still in poor health and in need of regeneration. The word 'need' seems to assume similar significance to that of PPS6. Significant is the fact that several of the terms in the ministerial statement such as 'retail diversity' do not even occur in PPS4, only featuring in the impact test.

3. The Lack of Definitions

Research has highlighted the problem of defining terms such as consumer choice (Guy 5/14) and retail diversity (Findlay and Sparks 5/11). Research underlines the fact that achieving these would go beyond planning and that planning itself cannot deliver these. Guy describes the use of vocabulary in policy as 'woolly' in respect of actually changing consumer choice or retail diversity in planning terms. There may be an expectation that some general understanding of these terms exists, although previous experience of planning should suggest that this is not so. Guy notes that outcomes could be entirely opposite with either a restriction on the entry of big shops or more big shops, depending on definitions used.

Competition Commission

The Competition Commission began by using the term 'consumer choice' as part of the argument for a competition test which by increasing the number of retailers operating in an area might increase consumer choice. Interestingly by 2009 the terminology has changed to 'consumer welfare' and a more 'competitive environment'. Consumer welfare is not defined in any specific way but seems to imply that a range of large supermarkets will deliver greater choice for the consumer and that this will keep prices lower and thus be of benefit or 'welfare' to the consumer. The term 'welfare' might imply that this may not enhance the choice to the individual consumer but to consumers in general. The articulation of the issue in terms of consumers has displayed a consistently centralist and in retail terms limited view.

The research literature is instructive on the issues of consumer choice and welfare. Everts and Jackson's study (6/3), based on shopping patterns in Portsmouth, demonstrates that consumers are not actually engaged with decision making in the way that such conceptions of consumer choice envisage. For many consumers social accomplishment is a key part of

shopping and trust relationships are more important than other factors. Work from the same project stresses the fact that many choices were not real in the way that the Competition Commission might imagine and that use of the term could be misleading. Abrogation of choice occurs because consumers are constrained and routinised (Hallsworth et al. 3/1). This point is made in a completely different respect by Mansvelt (6/6) who looks at the types of options available to different ages and mobilities of consumers. Many choices are not in fact open to many groups of people. There is clearly a danger that in enhancing consumer 'welfare' in one way, it might become more restricted in another in terms of accessibility. The paper by Meneely et al. (6/7) quite clearly demonstrates the emerging problems for older consumers from certain types of shopping locations and patterning of retail facilities. The use of the terms choice and welfare would therefore seem to have been used in rather restricted and un-nuanced ways with little reference to their understandings in the wider research literatures. Other literatures on consumer choice for food retailing also note the incompleteness of knowledge sets and the variety of choice factors involved Reimers and Cludlow 8/7, Reutterer and Teller 6/8). The work of the Competition Commission was to focus on a precise issue but perhaps the lack of contextual material from the body of established research (and here only 2009 research has been noted) would be a more adequate preparation for making policy.

Managing Town Centres

Markets

Literature on managing town centres during 2009 brings together some otherwise disparate research. During the year a House of Commons Committee reported on the role of markets, where responsibility for markets lay in the government framework and what markets contributed to towns and the economy (5/17). The work of the Committee drew extensively on ongoing research bringing research findings and policy together (Watson 7/11). The report sought to redress any negative views of the role of markets either in terms of retrogressive approaches to retailing or as a nuisance in town centres. It urged local authorities to prioritise markets. It decided that markets should remain a local issue and that whilst at the national level the disparate authorities should be more coordinated, that it would not be appropriate for further national scale involvement to take place. The Retail Markets Alliance and the British Council for Shopping Centres also commissioned a policy review of markets. The significance of this work lies in the attention given to the size and structure of the sector (Zasada 3/4). The history of the realisation of the Birmingham Christmas market (Bloomfield 7/1) and farmers' markets have also been the subject of research. Lyon et al.'s paper confirms the very local function of farmers' markets and their role in speciality shopping (3/3). Both papers illustrate the use of markets in drawing new trade to town centres. As such they confirm the findings of the wider investigation into the use of markets in town centres and in particular their role in providing spaces which cross traditional social boundaries (Watson).

BIDs and TCM

A significant literature demonstrates how BIDs and town centre management differ and interrelate (Coca-Stefaniak et al.7/2, Coca-Stefaniak 8/3 Cook 7/3, Warnaby 7/10, Peel and Lloyd 7/7, Riviezzo et al. 7/8). These show the significance of the different bases for the establishment of BIDs and town centre management and attempts to show the development of approaches which may lie along the axis from the informal to the formal, public to private. The articles do not specifically raise the issue of how BIDs can be introduced where there has

been no tradition of town centre management, but it is a question which emerges from a reading of the various research papers in the field. Other approaches to town centre revitalisation include a paper on themed towns by Mcleod (7/6) which demonstrates a different form of trading relationship operating at the level of small towns. Readers are also reminded that there is a useful list of web sites which is part of the knowledge base. In the context of managing town centres the Scotland Towns web site offers an innovative approach to building a network of shared experience, best practice and an exchange of ideas and expertise.

Conclusions

Although consultation has been very important in all aspects of policy making for retailing, with reports commissioned from experts and researchers engaged in the process it would appear that sometimes in addressing the specificities of policy, wider and relevant contextual research has not been considered. This has resulted in conflicting evidence and poor use of terminology. It has led to headlines which do not reflect policy. Undoubtedly planners are still to encounter some of the difficulties which will arise as a result and the shape of future retail development will inevitably depend on the way that terms as yet unspecified will be interpreted. Setting policy within the context of the research findings has served to highlight this problem. Much informative research exists and awareness of this research and what it can tell us is critical. It remains a concern that policy development in retailing is not as informed as it might be.

RETAIL PLANNING KNOWLEDGE BASE UPDATE 2010
(Material published during 2009)

GENERAL TEXTS

1/1

British Retail Consortium

21st Century high streets: A new vision for our town centres.

London: British Retail Consortium, 2009, 29p. Available online at:

www.brc.org.uk/showDoc04.asp?id=3953&moid=6733

An introductory section outlines briefly the problems facing UK high streets. Priorities for action are then discussed in some detail. These are: A Unique Sense of Place, An Attractive Public Realm, Planning for Success, Accessibility, Safety and Security, Supportive Regulatory and Fiscal Regimes. Case studies are used to show good practice examples.

High streets

1/2

Fels, A.

The regulation of retailing – lessons for developing countries,

Asia-Pacific Business Review, 15(1), 2009, 13-27. Email; a.fels@anzsog.edu.au

This article has been included because it offers comparisons between the UK and Australian experiences of regulating for market dominance. In addition it reviews the retail planning and competition situation in China, Thailand and Indonesia. With respect to these economies where foreign companies are making large investments it recognises that steps to regulate are better taken before the debate becomes too entrenched.

Regulation

1/3

Guy, C.

Development pressure and retail planning: a study of 20 year change in Cardiff, UK,

International Review of Retail, Distribution and Consumer Research, 20(1), 2010, 119-133. Email: Guy@cardiff.ac.uk

In this paper Guy examines whether retailing has developed in the ways that might have been anticipated some twenty years ago. Some key differences are noted. The development of ‘very large’ out of town stores, the emergence of discounters, the development of small food store formats, retail as part of regeneration and the switch to increased town centre service uses are highlighted as differing from expectations. The article considers to what extent planning has influenced the outcomes. It is recognised as having prevented speculative development. It has also provided the impetus for the development of for example the smaller food formats. Considering that policy has had a town centre focus the out of town development is more surprising. In part this is due to the engagement of retailing as part of the regeneration agenda.

Cardiff, Out of town retailing, Retail structure

THEORETICAL WORK

2/1

Cummins, S. and Macintyre, S.

Are secondary data sources on the neighbourhood food environment accurate?

Preventive Medicine, 49, 2009, 527-528.

This paper compares the data in the Public Register of Food Premises with survey data, by checking a sample of units in the Public Register of Food Premises. The Register exists as part of regulatory policy. 87-90% of registered units were found to exist. The purpose of the article is to verify the reliability of the register for use in other analyses such as food availability studies. As a result the data from the register is not compared to a full survey of units on the ground. From a retail planning perspective the paper is significant as it highlights the data problems involved in establishing what retail outlets exist.

Data

2/2

Lee, G. and Lim, H.

A spatial statistical approach to identifying areas with poor access to grocery foods in the city of Buffalo, New York,

Urban Studies, 46(7), 2009, 1299-1315. Email: hwlim@buffalo.edu

A methodology for calculating the levels of under-provision in food retailing. The methodology calculates a discrepancy index which provides a measure of expected demand in relation to observed supply. This is a better measure than traditional gravity model measures which do not estimate discrepancy between demand and need. The patterning across census blocks was then examined using a statistical measure to locate areas where there was a concentration of shortfall in provision.

Food desert, US

2/3

Sanner, H.

Economy vs history: what does actually determine the distribution of shops' locations in cities,

Annals of Regional Science, 43(2), 2009, 283-306. Email: sanner@un-postdam.de

The findings of this article contribute to the debate about whether retail can be considered in the same way as other economic sectors and the same economic models of location applied. Retail patterning is attributed to the historical singularity of urban development rather than to other intrinsic aspects of retail or urban structures.

Models

2/4

Wehrle, D.

Intelligence for town and city centres.

London: ATCM and Springboard, 2009. Available online from:

www.atcm.org/uploads/DOCS/209-Diane_Wehrle_-_Using_Intelligence.pdf

A presentation of Milestone, an Association of Town Centre Management initiative with Springboard to improve the information available for town centres. The presentation outlines the proposed measures to be included and how these translate into KPIs which can be used for benchmarking. The presentation does not make reference to the level of coverage of data which will be available, although key participants are listed.

Data

RETAIL FORMATS

3/1

Hallsworth, A., de Kervenoael, R., Elms, J. and Canning, C.

The food superstore revolution: changing times changing research agendas in the UK, **International Review of Retail, Distribution and Consumer Research**, 20(1), 2009, 135-146. Email: a.hallsworth@surrey.ac.uk

This paper draws on some of the material from the Portsmouth twenty year study of food retail development. A key section of the paper is the section on competition and choice. This section suggests that the ongoing Competition Commission investigation should have taken greater notice of research findings. It is critical of the Commission in respect of its top down approach which disenfranchises local decision making and is antithetical to planning. It also points out the emerging role of superstores in non-food retailing which has not been considered properly by the Commission. Drawing specifically on the Portsmouth work it is critical of the ways in which consumer choice is defined in an economic way.

Competition, Consumer groups, Food retailing

3/2

Hallsworth, A. and Orchard, J.

Retail regeneration in Southampton: seeking the bigger picture, **Journal of Place Management and Development**, 2(2), 2009, 140-153. Email: a.hallsworth@surrey.ac.uk

This paper considers the dis-benefits of major retail developments with reference to West Quay in Southampton. It is argued that small to medium size retail businesses have much to contribute, not least because they represent the majority of retail enterprises in terms of employment. Consideration is given to the way that rates were re-valued following the opening of the West Quay development. It is shown that how successful retailers were in making their case depended more on the size of the retailer than the location of the retailer and the likely impact. The lack of SME retailer representation is highlighted.

Property, Small shops, Southampton, West Quay

3/3

Lyon, P., Collie, V., Kvarnbrink, E.-B. and Colqhoun, A.

Shopping at the farmers' market; consumers and their perspectives, **Journal of Food Service**, 20, 2009, 21-30.

What do farmers' markets offer the consumer? Whilst apparently regressive as a mode of food retailing and antithetical to supermarket retailing, farmers' markets have been growing in popularity. This study reports on a survey of customers in 5 towns in Eastern Scotland. The survey showed that customers were primarily local visiting only their own local market when it was on. Most important for the customers was the direct relationship with the producers. The authors suggest a distinction between special and mundane food shopping.

Farmers' markets

3/4

Zasada, K.

Markets 21. A policy and research review of UK retail and wholesale markets in the 21st century.

London: Retail Markets Alliance and British Council for Shopping Centres, 2009, 84p.

Available online from: www.retailmarketsalliance.org

See also **Planning**, 16/10/09, 3.

This report is the result of a project begun in 2008 following the setting up of a working group by the Retail Markets Alliance Group. The remit of the group was to answer key questions such as how many markets are there, what types of markets are there and how many people are employed. The report is structured under the following headings: 1. Current performance, 2. Policy agenda, 3. Policy into practice – what markets need to do and 4. Knowledge management and measuring success. 1124 retail markets were found to exist employing 95,000 with 45,700 traders and an estimated turnover of £3.5 billion per year. The role of markets in policy agendas such as PPS4 are discussed. A key focus of the paper is the consideration of the place of markets within the context of retailing. A range of case examples of key issues and possible responses is included.

Markets

RETAIL LOCATIONS

4/1

British Council of Shopping Centres

Retail development pipeline.

London: BCSC, 2009.

Attention is drawn to the importance of maintaining an active development pipeline. This ensures that new space is being made available for emerging retailers and to ensure town centre vitality. As consumer confidence increases again there will be demand for new space. Credit restrictions have been limiting new space and it is likely that there will be a lag of at least 4 years in pipeline development.

Shopping centres

4/2

British Council of Shopping Centres

Secondary centres: the impact of recession on secondary centres.

London: BCSC, 2010.

DTZ were commissioned to assess the impact of recession on the shopping centre industry with particular reference to centres in secondary locations. The report focuses on issues such as the ways that falling property values, reduced income levels and physical deterioration can be addressed. The report uses material gained from interviews with key players across the sector including the major financial organisations involved.

Shopping centres, Secondary centres

4/3

Centre for Local Economic Strategies and amt-i

Understanding and supporting the resilience of market towns,

Manchester: CLES, 2009, 31p. Available online from:

www.cles.org.uk/information/104247/pp26/

A survey of market towns was used to assess the impact of recession and views on how recession can be tackled by market towns. The report details trends in unemployment, retail vacancies and footfall. Responses in terms of use of loyalty cards and promotion are discussed. Key measures to weather recession include reduced rates, flexibility from landlords, more localised decision making and funding to permit a bottom up approach.

Market towns, Recession

4/4

Powe, N. and Hart, T.

Competing for custom of small town residents: exploring the challenges and potential, **International Journal of Retail and Distribution Management**, 37(9), 2009, 732-747.

Email: n.a.powe@ncl.ac.uk

An article based on a survey of residents in small towns in Northumberland and Norfolk. The key question asked is: What do people expect from small towns in terms of retailing? The survey results were used to look at what determined whether or not residents out-shopped or shopped in the town itself. Cross town trends did identify some relationships between place of shopping and migration and employment. However the more crucial findings of the study are that clawback of a central retail activity can have benefits for the wider retail economy of the towns as those shopping in the town shop for a range of goods. Key gaps such as availability of clothes, particularly, for older consumers can result in outshopping for a wider range of products. Where the town can satisfy key needs in an interesting way shoppers are more likely to patronise the local shops, particularly if the centre is readily accessible.

Market towns, Outshopping

RETAIL PLANNING PRACTICE

5/1

Communities and Local Government Committee

Tenth report. Need and impact: planning for town centres.

London: House of Commons, 2009. Available online from: www.parliament.the-stationery-office.co.uk/pa/cm200809/cmselect/cmcomloc/517/51702.htm

This committee addressed two issues; 1. Will the removal of the need test lessen the protection of town centres? and 2. Will the new impact test be an improvement? Evidence was taken from witnesses who included representatives from major retailers (Tesco, Coop, Sainsbury's, John Lewis), industry representatives (ACS), property industry representatives (RICS, BCSC, Capital Shopping centres), local authorities and local government (LGA, Sheffield City Council and Brighton and Hove Council), planning representatives (RTPI), Kate Barker, Communities and Local Government and lobby groups (Tescopoly). The committee did not agree that removal of the need test was desirable and considered that the new impact test was too subjective. They were not convinced that the impact test would deliver a more competitive environment or that the need test was not required because need was a risk that should be taken by companies not assessed by local authorities.

Impact test, Need, PPS4

5/2

Communities and Local Government

Looking after our town centres.

London: DCLG, 2009, 33p. 978-1-4098-1304-0 Available online from:

www.communities.gov.uk

See also: **Planning**, 8/5/09, 9.

Published in Spring 2009 this document predates PPS4 and reflects concern by town centres over the impact of recession. It is intended as a quick guide to advice, support and approaches to town centres. It contains little that has not been published elsewhere. It has three main sections: 1. Realising the potential of town centres, 2. Building blocks of successful town centres and 3. Real help now for town centres. The first section outlines the key management structures such as town centre management and Business Improvement Districts along with a listing of desired roles and characteristics of centres such as safe towns and attracting tourists. The second section includes the 24 hour economy, the role of arts and culture, the role of learning and markets in the context of ensuring a diversity of uses in the town centres. The third section lists measures mainly relating to ways to facilitate temporary uses of vacant property.

Town centre

5/3

Communities and Local Government

Planning policy statement 4: Planning for sustainable economic growth.

London: TSO, 2009, 33p. Available online from: www.communities.gov.uk

The 2009 planning policy statement was published following draft publication and a consultation phase. The finalised policy statement offers guidance on town centre development as well as retail development in market towns and rural areas. It includes guidance for the development plan making stage and for the assessment of proposals which do not conform to a plan's guidelines. The sequential test remains key to the policy with the aim of strengthening the town centre first focus for development.

PPS4

5/4

Communities and Local Government

PPS4 Impact Assessment

London: Department for Communities and Local Government, 2009, 52p. Available online from: www.communities.gov.uk

The impact assessment document is published separately from the policy statement although the two were published together in the draft form. The impact assessment document provides details of how impacts should be measure in order to make decisions about development applications which do not conform to the local development plan. It replaces the previous need test.

PPS4

5/5

Communities and Local Government

**Draft planning policy statement 4: Planning for prosperous economies (PPS4):
Summary of consultation responses.**

London: Communities and Local Government, 2009, 43p. Available online from:
www.communities.gov.uk

A question by question analysis of the responses based on the questionnaire published with the draft version of PPS4.

PPS4

5/6

Communities and Local Government

Consultation paper on a new Planning Policy Statement 4; Planning for prosperous economies.

London: CLG, 2009, 119p. Available online from: www.communities.gov.uk

This is the new draft policy statement which now combines former PPS6 and PPS4 into an integrated policy. The consultation paper includes details of the proposed new impact test which would replace the former need test.

PPS4

5/7

Communities and Local Government

Government response to the House of Commons and Local Government Committee Report “Market failure? – can the traditional markets survive?”

London: The Stationery Office, 2009 (Cm 7721) 12p. 9780101772129 Available online from: www.official-documents.gov.uk/document/cm77/7721/7721.asp

The government response emphasises their commitment to consumer choice and retail diversity recognising the contributions which markets can make to this. Markets should be primarily a local responsibility and are adequately accommodated within the current legislation. Communities and Local Government are willing to act in a coordinating role across government departments.

Markets

5/8

Competition Commission

Controlled land draft order 2009.

London: Competition Commission, 2009. Available online from: www.competition-commission.org.uk/inquiries/ref2006/grocery/index.htm

See also: **Planning**, 24/7/09, 5.

Associated documents include representations from Asda, The Co-operative Group, Marks & Spencer, Morrisons, J Sainsbury, Tesco and Waitrose.

The document sets out the definitions and clauses applicable to the Controlled Land Order. The Order will apply to a set of designated large grocery retailers defined as an organisation with outlets throughout Great Britain and Northern Ireland, carrying a full range of groceries and with an integrated wholesale function dealing directly with suppliers. At present affected retailers were noted as; Asda, Cooperative Group, Marks and Spencer, Wm Morrison, J. Sainsbury, Somerfield, Tesco and Waitrose and any subsidiaries of these companies. The test will be applied using the 10 minute drivetime isochrone methodology. Where a retailer has an exclusivity agreement or a restrictive covenant within a ten minute drivetime and is taking more than 60% of market share the test is failed. A list of covenants is included in the document. Responses from retailers noted concern that regional chains were not included, questioned what comprised a full range of groceries, what throughout Great Britain and Northern Ireland meant, what applied to areas essential to the operation of the store such as car parks in different ownership and the situation regarding non-grocery subsidiaries.

Competition, Food retailing

5/9

Competition Commission

Groceries market investigation: remittal of the Competition test by the Competition Appeal tribunal. Decision.

London: Competition Commission, 2009. Available online at: www.competition-commission.org.uk/inquiries/ref2009/groceries_remittal/pdf/final_decision.pdf

See also: **Planning** 14/4/09, 1, **Planning**, 13/3/09, 3, and **Planning**, 20/3/09, 3.

A reassessment and wording of the proposed Competition Test. It outlines the background to the test and a cost benefit analysis of the test with examples from representative areas. This was then put out for consultation and comment. The basic principles will be the use of the 10 minute traveltime isochrones which will be the metric on which stores will be allowed to make further investment or not. It will apply to larger grocery retailers and be operated by the Office of Fair Trading.

Competition

5/10

Competition Commission

Provisional recommendation on the selection of drive-time software to construct 10 minute drive time isochrones.

London: Competition Commission, 2009, 18p. Available online from: www.competition-commission.org.uk/inquiries/ref2006/grocery/index.htm

The proposed competition test is designed to promote a more competitive environment within large store food retailing. To achieve this it is proposed that a retailer would not be allowed to develop a major new store within a 10 minute drive of an existing store. This requires a methodology for establishing agreed 10 minute drive time zones. This document sets out proposals to achieve this. It suggests that Experian Micromarketer MMG3 software, with Navteq's 'Navstreets' datasets be used to construct the underlying road network and establish 10 minute isochrones. This brings together an appropriate GIS based driving route system and a method of calculating drivetimes which takes account of road speed data. The document details why the proposed system has been selected from those available. Retailer responses to different systems are reviewed. The focus of their concern was the assumptions that would be fed into the software package. These included detailed entry areas, junction delays, rural vs urban drivetimes and direction of travel. Recommendations included the use of off peak travel times, annual updating of road datasets and the use of two directional drive times with either being less than 10 minutes.

Competition test, Food retailing

5/11

Findlay, A. and Sparks, L.

Retail diversity.

Farnborough; Association of Convenience Stores, 2010, 42p. Available online at: www.acs.org.uk/en/lobbying/issues/planning/

A review of how the term diversity has moved from referring to town centre diversity to retail diversity and how it has been handled in planning policy. The demands for retail diversity and the possibilities for retail diversity are discussed. The degree to which planning can deliver retail diversity are discussed and other factors involved are suggested.

Consumer choice, Retail diversity, Town centre

5/12

Grimley Eve

Planning for town centres: Practice guidance on need, impact and the sequential approach.

London: Grimley Eve, 2009, 104p. Available online at: www.communities.gov.uk

An earlier version of this document was published during 2009 and it was put out for consultation. The final version was published along with PPS4 in December 2009. It offers detailed guidelines on how to put retail planning policy into practice. There are sections on; Using evidence for positive planning, Developing town centre strategies, Supporting Evidence, The sequential test, Impact assessment and the Use of conditions.

PPS4

5/13

Guy, C.

Apples and pears,

Town and Country Planning, 78(7), 2009, 301-304. Email: Guy@cardiff.ac.uk

Guy tackles the question of how to approach evaluating the regeneration benefits of retail development. How should practitioners weigh up the various pros and cons? There is frustration amongst some (e.g. Under-served Markets project) that proposals have been rejected despite what they viewed as significant improvements in provision. The lack of any 'matrix' within which to evaluate benefits and dis-benefits remains crucial.

Regeneration

5/14

Guy, C.

One massive Tesco,

Town and Country Planning, 78(10), 2009, 404-406. Email: Guy@cardiff.ac.uk

The article begins from the concern that high streets and town centres are becoming dominated by a few large multiple retailers. It asks whether there is anything that planners can do to change this. Concepts of consumer choice and retail diversity are used in the planning literature. The terms remain undefined as if general agreement about their meaning existed. Looking to the ways the terms emerged shows that they have become part of the vocabulary although policy remains 'woolly' in respect of actually changing consumer choice or retail diversity in planning terms. Varied interpretations could result in either more bigger retailers or restricting the entry of such shops. There seems to be an expectation that something should be done to help smaller independent retailers but evidence or scope for action remain limited.

Retail diversity, Consumer choice

5/15

Guy, C.

Revival of the fittest,

Town and Country Planning, 79(1), 2010, 11-13. Email: Guy@cardiff.ac.uk

The starting point for this paper is the concern over how the independent retail sector can cope with the recessionary environment. It asks whether there is a need or good reason for the public sector to be involved in supporting the independent sector. Argument for such involvement might be the economic case in terms of employment and the development of entrepreneurship in retailing, sustainability in terms of local integration and the role such stores often play for disadvantaged groups. It is clear that however these are evaluated, all independent retailing cannot receive public support. It is suggested that planning policy should focus on the most deserving cases.

Small shops

5/16

House of Commons Communities and Local Government Committee

Need and impact: planning for town centres: Government response to the committee's tenth report of session 2008-2009.

London: The Stationery Office, 2009. Available online from: www.parliament.the-stationery-office.co.uk/pa/cm200809/cmselect/cmcomloc/1082/108201.htm

This is the Government response to the findings of the House of Commons Local Government Select Committee on planning for town centres published in July 2009. The government defends its decision on the removal of the need test which the Select Committee had opposed. It states that need remains a consideration but is not a separate pass fail test but rather part of the tests concerning adverse impact and the appropriateness of the size of the development. In respect of concerns about the subjective nature of the impact test their response was that if **any** adverse impacts can be shown this would be grounds for refusal and that it is not intended that benefits can be used to outweigh negative impacts. Other responses concerned monitoring and the capacity of planning authorities.

Impact test, Need, PPS4

5/17

House of Commons, Communities and Local Government Committee

Ninth report. Market failure? Can the traditional market survive?

London: House of Commons, 2009. Available online from: www.parliament.the-stationery-office.co.uk/pa/cm200809/cmselect/cmcomloc/308/30802.htm

See also: **Planning**, 31/7/09, 1.

The inquiry was undertaken to assess whether government could be doing more to support markets. Evidence was heard from a range of experts including managers of markets, traders and consultants. A web forum was set up to enable other participants to make contributions. A distinction was made between metropolitan markets and markets in smaller towns and centres. Messages which emerged from the inquiry were: 1. Markets do need to continually adapt to new circumstances and this needs to be recognised by local authorities and by traders and markets managers and operators, 2. Local authorities need to ensure that markets do not become marginalised in terms of location by other developments, 3. Markets are part of a challenging retail scene and increasing expertise and awareness are required, 4. Market management and promotion matters and could be enhanced by market champions who would assist in redressing negative images of markets, 5. Government responsibility for markets is too dispersed and whilst it should be primarily a local responsibility it should be catered for in planning and given the community and town centre benefits Communities and Local Government Department should ensure that policy and regulation are beneficial to markets.

Markets

5/18

Shelbourn, C.

Assessing impact: impact assessment as a factor in retail development decisions in England and the US,

Journal of Planning and Environmental Law, 8, 2009, 985-999.

The article contrasts the US Ordinance system and the UK economic impact assessment in terms of impact analysis and outcomes. Key differences in both the factors considered and also in the way that the process takes place are noted. The breadth of the US impact analysis is greater than that in the UK with a different approach to social costs. The potential outcomes are different too with the US ordinance system offering a greater variety of outcomes than the pass/fail UK system.

Impact test, US

5/19

Wrigley, N., Branson, J, Murdock, A. and Clarke, G.

Extending the Competition Commission's findings on entry and exit of small stores in British high streets: implications for competition and planning policy,

Environment and Planning A, 41(9), 2009, 2063-2085.

This article looks at regional patterns of retail change as a response to the findings of the Competition Commission. It traces the decline of certain types of independent businesses with the spread of large retail spaces. It then attributes the differences between for example the South East of the country and other areas to differentials in wealth and prosperity using an index established by ONS based on 2001 census data.

Competition, Small shops

CONSUMER CULTURE

6/1

Beaulac, J., Kristjansson, E. and Cummins, S.

A systematic review of food deserts, 1966-2007,

Preventing Chronic Disease, 6(3), 2009, 1-9. Email: j.beaulac@hsc.mb.ca

A literature review of material on food deserts is assessed to understand whether there is evidence that food deserts exist. Literatures from the UK, Canada, US, Australia and New Zealand are considered. Geographic and market based approaches were included. Differential access to affordable and healthy food in socio-economic advantaged and disadvantaged areas which might be defined as a food was a concept which was supported by evidence only in the US. Here income and race differences were associated with differential access to food. The reference list is useful in extending the literature base.

Food desert

6/2

Ellaway, A., Macdonald, L., Forsyth, A. and Macintyre, S.

The socio-spatial distribution of alcohol outlets in Glasgow city,

Health and Place, 16, 2010, 167-172.

As attempts are made to reduce alcohol consumption for health reasons, interest in alcohol retail outlets is one area which is being considered. It was hypothesised that there would be an association between deprivation and the distribution of alcohol outlets which might go some way to explaining the patterns of alcohol related health issue in Glasgow. Although there was some correspondence, areas with significant alcohol issues were not areas with particularly high densities of outlets. Historic retail and licensing patterns appear to influence the distribution of outlets.

Food retailing

6/3

Everts, J. and Jackson, P.

Modernisation and the practices of contemporary food shopping,

Environment and Planning D, 27(5), 2009, 917-935.

A study of how place specific shopping practices emerge. A distinction is made between choices and the social accomplishment of shopping. Differences are shown to be more than traditional and modern, involving for example trust relationships of different sorts. In thinking about retail diversity the paper highlights the fact that diversity involves unseen aspects of the shopping process and also that the term choice can be misleading.

Consumer choice

6/4

Jones, P., Comfort, D. and Hillier, D.

Sustainable consumption and retailing,

Town and Country Planning, 78(7), 2009, 328-330. Email: pjones@glo.ac.uk

It is recognised that retailers are influential in promoting sustainability. A key point from the article is the distinction between retailer actions on sustainability as they impact on a retailer's own operations and the ways in which retailers communicate ideas about sustainability to customers. Many retailers still believe that it is possible to encourage greater consumption and grow their business whilst still remaining green. As a result they decouple sustainability and consumption focusing on sustainability measures such as better waste management and reduced packaging.

Sustainability

6/5

Jones, P., Comfort, D. And Hilier, D.

Towards sustainable food retailing,

Town and Country Planning, 78(5), 2009, 237-241. Email: pjones@glo.ac.uk

A discussion of the incompatibility of the ecological understanding of green issues and the societal consumption practices. Reconciling the desires for economic growth, retailer ambitions and consumption desires is necessary if sustainability is to be a reality. The discussion relates to the 2008 Sustainable Development Commission Report 'Green, healthy and Fair'.

Sustainability

6/6

Mansvelt, J.

Geographies of consumption: the unmanageable consumer,

Progress in Human Geography, 33(2), 2009, 264-274.

Theories of change have designated certain types of shopping as residual and extraneous to contemporary cultures of shopping. At any one time varied consumption practices co-exist with consumer groups differentially able to engage with different consumption practices. Shopping should be seen as a social accomplishment rather than the exercise of sovereign choices.

Consumer choice, Shopping patterns

6/7

Meneely, L., Burns, A. and Strugnell, C.

Age associated changes in older consumers retail behaviour,

International Journal of Retail and Distribution Management, 37(12), 2009, 1041-1056.

Email: meneely-1@email.ulster.ac.uk

The core findings of the paper are that there is a transition as consumers grow older from shopping in large multiple retailers to shopping in smaller stores and from shopping further from home to shopping closer to home. The disaggregation of the retired consumers into age groups (60-64, 65-69, 70-74, 75-79, 80+) offers insights into changing behaviours by age cohort. The article does not disentangle the relative importance of accessibility and retail format. The findings are of importance in planning for retail provision for ageing populations.

Consumer groups, Food retailing

6/8

Reutterer, T. And Teller, C.

Store format choice and shopping trips,

International Journal of Retail and Distribution Management, 37(8), 2009, 695-710.

Email: christoph.teller@stir.ac.uk

A choice model is developed using multinomial logit modelling to study the way customers choose between stores for different types of grocery trips. The results indicate that utility values are higher for large scale retail formats for making a major grocery trip and inversely that they are higher for small-scale stores for a fill in trip. Merchandise related attributes are of lesser importance although again they vary with the type of trip. The article is fairly technical and emphasises the benefits of the model over alternative models referring particularly to the ways it deals with incomplete knowledge sets on the part of consumers.

Consumer choice, Food retailing

URBAN ENVIRONMENT

7/1

Bloomfield, J.

Birmingham's Christmas market: innovative urban policy in action,

Local Economy, 25(1), 2010, 74-80. Email: j.bloomfield@bham.ac.uk

A description of how the idea for the Birmingham Frankfurt Christmas market was developed to become a significant feature of Birmingham city centre adding vitality and vibrance. The discussion of the various difficulties encountered and why they occurred bring a sense of pragmatism to the article. Two key themes emerge. The first is the role of the market in 'humanising' and animating the city to give it a lived in feel. The second is the importance of moving towards examples of Europeanisation rather than Americanisation in developing UK towns and cities.

Birmingham, Markets, Town centre

7/2

Coca-Stefaniak, J., Parker, C., Quin, S., Rinaldi, R. and Byrom, J.

Town centre management models: A European perspective,

Cities, 26(2), 2009, 74-80. Email: simon.quin@atcm.org

Warnaby developed a matrix for town centre management along two axes – public/private funding and formal/informal. A short introduction to the thinking behind town centre management across Europe opens the article. A number of case studies from Europe are detailed and placed within this matrix. It is suggested that there are different routes to town centre management and that for the future increased emphasis should be directed towards place management. The examples are from Spain, Italy, England and France.

France, Italy, Place management, Spain, Town centre management

7/3

Cook, I.

Private sector involvement in urban governance; the case of Business Improvement Districts and Town Centre Management in England,

Geoforum, 46(5), 2009, 930-940.

Cook is interested in how and why the private sector became involved in business improvement districts which require them to pay additional taxes and give time on an unpaid basis. He concludes that they view BIDs as a way of increasing profits and that this is their primary motive. He discusses the implications of the transition from town centre management to BIDs and the consequences of the voting system and the nature of the business participation. Three worked examples are included. Comments on inclusion and exclusion in urban governance show a much greater degree of unevenness than is often claimed.

BIDs

7/4

Guy, C.

Closing sale – everything must go,

Town and Country Planning, 78(4), 2009, 157-159. Email: Guy@cardiff.ac.uk

A piece which describes the impact of pre-pack administration on high street vacancies. The use of administration as a means of closing unprofitable stores leaves property owners and shopping centre managers with unexpected vacant property and no means of reclaiming outstanding rental. The use of pre-packs reflects a recognition that property owner/retailer relationships need to change and that the market needs to become more flexible to accommodate changing economic circumstances and fluctuations in trading performance.

Property

7/5

London First Retail Commission

Reinvigorating the high street: encouraging retail diversity and supporting town centres in London.

London: London First, 2009.

Despite the title the focus of this report is not on types of retailers but rather on the health and mix of town centre functions. It takes ideas from BRC's **21st Century High Streets** and considers them in the context of London. The report draws on case studies and the outcomes of seminars and interviews. It has a practical orientation. There is a list of key recommendations which mainly relate to making the town environment more vibrant and attractive. It is organised under the headings: Understand centres, Manage centres, Plan for long term health and Market centres.

Town centre, Place marketing

7/6

McLeod, D.

Scottish theme towns: have new identities enhanced development?,

Journal of Tourism and Cultural Change, 7(3), 2009, 133-145

This article considers how successful themed towns have been in regenerating towns in Dumfries and Galloway. Wigtown book town, Kirkcudbright Artist's Town, Castle Douglas Food Town are all considered in terms of how the themed approach came to be, its economic impact and integration with the town. The social capital aspects of the themed town approach are discussed.

Castle Douglas, Kirkcudbright, Place marketing, Wigtown

7/7

Peel, D., Lloyd, G. and Lord, A.

Business Improvement districts in the discourse of contractualism,
European Planning Studies, 12(3), 2009, 401-422.

Business Improvement Districts are ostensibly engaged with improving the urban environment but underlying this they are also changing the way that urban governance works. BIDs are used in this study to illustrate the importance of the contractual basis of BIDs in that process.

BIDs

7/8

Riviezzo, A., de Nisco, A. and Napolitano, M.

Importance-performance analysis as a tool in evaluating town centre management effectiveness,

International Journal of Retail and Distribution Management, 37(9), 2009, 748-764.

Email: ariviezz@unisannio.it

The case study in this paper is from Italy but the discussion is focussed primarily on UK based literature and the key points relate to methodologies for evaluating town centre management rather than the case study findings. It is suggested that while traditional ATCM based key performance indicators are important they are only partial and favour the large stakeholder interests. Town centre perception data is used in the context of Importance Performance Analysis with a matrix of the shared views being established. This identifies the areas requiring more attention and less attention, areas where performance is good and areas where it is poor.

Town centre management

7/9

Teale, M.

Shop vacancies,

UK Retail Property Viewpoint, April, 2009, 5p.

This paper provides a framework for a better understanding of retail vacancy in the context of recession. It gives details of how vacancy might be expected to affect town centres.

Vacancy

7/10

Warnaby, G.

Managing the urban consumption experience,

Local Economy, 24(2), 2009, 105-110. Email: gary.warnaby@liv.ac.uk

Warnaby counterpoises the trend towards managing the urban environment through town centre management and BIDs and the dangers that territoriality may develop. The importance of the consumer experience is explored with reference to servuction theory. The article considers how tensions between the managed environment and the consumer experience will impact on the way urban management goes forward.

BIDs

7/11

Watson, S.

The magic of the marketplace: sociality in a neglected public space,

Urban Studies, 46(8), 2009, 1577-1591.

Sophie Watson gave evidence to the Communities and Local Government inquiry **Market failure? – can the traditional markets survive?**. This article gives details of the research on which her comments were made. It is a study of how markets function as social public spaces within cities and towns. Surveys of 8 markets including markets in small towns, bigger centres and London and different types of markets were used. Interviews with traders, shoppers and market professionals are used in the study alongside observational data. The role of markets in different types of sociality such as rubbing along, social inclusion, theatre and performance and mediating difference are considered to be attributes which markets offer that modern retail formats may not do. These add to the contribution markets can make to a sense of town identity.

Markets

7/12

Wrigley, N., Lambiri, D. and Cudworth, K.

Linked trips and town centre viability,

Town and Country Planning, 78(10), 2009, 432-438.

There has been an assumption that in market towns the existence of a large foodstore will result in more linked trips but this has assumption is not evidence based. The article reports on a case study of the relocation of a Tesco store in Shepton Mallet to an edge of centre site. The new store led to some realignment of the town centre drawing it in the direction of the new edge of centres tore. Those able to walk to the store did engage in more linked trips. The new store resulted in some changes within the town centre but did not result in any decline in the town centre. Overall linked trips were greater for the edge of centre store than they had been for the out of centre store. On a positive note the perception of the town centre improved and some clawback of trade took place.

Market towns, Linked trips, Town centre

A SELECTION OF LITERATURE RELATING TO RETAIL PLANNING IN USA AND EUROPE

8/1

Anderson, E., Chalrapani, C. and Hernandez, T.

Marketing the downtown through geographically enhanced consumer segmentation, **Journal of Place Management and Development**, 2(2), 2009, 125-139.

Marketing of places is part of the role of a Business Improvement District. In this study the authors examine a downtown BID area in Toronto. They are interested in whether within the BID there are areas which appeal to different segments of the consumer market. They find that this is not so but that different aspects of the area do appeal to different consumers. They suggest that there is therefore a need for segmented marketing but that this is not place specific within the BID.

BIDs, Toronto

8/2

Castillo-Manzano, J. and Lopez-Valpuesta, L.

Urban retail fabric and the metro: a complex relationship. Lessons from middle-sized Spanish cities,

Cities, 26(3), 2009, 141-147. Email: jignacio@us.es

What impact does a new transportation system have on retail structure in a town centre? This study uses survey work in Seville in Spain to analyse the impact of the new Metro system on the retailers close to the new stations. During construction work trade was lost and extended works were a negative factor for retailers. After the new transportation system opened shoppers did switch from suburban malls to the town centre. Although now small independent town centre shops had become more accessible, property values were also increasing at these locations and some were forced out of the market being replaced by multiple retailers.

Spain, Travel

8/3

Coca-Stefaniak, J.

Urban revitalisation and town centre management in Poland: opportunities for the 21st century,

Journal of Urban Regeneration and Renewal, 2(3), 2009. Email: a.coca@lcc.arts.ac.uk

Good practice is not a sufficient to understand what town centre management can achieve or how it should operate in different socio-political and historically specific environments. The concept must be locally embedded to be operational. The case of Poland is used to show how changes in undersatnding town centre revitalisation have taken place with an increasing emphasis on a more pro-active approach engaging private stakeholders. However the legacy of state involvement still impinges on attitudes to the ways in which town centre management and particularly public private partnership is viewed.

Poland, Town centre management

8/4

Daunfeldt, S., Rudholm, N. And Ramme, U., ?

Congestion charges and retail revenues; results from the Stockholm road pricing trial,
Transport Research; Part A Policy and Practice, 43(3), 2009, 306-309. Email: sod@hig.se

The study looked at impacts on 14 malls and store. The pricing trial did not seem to adversely affect trade at the malls in the pricing zone.

Town centre, Road pricing, Transport

8/5

Padilla, C. and Eastlick, M. A.

Exploring urban retailing and CBD revitalization strategies,
International Journal of Retail and Distribution Management, 37(1), 2009, 7-23.

A key theme in this paper is the link between diversification of the town centre and the retail vitality of the town. The survey work reported is from the US. In the US experience it is retailing which has been missed out of the diversity of uses in the town centre.

Town centre

8/6

Porta, S., Latora, V., Wang, F., Strano, E., Cardillo, A., Scellato, S., Iacoviello, V. and Messori, R.

Street continuity and densities of retail and services in Bologna, Italy,
Environment and Planning D, 26(3), 2009, 450-465. Email: s.porta@humanspacelab.com

The thesis of the paper is that centrality captures the essence of location advantage in an urban area. A multiple centrality assessment model is used along with a kernel density estimation to assess the correlation between centrality and retail and service locations. Data are from Bologna but the findings are of wider relevance in thinking about how town centres work and the optimisation of retail locations within defined city and town centres. The centrality models define the areas where retailing is most likely to prosper. The use of street centrality as a property of the city can be used in planning developments or assessing the impact of developments on existing retail structures.

Bologna, Italy, Urban design

8/7

Reimers, V. and Clulow, V.

Retail centres: it's time to make them convenient,

International Journal of Retail and Distribution Management, 37(7), 2009, 541-562.

This is an Australian study. However it serves to remind researchers that whilst many aspects of shopping behaviour and retail centre choice have been studied and emphasised time convenience remains a priority with shoppers which is more important than other factors regardless of other socio-demographic variables. This should be a priority in planning retail development.

Australia, Consumer choice, Shopping patterns

8/8

Weltverden, J. And Van Rietbergen, T.

The implications of e-shopping for in-store shopping at various locations in the Netherlands,

Environment and Planning B, 36(2), 2009, 279-299. Email: jweltverden@gmail.com

A study of how shopping has impacted on differentially on various types of shopping locations and environments. A survey of 3000 e-shoppers was conducted to investigate the extent to which shopping is substituted for instore shopping among different locations. City centres were the shopping locations which were most adversely affected followed by district hopping centres. Local village shopping was not affected.

E-retailing

PRACTITIONER LITERATURE

The 2009 listing of practitioner literature has grouped items on PPS4 together. Other items are listed separately.

PPS4

9/1

DCLG rejects PPS4 critique,
Planning, 4/09/09, 3.

The response of the Communities and Local Government department to the critique of PPS4 defending their intention to remove the need test and introduce a new impact test.

9/2

Daubney, K.
Barker gives nod to town centres draft,
Planning, 15/5/09, 3.

Kate Barker responds to the draft of PPS4. She regards it as clear and cogent and adequate to ensure the vibrancy of town centres.

9/3

Gillman, S.
Retailer test prompts policy call,
Planning, 9/10/09, 4.

Retailers urge the publication of PPS4 without waiting for the final outcome of the Competition Commission. Key arguments are the need for confidence and the delays caused by the lack of new guidance.

9/4

Smulian, M.
Planners outraged by retail test snub,
Planning, 20/11/09, 2.

The Royal Town Planning Institute still believes that the decision to end the needs test is a mistake. The Communities and Local Government Department argued that the needs test restricts competition and consumer choice. PPS4 believes the sequential test will be enough to ensure appropriate development.

9/5

Wilding, M.

Retail policy brings resources warning,
Planning, 8/1/10, 1.

A number of concerns are expressed following the publication of PPS4 in December 2009. There is concern that the new policy will involve extra resourcing which has not been made available. There is also a feeling that it may lead to planning by appeal. Overall retailers are probably happier with it than planners.

9/6

Wilding, M.

Retail impact test sparks appeal worry,
Planning, 10/7/09, 3.

The draft version of PPS4 and the impact test raised concerns that the number of appeals would increase and that the policy might result in planning by appeal.

9/7

Wilding, M.

Retail test reaction reveals major split,
Planning, 31/7/09, 1.

A review of the pros and cons of the need test and the responses to the proposed removal of the test.

Other Practitioner References

9/8

Asda reviews Savill's row,
Planning 8/1/01, 1.

Savill's and Asda differ in their view of the proposed competition test with Asda in favour and Savill's considering the proposal disproportionate.

Competition

9/9

Retail parks take steps to escape goods restrictions,
Planning, 23/10/09, 5.

The use of local reviews to make changes to goods restrictions in retail parks. For example where a later development is unrestricted this may be used as an argument for a local review to lift pre-existing restrictions. The local review can signal the opening of a new chapter for a retail park.

Retail parks

9/10

Small shops' hopes raised,
Planning, 23/10/09, 5.

The London Assembly is reported to be looking into ways in which the interests of small shops can be served to reduce small shop closures.

Small shops

9/11

Boddy, R.
Stores push growth role policy,
Planning, 20/11/09, 7.

Retailers in Scotland are calling for greater recognition of the economic role of retailing.

Scotland

9/12

Collins, J.
Retail recovery mentor,
Planning, 6/11/09, 13.

The proposed community development levy is ill afforded in a time of recession and could deter valuable development. Changes to public/private sector cooperation and ways of achieving change need to be reconsidered.

Recession

9/13

Daubney, K.
Ease of control order,
Planning, 24/4/09, 10.

Measures to reduce the impact of recession are noted including standard interim leases and planning application waivers. The impact is thought to be small-scale and benefits are perceived as limited.

Property

9/14

Easton, J.

Retail order raises issues for town centres priority,
Planning, 24/7/09.

The implications of the **Controlled land draft** order published by the Competition Commission for the town centre first based planning policy are considered. The limiting of exclusivity agreement could remove incentives to entice retailers to town centres will be reduced, planning will become more onerous and certain types of town centre retail investment may become less attractive to retailers.

Competition, PPS4

9/15

Gillman, S.

West Midlands pilots for standard for better healthy food access,
Planning, 18/09/09, 5.

New standards are being put in place to ensure that urban housing developments have a adequate access to healthy foods. An accessibility measure is being established.

Diet

9/16

Harris, D.

In their prime,
Estates Gazette Retail, Nov 2009, 36-39.

The sites which survive recession best are the prime sites. The future of secondary sites is much less certain and it seems that shrinkage may be required in such areas.

Recession, Vacancy

9/17

Kivlehan, N.

Independently minded,
Estates Gazette Retail, Nov 2009, 32-35.

The article considers ways of reinvigorating the independent sector. It is suggested that changes to the rating system may be desirable.

Property, Recession, Vacancy

9/18

Kivlehan, N.

When the lights go out,

Estates Gazette Retail, Feb 2009, 28-31.

Shopping malls are affected by recession. As a result ways of ensuring that they remain viable are important. Suggested measures include adapting leases and rents to the recessionary environment with a more flexible approach.

Property, Recession

9/19

Kochan, B.

Market upturn,

Planning, 31/7/09, 14-15.

Markets tick many boxes in terms of town centre vitality. There is pressure to improve their status in terms of how they are viewed by planners.

Markets

9/20

Kochan, B.

Crunch hits the streets,

Planning, 10/7/09, 15.

The article notes that in practice not enough is known about the outcomes of different initiatives to have confidence in making recommendations about which initiatives will deliver desired outcomes. As an illustration contradictory outcomes from bringing a major retailer into a town centre are cited with examples both of the retailer acting as a stimulus and of the retailer resulting in closure of other businesses. It is important to understand better why such outcomes differ in terms of processes at work.

Town centre

9/21

McClary, S.

High rivalry,

Estates Gazette Retail, Feb 2009, 38040.

Are factory outlets recession proof? On the one hand there could be a threat to factory outlet centres by widespread discounting practices or alternately the practice of discounting could encourage greater patronage of factory outlet centres as consumers grow used to getting goods at discounted prices.

Factory outlet centres

9/22

McClary, S.

Rising again,

Estates Gazette Retail, April 2009, 24-26.

It is suggested that some of the rental and lease practices emerging during the current recession may gain more common practice for the future as retailers are demanding greater flexibility in response to changes in trading conditions. Many consider any scheme is better than allowing a property to remain vacant.

Property, Recession, Vacancy

9/23

Pullin, A.

Essex store leaflet deemed misleading,

Planning, 4/9/09, 5.

The way that retailers use survey data to indicate demand for a particular store has come under scrutiny following a case in Essex. Demand can be construed in many ways and store publicity can skew responses.

Data

9/24

Scotland, M

Flying the flag for food,

Planning, 11/12/09, 13.

Town centres need to be something more than a shopping destination if they are to work.

Town centres

9/25

Shiel, V.

Response throws up town centre issues,

Planning, 13/2/09, 3.

The article asks whether there is a case for greater support for small shops. The effect of the new impact test on small shops is questioned.

Small shops

9/26

Shiel, V.

High street funding faces industry flak,
Planning, 21/8/09,5.

Objections were made to the allocation of the money for high streets to deprived areas rather than to areas with high vacancy rates.

Vacancy

9/27

Thame, D.

Being square can bring success,
Estates Gazette Retail, April 2009, 20-23.

The uses which square may once have had are gone. New uses of squares need to be found if they are to be a valuable part of the townscape. Squares need to have a function rather than just act as pedestrianised spaces.

Urban environment

9/28

Wehner, P.

Fall of a retail darling
Estates Gazette Retail, Feb 2009, 12-15.

Consideration of how to ensure that town centres are kept alive and that they remain relevant shopping locations to modern consumers.

Town centre

9/29

Wilding, M.

Levy looks to flexibility,
Planning, 2/10/09, 8

See also **Planning** 25/09/09, 9 and **Planning**, 18/9/09, 1.

Draft regulations for the Community Infrastructure Levy have been published. Concern has been expressed that aspects of these such as the charging schedules and the lack of flexibility may discourage development.

Community Infrastructure Levy